## Table of Contents

**Foreword**  
xxvii  

**Introduction**  
xxix  

**Afterword**  
xxiii  

### Part One  
**Tax Treaties: General Issues**

#### The Use of OEEC-OECD Historical Documents in Interpreting Tax Treaties  
*David A. Ward, QC*

1. Availability of historical documents  
2. Use of these materials under international law  
3. The value of these historical materials, a Canadian case study  

#### A Systems-Based Approach to Tax Treaties  
*Henri Torrione*

1. Introduction  
2. Systems theory and tax treaties  
3. The Partnership Report and the systems-based approach  
4. The two processes  
   4.1. The Chapters 1/3 process  
   4.2. The Chapters 3/5 process  
5. Processes with reflexive relationships  
   5.1. Role-taking  
   5.2. Perspective  
6. Conclusion: Interpretation of the tax treaties under Art. 31 of the Vienna Convention and systems-based approach  

#### Temporal Aspects of Tax Treaties  
*Jacques Sasseville*

1. Introduction  
2. References to domestic law: Ambulatory versus static approach  

Table of Contents

3. Subsequent changes to the Commentary of the OECD Model Convention 44
4. Timing issues related to residence 48
5. At what time do the allocation rules of the treaty apply? 53
6. Entry into force of tax treaties 55
7. Conclusion 61

Double Taxation Conventions and Human Rights
*Philip Baker QC*

1. Cases on double taxation conventions before the ECnHR and ECtHR 64
2. Application to double taxation conventions of the ECHR and ICCPR 66
3. Right to a fair trial and competent authority proceedings 67
4. Double taxation conventions and the right to privacy 69
5. Non-discrimination 72
6. The right to property and double taxation conventions 73
7. Right to leave a country 75
8. Concluding comments 75

Part Two
Tax Treaties: Specific Issues

**The Concept of Dependence in the Definition of a Permanent Establishment**
*Jean Pierre Le Gall*

1. Conditions of dependence 80
   1.1. The scope of dependence 81
      1.1.1. Civil law countries 81
         1.1.1.1. Non-tax matters 81
         1.1.1.2. Tax matters 82
      1.1.2. Common law countries 83
         1.1.2.1. Non-tax matters 83
         1.1.2.2. Tax matters 84
      1.1.3. Conclusion 84
   1.2. Tests of dependence 85
      1.2.1. The courts’ position 85
      1.2.2. The position of the OECD 86
      1.2.3. Conclusion 87
Table of Contents

2. Consequences of dependence 87
   2.1. Does the dominant entity acquire a permanent establishment in the state in which the dependent entity is situated? 87
      2.1.1. Classic difficulties 88
      2.1.2. Specific difficulties 90
         2.1.2.1. In space 90
         2.1.2.2. In time 91
   2.2. The consequences of the recognition of a permanent establishment of a dominant entity in the dependent entity’s state 92
      2.2.1. Is the dependent entity the permanent establishment of the dominant entity or do its activities create a permanent establishment of the dominant entity itself? 92
      2.2.2. Does the creation of a permanent establishment as a consequence of the dependence of an entity result in extra taxation on the dominant entity in the country of the dependent entity? 93

Contract Conclusion and Agency Permanent Establishments: Here, There, and Everywhere?
Carol A. Dunahoo

1. Current Model treaty provisions 97
2. Discussion 101
3. Conclusions and recommendations 106

The Application of the OECD Permanent Establishment Concept to Electronic Commerce
Daniel Lüthi

1. Introduction 109
2. The OECD concept of permanent establishment 110
   2.1. General 110
   2.2. Use of websites and servers 110
   2.3. Agency permanent establishment 112
3. Evaluation of Art. 5 of the Model 112
### Table of Contents

3.1. Neutrality ........................................ 112  
3.2. Efficiency ......................................... 112  
3.3. Certainty and simplicity ....................... 113  
3.4. Effectiveness and fairness .................... 113  
4. Alternative solutions to the current rules ...... 113  
4.1. Solutions not resulting in basic changes ...... 114  
4.1.1. Interpretation of the term “fixed” in Art. 5(1) 114  
4.1.2. Business functions without human intervention 114  
4.1.3. A server does not constitute a permanent establishment 115  
4.1.4. Functions attributable to software constitute preparatory or auxiliary activities 116  
4.1.5. Removal of the exceptions in Art. 5(4) of the Model (preparatory and auxiliary activities) 117  
4.1.6. Force-of-attraction rule for e-commerce activities 118  
4.1.7. Insertion of new rules on the taxation of services 119  
4.2. Solutions necessitating a basic change of the current rules 120  
4.2.1. Deduction of a withholding tax on certain payments from e-commerce 120  
4.2.2. Profit-split based on certain factors 121  
4.2.3. Establishment of a virtual permanent establishment 121  
5. Final remarks ...................................... 122

**New Sources of Tax Revenue for Transit Countries: Can a (Rail) Road Qualify as a Permanent Establishment?**  
*Kees van Raad*

**Defining the Term “Business” for Purposes of Tax Treaties**  
*Brian J. Arnold*

1. Introduction ........................................ 131  
2. The scheme for the taxation of business profits under tax treaties and the role of the concept of business 133  
3. The meaning of the term “business” in the OECD Model 136
# Table of Contents

4. Problems 138  
5. Definitions in the other distributive articles of the OECD Model 144  
6. A suggested definition of the term “business” for purposes of the OECD and UN Models 146  
7. Conclusion 152  

**Divergence of Third Party Pricing from Arm’s Length Results**  
*Peter H. Blessing*  

1. Relevance of passive association to intercompany financing transactions 154  
   1.1. Hypothetical and background 154  
   1.2. Passive association 155  
   1.3. Relevance for intra-group guarantees and loans 157  
   1.4. General Electric Capital Canada case 158  
   1.5. ATO draft ruling 161  
   1.6. Compensation for implicit support 162  
2. Relevance of bargaining power to intercompany transactions 168  
   2.1. Hypothetical and background 168  
   2.2. *DSG Retail* case 170  
   2.3. The scope of bargaining power as a factor 171  
3. Accounting for equity-based compensation in cost-sharing arrangements 174  
   3.1. Hypothetical and background 174  
   3.2. *Xilinx* case 174  
   3.3. Matching expense and the income to which it relates 179  
4. Conclusions 184  

**Beneficial Ownership in Tax Treaties: Judicial Interpretation and the Case for Clarity**  
*Jinyan Li*  

1. Introduction 187  
2. Difficulties in interpreting beneficial owner 188  
   2.1. Unique treaty concept 189  
   2.2. Divergent legal traditions 189  
   2.3. Controversy over treaty shopping 190  
   2.4. Ill-defined bargain between treaty partners 192  
3. Judicial interpretation 192
3.1. The leading cases 192
  3.1.1. Indofood 192
  3.1.2. Bank of Scotland 194
  3.1.3. Real Madrid 195
  3.1.4. Prévost 195
3.2. Basic interpretive questions 198
  3.2.1. Domestic law meaning or international meaning? 198
  3.2.2. How to find an international meaning? 199
  3.2.3. Legal or practical determination? 199
  3.2.4. Anti-avoidance or basic rule? 201
  3.2.5. Relevance of later Commentary? 202
3.3. Unsettling implications 203
4. Case for clarity through revising the OECD Commentary 206
  4.1. To clarify judicial interpretation 206
  4.2. To provide more certainty 207
  4.3. To provide a practical solution 207

Japan’s Foreign Subsidiaries’ Dividends Exclusion
Toshio Miyatake

1. Introduction 211
2. Foreign subsidiaries’ dividends exclusion 215
  2.1. Qualified person 215
  2.2. Qualifying dividends 216
  2.3. Qualifying amount 217
  2.4. Foreign withholding tax 217
  2.5. Tax consequences 217
  2.6. Procedural requirements 217
3. Legislative purposes 218
4. Influence on other tax regimes 222
  4.1. Indirect foreign tax credit 222
  4.2. Specified foreign subsidiaries 222
5. Remaining issues 223
  5.1. Portfolio dividends 223
  5.2. Foreign branch 223
  5.3. Anti-abuse 224
6. Certain theoretical problems 224
  6.1. Territorial tax system 224
  6.2. Capital export neutrality 225
7. The future 225
Table of Contents

Exit Taxes on Substantial Shareholdings and Pension Claims: The Dutch Supreme Court’s Interpretation of Arts. 13, 15 and 18 of the OECD Model
Luc De Broe, Katrien Willoqué

1. The substantial-shareholding cases of 20 February 2009: No infringement of Art. 13(5) of the Model 228
2. The pension-claim cases of 19 June 2009: Infringement of Art. 18 of the Model 231
3. Two similar types of exit taxes, but a different outcome 233
4. Why do the cases produce a different outcome?
4.1. The role of Art. 3(2) of the Model 235
4.2. The differences according to the AG 236
4.2.1. Differences in legislative technique 236
4.2.2. Difference in treaty text and treaty context 239
4.2.3. Arguments derived from similar cases 242
5. Some observations 243

Tax Treaty Override – Swedish Developments
Bertil Wiman

1. Introduction 249
2. Applicable law 249
3. RÅ 2008 ref. 24 – Swiss insurance subsidiaries and the CFC rules 251
4. Heavy debate and criticism 252
5. New chances for the Court – the trailing tax 253

Does Art. 20 of the OECD Model Convention Really Fit into Tax Treaties?
Michael Lang

1. Is Art. 20 OECD Model Convention an allocation rule? 257
2. Payments 258
3. Absence of an explicit priority rule 259
4. Interaction with Art. 1 of the OECD Model 261
5. Legal consequences in the state of residence 262
6. Double non-taxation as a result of the application of Art. 20 of the OECD Model 264
7. Interaction with Art. 21 of the OECD Model 265
8. Conclusions 267
Exemption and Tax Credit in German Tax Treaties –
Policy and Reality

*Jürgen Lüdicke*

1. Introduction 269
2. Tax credit method in domestic law and german tax treaties 271
   2.1. Tax credit method in domestic law 271
   2.2. Tax credit method in German tax treaties 272
      2.2.1. Initial comments 272
      2.2.2. Dividends, interest and royalties 273
      2.2.3. Other income only subject to limited taxation in source state (directors’ fees, artistes’ and sportsmen’s income) 274
      2.2.4. Gains from alienation of shares deriving their value predominantly from immovable property 275
      2.2.5. International hiring-out of labour 275
      2.2.6. Passive business income 276
3. Exemption method in domestic law and German tax treaties 276
   3.1. No exemption method in domestic tax law 276
   3.2. Exemption method as the standard method in German tax treaties 277
      3.2.1. Some historical observations 277
      3.2.2. Long-standing policy 279
      3.2.3. Tax policy reasons 279
         3.2.3.1. General considerations 279
         3.2.3.2. Negotiating position 280
         3.2.3.3. Issue of tax planning 281
         3.2.3.4. Practicability 282
      3.2.4. Activity clauses for business income and the participation exemption 284
4. Treaty policy concerning restrictions of the exemption method 288
   4.1. Introductory remarks 288
   4.2. Restrictive interpretation of obligation to exempt items of income and Art. 23A(4) of the OECD Model 288
      4.2.1. New OECD approach after the Partnership Report 288
      4.2.2. Treaty policy: Switchover clauses 290
   4.3. Subject-to-tax clauses in German tax treaties 292
Table of Contents

4.4. General switchover to credit method on diplomatic notification 293
4.5. Domestic treaty override provisions regarding treaty exemption 294
5. Conclusions 296

Recent Treaty Developments in the Arbitration of International Tax Disputes
Hugh Ault

1. Introduction 297
2. The road to arbitration 298
3. The nature of the OECD arbitration process 301
3.1. Arbitration limited to unresolved mutual agreement procedure issues 301
3.2. Procedural aspects 304
3.2.1. The request for arbitration to resolve the issues preventing the competent authorities from reaching an agreement 304
3.2.2. Establishing the Terms of Reference 304
3.2.3. Selection of arbitrators 305
3.2.4. Taxpayer participation 305
3.2.5. The arbitral decision 306
3.2.6. Timing issues 306
3.2.7. A streamlined process 307
3.2.8. Implementation of the arbitral decision 307
4. Recent developments 307

Part Three
Miscellaneous Topics

The Exercise of Legislative Taxing Powers in Occupied Territories
Guglielmo Maisto

1. Introduction 315
2. The provisions of the Hague Convention dealing with tax matters 316
3. The general constraints to the exercise of legislative power under Art. 43 of the Hague Regulations 317
### Table of Contents

4. Review of the compatibility of tax provisions enacted by the occupant with Art. 43 of the Hague Regulations 319  
   4.1. Ordinary revision of tax rules 319  
   4.2. Changes to the structure of the tax system: The example of moving from the worldwide to the territorial principle and vice versa 320  
   4.3. Abolition of taxes 320  
   4.4. Suspension of taxes 321  
   4.5. Violations of general principles of law 322  
   4.6. Tax holidays 322  
   4.7. Modernization of the tax system 323  
   4.8. Implementation of international recommendations 323  
   4.9. Anti-avoidance rules 323  
   4.10. Double taxation agreements 324  
   4.11. Tax changes adopted in the occupying state 324  
5. The legal justification for the introduction of new taxes: Necessary measure under Art. 43 or “contribution” under Art. 49 of the Hague Regulations? 325  
6. Application of the rules of the occupied territory to citizens of the occupant state 329  
   6.1. The exemption from tax granted to occupying forces 329  
   6.2. Taxation of the occupying state’s citizens who are not engaged in activities related to the occupation 330  
7. The taxation of the citizens of the occupied territory who are resident abroad 330  
8. The power to collect existing taxes under Art. 48 331  
   8.1. Amendments to collection rules 332  
   8.2. Limitations to the rights of the occupying state to replace the legitimate authority for the purposes of tax collection 333  
9. Conclusion 334

---

**Tax Law: Rules or Principles – Madness or Genius? Mind the Gaps!**  
*Angelo Nikolakakis*

1. Introduction 337  
2. The relationship between rules, principles and fiscal outcomes 339  
3. Why the system is not broken even if it does not always work 344  
4. Legitimate tax avoidance 356  
5. Conclusions 358
Can Member States Survive EU Taxation? Can the European Union Survive National Taxation?
Frans Vanistendael

1. Introduction 363
2. The main goals of the European Union and their requirements 364
3. Instruments to achieve the treaty objectives in taxation 365
   3.1. Legal instruments 365
   3.2. Economic instruments 366
4. Results of legal fiscal integration 367
   4.1. Income tax 367
   4.2. Indirect taxation 369
5. Results of economic fiscal integration 370
   5.1. The EU tail cannot wag the national dog 370
   5.2. Some degree of statistical convergence 370
   5.3. Continuation of different social and fiscal models 371
6. The missing links of fiscal legal integration 373
   6.1. The limits of negative integration 373
   6.2. The list of missing links 373
7. The missing links of fiscal economic integration 376
   7.1. The instruments currently available to the European Union are inadequate to operate a single currency 376
   7.2. The traditional solution is centralized decision-making in a federal state 376
   7.3. The intermediate way of a Budget Authority for emergencies 377
8. Conclusions on fiscal legal integration 377
   8.1. Fiscal sovereignty is still largely intact, with the exception of international investments 377
   8.2. New procedures to realize the missing links 378
9. The conclusions on economic fiscal integration 379
   9.1. Distinction between the Eurozone and the European Union 379
   9.2. Current coordination instruments are inadequate for a common currency 379
   9.3. How to forge adequate instruments? 379
   9.4. Do we need the euro? 380

Conference Papers

John Avery Jones: List of Publications