Table of Contents

Acknowledgements v

Foreword vii

Part One
EU Tax Law

Chapter 1: “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits” in EU Tax Law 3
Pasquale Pistone

1.1. Introduction 3
1.2. An empirical reconstruction of the three concepts based on ECJ case law 4
1.3. A more focused analysis of undertakings in the light of State aid case law 10
1.4. Selected issues concerning secondary tax law 12
1.4.1. Directives in the field of direct taxes 12
1.4.2. VAT Directive 2006/112/EC 17
1.4.3. The capital duty directive 18
1.5. Legal instruments of EU tax coordination 19
1.6. Conclusions 20

Chapter 2: Extra-Textual References to “Enterprise” and “Business” in the European VAT Directive 23
Andrea Parolini

2.1. Introduction 23
2.2. The “no-supply” rule enshrined in Art. 19 of the VAT Directive 24
2.2.1. In general 24
2.2.2. The concept of “totality of assets or part thereof” according to the ECJ 25
2.3. Open questions 27
Table of Contents

Part Two
Tax Law

Chapter 3: The Meaning of “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits” in Domestic Tax Law

Luc De Broe

3.1. Introduction 31
3.2. Civil law vs common law: Main similarities and differences 32
3.3. Civil law 33
3.4. Common law 37

Chapter 4: “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits”: From the League of Nations to the Current OECD Model Tax Convention

Jacques Sasseville

4.1. Introduction 41
4.2. The 1928 models of the League of Nations 41
4.3. The 1943 Mexico Model and the 1946 London Model 42
4.4. The OEEC reports 44
4.5. The deletion of Art. 14 in the 2000 Update 50
4.6. The 2008 and 2010 Updates 51
4.7. Interpretation of the treaty concepts of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” 53
  4.7.1. The concept of “enterprise” 53
  4.7.2. The concept of “Business” 55
  4.7.3. The Concept of “Business Profits” 57

Part Three
Special Issues in Tax Treaty Law

Chapter 5: “Enterprise” and “Enterprise of a Contracting State”: Towards a Century of Confusion Regarding the Term “Enterprise” in the Model Double Taxation Conventions

Kees van Raad

5.1. Introduction 61
5.2. Inventory and analysis of the use of the term “enterprise” in the 2010 OECD Model 62
Table of Contents

5.2.1. Inventory 62
5.2.2. Analysis 64
5.3. The term “enterprise” in the League of Nations Models 65
  5.3.1. Introduction 65
  5.3.2. The 1925 Resolutions 65
  5.3.3. The 1927 Draft Convention 67
  5.3.4. The 1931 Draft Plurilateral Convention 68
  5.3.5. The 1933 Draft Convention on the Allocation of Business Income 69
  5.3.6. The Mexico and London Drafts 70
5.4. Evaluation of the use of the term “enterprise” in the League of Nations draft conventions 72
5.5. Proposal 72

Chapter 6: “Business” and “Business Profits” 85

6.1. Introduction 85
6.2. Consequences of an interpretation in the light of domestic law 86
6.3. Consequences of an interpretation taking the context into account 91
6.4. Relationship between Art. 7 and other distributive rules 93
  6.4.1. The meaning of the terms “dependent and independent” 95
  6.4.2. Distributive rules considered leges speciales to Art. 15 or to Art. 7 96
  6.4.3. Distributive rules that deal with special aspects of an independent or dependent activity 97
  6.4.4. Distributive rules that partially overlap with Art. 7 97
  6.4.5. Final thoughts on the relationship of Art. 7 to other distributive rules 100
6.5. Consequences for the application of Art. 23A 103
6.6. Conclusions for the interpretation of the terms “business” and “business profits” 106

Chapter 7: The term “Enterprise” and Art. 24 of the OECD Model Convention 107

7.1. Meaning of the term “enterprise” in Art. 24 OECD Model Convention 107
7.2. Legislative developments 108
Table of Contents

7.3. The term “enterprise” in the light of the objective and purpose of Art. 24 OECD Model 112
7.4. The term “enterprise” in the context of the Model Convention 113
7.5. Significance of domestic law? 116
7.6. Conclusion 122

Part Four
Country Reports

Chapter 8: Australia 127
Graeme S. Cooper

8.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 127
  8.1.1. “Enterprise” in domestic law 128
  8.1.2. “Business” in domestic law 129
8.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 132
  8.2.1. “Enterprise” in domestic tax law 132
    8.2.1.1. Income tax 132
    8.2.1.2. Indirect taxes 132
  8.2.2. “Business” in domestic tax law 135
    8.2.2.1. Business vs expensive hobby or pastime 137
    8.2.2.2. Business vs isolated profit-making transaction 139
    8.2.2.3. Business vs investment 141
    8.2.2.4. CFC provisions and proposals 143
  8.2.3. “Business profit” in domestic income tax law 144
    8.2.3.1. Capital gains vs revenue receipts 144
    8.2.3.2. Receipts vs profits 145
    8.2.3.3. Investment income as business profits 146
8.3. Comparison with the meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 147
8.4. “Enterprise”, “business” and “profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 147
  8.4.1. Australia’s tax treaty practice 147
    8.4.1.1. The impact of Art. 13 on business profits 148
    8.4.1.2. Modern treaty practice for business profits under Art. 13 150
  8.4.2. Interpretation of treaties 153
Table of Contents

8.4.2.1. The meaning of “enterprise” 153
8.4.2.2. Including isolated transactions as a “business” 154
8.4.2.3. Gains of a speculator as business profits vs profits from the alienation of property 155
8.4.2.4. Revenue gains of an ongoing business as business profits vs profits from the alienation of property 156
8.4.2.5. Capital gains of an ongoing business 158
8.4.2.6. Investment income as business profits 161
8.4.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from source-state perspective or the State of residence-state perspective 163
8.5. Compatibility between domestic tax law and tax treaties 164

Chapter 9: Austria

Elke Aumayr

9.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 167
  9.1.1. General 167
  9.1.2. The meaning of “enterprise” in Austrian commercial law 168
9.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits in domestic tax law 171
  9.2.1. The meaning of “enterprise” in domestic tax law 171
  9.2.2. The meaning of “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 174
  9.2.3. The meaning of “place of business” in domestic tax law 176
9.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 179
  9.3.1. General 179
  9.3.2. Implementation of the term “economic activity” in Austrian VAT law 180
  9.3.3. Implementation of Art. 11 of VAT Directive 2006/112/EC 182
9.4. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 183
  9.4.1. Austria’s tax treaty practice 183
Table of Contents

9.4.1.1. General 183
9.4.1.2. Taxation of business profits 183
9.4.1.3. The definition of “permanent establishment” 184
9.4.1.4. Independent personal services 185
9.4.2. The interpretation of tax treaties 186
9.4.2.1. General 186
9.4.2.2. Treaty interpretation in Austria 189
9.4.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 191
9.4.3.1. General 191
9.4.3.2. Austria as the state of residence 192
9.4.3.3. Austria as the state of source 192
9.5. Compatibility of Austria’s domestic tax law with tax treaties and EU law 193

Chapter 10: Belgium

*Katrien Willoqué and Ellen Cassaer*

10.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 197
10.1.1. Belgian economic law: Commercial vs non-commercial 197
10.1.2. The term “enterprise” in legal literature 199
10.1.3. “Enterprise” in Belgian economic law 200
10.1.3.1. Accounting law 200
10.1.3.2. Belgian legislation on the registration of enterprises 201
10.1.3.3. Competition law 201
10.1.3.4. Market practices and consumer protection 202
10.1.3.5. Belgian act on continuity of enterprises 202
10.1.3.6. Conclusion: There is no such thing as “the enterprise” in Belgian non-tax law 203
10.1.4. *De lege ferenda* … 203
10.1.5. “Business” – the most notable absentee in Belgian non-tax law 204
10.1.5.1. Determination of the place of business is a matter of fact 205
10.1.6. “Enterprise”, “business” and holding companies 206
10.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 207
Table of Contents

10.2.1. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in Belgian income tax law: Introduction 207
10.2.2. “Business”: A non-existent term in Belgian income tax 207
10.2.3. The terms “enterprise” and “business profits” in personal income tax
  10.2.3.1. Carrying on an enterprise: Profits 209
  10.2.3.2. Carrying on of a professional service or other professional activities of an independent character: Benefits 209
10.2.3.3. Benefits vs profits 210
10.2.4. “Enterprise and “business profits”: Corporate income tax vs legal entities tax
  10.2.4.1. “Company” in income tax law vs “company” in corporate law 211
  10.2.4.2. “Company”, “enterprise” and “business” 212
  10.2.4.3. Investment and holding activities 213
  10.2.4.4. Non-profit organizations 214
  10.2.4.5. Examples 214
  10.2.4.6. Business profits 216
10.2.5. “Business”, “enterprise” and “business profits” in Belgian income tax 217
10.2.6. Non-resident tax and place of business 217
10.2.7. “Enterprise” in other kind of taxes 220
10.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law
  10.3.1. EU direct tax law 221
  10.3.2. VAT legislation
    10.3.2.1. The meaning of “economic activity” in EU tax law 222
    10.3.2.2. The meaning of “economic activity” and “enterprise” in Belgian VAT law 223
  10.3.3. VAT grouping 225
10.4. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties
  10.4.1. Belgium’s tax treaty practice
    10.4.1.1. Introduction 226
    10.4.1.2. The concepts of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in Belgium’s tax treaties 227
  10.4.2. The interpretation of tax treaties
    10.4.2.1. Introduction 228
Table of Contents

10.4.2.2. The Vienna Convention and Art. 3(2) of the OECD Model 229
10.4.2.3. The Belgian Standard Model Draft 232
10.4.2.4. The Belgian tax administration’s viewpoint 234
10.4.2.5. Interpretation of the concepts “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” 235
10.4.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 237
10.5. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with EU law and tax treaties 240

Chapter 11: Canada

Kim Brooks

11.1. Function of the concept of “business” in Canadian tax law 245
11.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in Canadian non-tax law 248
11.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in Canadian tax law 250
  11.3.1. Distinguishing non-deductible personal expenses and deductible business expenses 250
  11.3.2. Distinguishing non-taxable amounts with no source from business income 255
  11.3.3. Distinguishing business income from other sources of income
    11.3.3.1. Distinguishing employment income from business income 255
    11.3.3.2. Distinguishing income from property from business income 258
    11.3.3.3. Distinguishing capital gains from business income 259
    11.3.3.4. Business income as a measure of geographic nexus 260
11.4. Differences between income tax law and other tax legislation 263
11.5. Enterprise,” “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for purposes of tax treaties 263
  11.5.1. State tax treaty practice 263
    11.5.1.1. Definitions 264
Table of Contents

11.5.1.2. Permanent establishment 265
11.5.1.3. Business profits 267
11.5.1.4. Non-discrimination 270

11.6. Compatibility of Canadian tax law with Canada’s tax treaties 271

Chapter 12: France

Nicolas Message

12.1. Introduction 273
12.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in French domestic non-tax law 273
  12.2.1. The French definitions of “business” and “enterprise” 274
    12.2.1.1. The commercial business (fonds de commerce) 274
    12.2.1.2. The agricultural business (fonds agricole) 275
    12.2.1.3. The crafts business (fonds artisanal) 276
    12.2.1.4. The civil business (fonds civil or fonds d’exercice libéral) 277
  12.2.2. The place of “businesses” and “enterprises” under French domestic non-tax law 278
12.3. Meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 280
  12.3.1. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” according to the French territoriality principle 282
  12.3.2. Other considerations as regard to the meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 283
    12.3.2.1. The profitability criterion 283
    12.3.2.2. The economical criterion: Real spot of convergence 284
    12.3.2.3. Other nuances deriving from commercial taxes 285
  12.3.3. Holding companies and fictitious companies 285
    12.3.3.1. Holding companies and holding activities 285
    12.3.3.2. Fictitious companies 286
12.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 287
  12.4.1. EU tax law widens the borders of the domestic definitions “enterprise” and “business” 287
Table of Contents

12.4.1. The ECJ *Papillon* case 287
12.4.1.2. Common Consolidated Tax Base 288

12.4.2. “Enterprise” and “business” in EU VAT legislation 288
12.4.2.1. Implementation of the term “economic activity” in French VAT 288
12.4.2.2. Definition of “economical activity” according to ECJ case law 289
12.4.2.3. Definition of “economical activity” according to French case law 290
12.4.2.4. Implementation of Art. 11 of the VAT directive 290

12.5. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purpose of tax treaties 290
12.5.1. French tax law interpretation of a “permanent establishment” 291
12.5.1.1. A place of business 291
12.5.1.2. What is a “fixed” place of business in terms of geographical location (the location test)? 292
12.5.1.3. What is a “fixed” place of business in terms of the time that the place is used (the duration test)? 293
12.5.1.4. Meaning of “through which the business of an enterprise is wholly or partly carried on” 293
12.5.1.5. Does the place of business have to be owned or rented by the taxpayer (right of use test)? 294
12.5.1.6. Other aspects of the relationship between the place and the enterprise’s business 295
12.5.1.6.1. Can the activity of owning and renting buildings source a PE? 295
12.5.1.6.2. Should a business installation be autonomous? 295

12.5.2. French interpretation of the listed examples of a permanent establishment (Art. 5(2)) 296
12.5.2.1. A place of management 297
12.5.2.2. A branch 297
Table of Contents

12.5.2.3. An office 298
12.5.2.4. A factory or a workshop 300
12.5.2.5. A mine, an oil or gas well, a quarry or any other place of extraction of natural resources 300

12.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law 300

Chapter 13: Germany
Sebastian Heinrichs

13.1. Introduction 305
13.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 306
13.2.1. The meaning of “enterprise” 306
13.2.1.1. “Enterprise” as an object in private law 306
13.2.1.2. “Enterprise” as a subject in group law 307
13.2.1.3. “Enterprise” as a subject in competition law 309
13.2.1.4. “Enterprise” as an object in bankruptcy law 309
13.2.2. The meaning of “business” 310
13.2.2.1. “Business” as an object of reference in employment law 310
13.2.2.2. “Business” as an object of reference in commercial law 311
13.2.2.3. “Business” as an activity – commercial law and competition law 313

13.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 314
13.3.1. The meaning of “business” in German tax law 314
13.3.1.1. “Business” in German income and municipal trade tax law 314
13.3.1.1.1. Positive requirements 315
13.3.1.1.2. Extensions by case law and special regimes 317
13.3.1.1.3. Negative statutory requirements – Demarcation between business, independent personal services, and agriculture and forestry 319
### Table of Contents

13.3.1.1.4. Negative requirement by case law – Demarcation between business and mere private investment 320  
13.3.1.1.5. Legal form and business 322  
13.3.1.1.6. Special modifications – Trade Tax 323  
13.3.1.2. “Business” in inheritance and gift tax law 323  
13.3.1.3. “Business” in turnover tax law 324  
13.3.1.4. Comparison with the meaning of “business” in domestic non-tax law 324  
13.3.2. The meaning and scope of “business profits” in German income tax law 324  
13.3.3. The place of business in German tax law 325  
13.3.4. The meaning of “enterprise” 326  
13.3.4.1. “Enterprise” in income tax and trade tax law 326  
13.3.4.2. Turnover tax law 327  
13.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 327  
13.4.1. Implementation of the term “economic activity” in domestic VAT law 328  
13.4.1.1. Examination of the domestic definition 328  
13.4.1.2. Comparison with the enterprise definition under domestic income tax law 329  
13.4.2. Art. 11 of VAT Directive 2006/112/EC (Organschaft) 26  
13.5. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 331  
13.5.1. Germany’s tax treaty practice 331  
13.5.1.1. The “business” and “enterprise” definitions in Art. 3 of the OECD Model 331  
13.5.1.2. The fate of Art. 14 of the OECD Model after 2000 332  
13.5.1.3. The treaty practice on Art. 7 of the OECD Model 333  
13.5.2. The interpretation of tax treaties 333  
13.5.2.1. The meaning of “business” and “enterprise” in the field of German double taxation treaties 334
13.5.2.2. The meaning of “business profits” in the field of German double taxation treaties 337

13.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 338

13.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law 340

Chapter 14: Italy

Francesco Avella

14.1. Introduction 341

14.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 342

14.2.1. Real and personal criteria to identify entrepreneurs 342

14.2.2. The non-tax law definition for “entrepreneur” 343

14.2.3. Activity of producing or trading goods or services 345

14.2.4. Proposed Italian non-tax law meaning of “business” 351

14.2.5. Features for a “business” to qualify as an “enterprise”: Professional, organized, economic 351

14.2.6. “Enterprise” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character” 354

14.2.7. Examples in the Commentary on Art. 5 of the OECD Model and Italian non-tax law 356

14.2.8. Holding activities and isolated commercial transactions 360

14.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 361

14.3.1. Premise 361

14.3.2. Real and personal criteria 362

14.3.3. The real criterion: Income tax law definition for “enterprise” 362

14.3.4. “Commercial activities” under income tax law 364

14.3.5. Proposed Italian tax law meaning of “business” 367

14.3.6. Features for a business to qualify as an enterprise: Professional and economic; limited significance of organization 368

14.3.7. “Business” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character” 372

14.3.8. The personal criterion 374
Table of Contents

14.3.9. Examples in the Commentary on Art. 5 of the OECD Model and Italian tax law 377
14.3.10. Holding activities and isolated commercial transactions 379
14.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 381
14.4.1. “Enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 381
14.4.2. The implementation of the term “economic activity” in domestic VAT law 384
14.4.3. Enterprises 385
14.4.4. Self-employment activities 387
14.4.5. The implementation of Art. 11 of Directive 2006/112 388
14.5. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 388
14.5.1. Italy’s tax treaty practice 388
14.5.2. The interpretation of Italian tax treaties 390
14.5.2.1. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” 390
14.5.2.2. “Independent professional services” 396
14.5.2.3. References to the OECD Model Commentaries 396
14.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from source-state perspective or residence-state perspective 397

Chapter 15: Japan 399
Asatsuma Akiyuki

15.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 399
15.1.1. “Business” and “enterprise” in civil law 399
15.1.2. “Business” and “enterprise” in commercial law 401
15.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 402
15.2.1. The meaning of “business profits” 402
15.2.1.1. The meaning of “business income” and “salary income” 402
15.2.1.2. The meaning of “business income” and “capital gain” 404
15.2.1.3. The meaning of “business income” and “miscellaneous income” 406
Table of Contents

15.2.1.4. The meaning of “business income” and “dividend income” 408
15.2.2. The meaning of “business” 409
15.2.2.1. Special legislation regarding companies that are deemed not to operate a business 409
15.2.2.2. The meaning of “business” in corporate tax law 413
15.2.2.3. The meaning of “business” and “enterprise” for all other types of taxes 415
15.3. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 415
15.3.1. State’s tax treaty practice 415
15.3.1.1. Business profits provision as of Arts. 5 and 7 of the OECD Model 415
15.3.1.2. Individual service income provision as of Art. 14 of OECD MC 416
15.3.2. The interpretation of tax treaties 416
15.3.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 416
15.3.3.1. From the source-state perspective 416
15.3.3.2. From the residence-state perspective 419
15.3.3.3. The potential impact of the OECD approach on conflicts of qualification 419
15.4. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties 421

Chapter 16: Luxembourg

Katarina Köszeghy

16.1. Introduction 427
16.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 428
16.2.1. The concepts of “enterprise” and “business” in Luxembourg civil law 428
16.2.2. The concept of “enterprise” in Luxembourg commercial law 428
16.2.2.1. No legally enshrined definition of “enterprise” in Luxembourg commercial law 428
16.2.2.2. The definition of “enterprise” in Art. 8 of the Commercial Code 429
Table of Contents

16.2.2.2.1. Trader as an “enterprise” 429
16.2.2.2.2. Commercial companies being an “enterprise” 431
16.2.2.2.3. Branches of non-resident companies being an “enterprise” 432
16.2.3. The meaning of “business” in Luxembourg non-tax law 432
16.2.4. The distinction between “enterprise”, “business” and “independent personal services” 433
16.2.5. The relation of domestic provisions to Art. 5 of the OECD Model 433
16.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic tax law 435
16.3.1. The meaning of “enterprise” in the Luxembourg Income Tax Law (LITL) 435
16.3.1.1. The meaning of “enterprise” for tax-transparent entities 435
16.3.1.1.1. Income derived by an “enterprise” 436
16.3.1.1.2. A definition of “enterprise” in Art. 14(1) of the LITL 436
16.3.1.2. The meaning of “enterprise” for fiscally non-transparent entities 438
16.3.2. The meaning of “enterprise” for municipal business tax law (MBTL) purposes 439
16.3.3. The deemed “enterprise” concept created by Luxembourg income tax law 439
16.3.3.1. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by Art. 14(4) of the LITL (théorie de l’empreinte/Geprägetheorie) 439
16.3.3.2. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by Art. 14(2) of the LITL 441
16.3.3.3. The extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by the “theory of tainted income” 442
16.3.3.4. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by case law 442
16.3.3.5. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by “subordination provisions” (théorie de la subsidiarité) 443
Table of Contents

16.3.4. Differences between “enterprise” and “independent personal services” 443
16.3.5. The meaning of “enterprise” in the VAT law (VATL) of 5 August 1969 444
16.3.6. The meaning of “enterprise” for Luxembourg non-resident taxpayers under LITL 445
16.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law (VAT implementation of “economic activity”) 446
16.4.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” derived from EU law 446
16.4.2. The implementation of “economic activity” in Luxembourg law 447
16.4.3. The non-implementation of Art. 11 of the VAT Directive in Luxembourg law 448
16.4.4. The meaning of “undertaking” for purposes of Art. 107 of the TFEU 449
16.4.5. “Enterprise” in LITL vs “economic activity” in VATL 449
16.5. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 450
16.5.1. Luxembourg tax treaty practice 450
16.5.1.1. Particularities of tax treaties concluded by Luxembourg 450
16.5.1.2. Art. 14 of the OECD Model in tax treaties concluded by Luxembourg 451
16.5.2. The interpretation of tax treaties in Luxembourg 452
16.5.2.1. In general on the interpretation of tax treaties in Luxembourg 452
16.5.2.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” for tax treaty interpretation 454
16.5.2.2.1. The definition of “enterprise” and “business” 454
16.5.2.2.2. The definition of “business profits” 456
16.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 458
16.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law 458

xxv
Chapter 17: Netherlands

Anna Gunn

17.1. Introduction 459
17.2. The meaning of the terms “enterprise” and “business” in Dutch non-tax law 462
   17.2.1. Use of the terms “enterprise”, “business” and “profession” 462
   17.2.2. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in the Workers’ Council Act 465
   17.2.3. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in the Trade Register Act 466
   17.2.4. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” for the protection of employees’ rights 468
   17.2.5. Use of the term “business” in the Bankruptcy Act 470
   17.2.6. Distinction between entrepreneurial and investment activities 470
   17.2.7. Would the examples under OECD Commentary to Art. 5 constitute a “place of business” in Dutch non-tax law? 471
17.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business profits” in Dutch direct tax law 472
   17.3.1. Individual Income Taxation Act 2001 (IITA) 472
      17.3.1.1. Overview of the system of the IITA 2001 472
          17.3.1.1.1. Box 1: Taxable income from work and home ownership 473
          17.3.1.1.2. Box 2: Taxable income from a substantial shareholding 474
          17.3.1.1.3. Box 3: Taxable income from savings and investments 474
      17.3.1.2. Meaning of the term “business profits” (Art. 3.2 IITA) 475
      17.3.1.3. Meaning of the term “entrepreneur” (Art. 3.4 IITA) 476
      17.3.1.4. Use of the hours-criterion (Art. 3.6 IITA) 476
      17.3.1.5. Meaning of the term “enterprise” 477
          17.3.1.5.1. Business profits vs wage income 478
          17.3.1.5.2. Business profits vs income from other activities 478
          17.3.1.5.3. Business profits vs investment income 479
17.3.1.6. Distinction between the concepts of an “objective enterprise” and a “subjective enterprise” in Dutch tax doctrine 480
17.3.1.7. Treatment of professional activities (Art. 3.5 IITA) 480
17.3.1.8. Points taken into account by the Dutch tax authorities when assessing the status as entrepreneur 481

17.3.2. Corporate Income Taxation Act 1969 (CITA) 482
17.3.2.1. Unlimited tax liability (use of the “formal enterprise” concept under Art. 2(5) CITA) 482
17.3.2.2. Limited tax liability (use of the concept of a “material enterprise”) 482

17.3.3. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” for Dutch non-resident taxpayers 483
17.3.4. Distinction between entrepreneurial activities and investment activities 486
17.3.5. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in other provisions under CITA 487
17.3.6. Would the examples under OECD Commentary to Art. 5 constitute an “enterprise” in Dutch tax law? 488

17.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU law 489
17.4.1. The Dutch VAT Act (Council Directive 2006/112/EC) 489
17.4.1.1. Use of the term “entrepreneur” in the VAT Act 489
17.4.1.2. Use of the concept of an “economic activity” in Dutch case law 491
17.4.1.3. The VAT fiscal unity (Art. 7(4) VAT Act) 492
17.4.2. Use of the term “enterprise” in the Competition Act 494
17.4.3. Some differences between the term “economic activity” and the concept of an objective/material “enterprise” in Dutch direct tax law 496

17.5. The meaning of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” in Dutch tax treaties 496
17.5.1. The Netherlands’ tax treaty practice 497
17.5.1.1. Dutch treaty policy on the term “profit” as formulated in the 1998 Nota on international fiscal policy 497
17.5.1.2. Meaning of the term “enterprise” in the tax treaty with Germany 498
# Table of Contents

17.5.1.3. Meaning of the term “enterprise” in the tax treaty with Switzerland 499
17.5.1.4. Inclusion of Art. 14 (Independent Personal Services) in Dutch tax treaties concluded after 2000 499
17.5.1.5. Use of the term “enterprise” in the unilateral Decree for the Prevention of Double Taxation 500

17.5.2. The interpretation of tax treaties 501
17.5.2.1. Significance of the OECD Commentary for tax treaty interpretation in the Netherlands 501
17.5.2.2. OECD Commentary on the terms “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” 502
17.5.2.3. Use of the mutual agreement procedure for the interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” 504

17.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state or residence-state perspective 505
17.5.3.1. The Dutch interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” where the Netherlands is source state 505
17.5.3.2. The Dutch interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” where the Netherlands is resident state 506
17.5.3.3. The observation made by the Netherlands to the OECD Commentary to Art. 23A/B 507
17.5.3.4. Alternative approaches adopted by the Netherlands towards conflicts if qualification 509

17.6. Compatibility of provisions of Dutch domestic direct tax law with international law 509
17.6.1. Compatibility with tax treaties 509
17.6.2. Compatibility with EU Law 510
17.6.3. Compatibility with international public law 512
# Chapter 18: United Kingdom

*Rachael Arning*

18.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law

18.1.1. The meaning of “business”  
- 18.1.1.1. Consumer protection law  
- 18.1.1.2. Commercial law  
- 18.1.1.3. Company law  
- 18.1.1.4. Insolvency  
- 18.1.1.5. Professional services  
- 18.1.1.6. Passive holding of investments  
- 18.1.1.7. Frequency of transactions

18.1.2. The meaning of the word “enterprise”  

18.1.3. Comparison of the concept of a “fixed place of business” and “professional services” in UK domestic non-tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC

18.1.3.1. “Fixed place of business” in UK domestic non-tax law  
18.1.3.2. Comparison of the concept of a “fixed place of business” and “professional services” in UK domestic non-tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC

18.2. The meaning of “enterprise” “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law

18.2.1. The meaning of “business”  
- 18.2.1.1. Meaning of “trade”  
- 18.2.1.2. Meaning of “profession or vocation”  
- 18.2.1.3. Isolated transactions

18.2.2. Meaning of “business profits”  

18.2.3. Holding activities  
- 18.2.3.1. Companies  
- 18.2.3.2. Partnerships  
- 18.2.3.3. Individuals

18.2.4. Definition of “trade” in the context of exemptions and reliefs  
- 18.2.4.1. Capital gains  
- 18.2.4.1.1. Capital allowances  
- 18.2.4.1.2. Incorporation relief and rollover relief
Table of Contents

18.2.4.1.3. Entrepreneurs’ relief 538
18.2.4.1.4. Substantial shareholding exemption 538
18.2.4.2. Savings 539
18.2.4.2.1. Venture Capital Trusts, Enterprise Investment Scheme and Corporate Venturing Scheme 539
18.2.4.3. Inheritance tax 540
18.2.5. “Fixed place of business” in UK domestic tax law 541
18.2.5.1. Corporation tax 541
18.2.5.1.1. Controlled foreign company (CFC) regime: The exempt activities test 542
18.2.6. Comparison of the concept of a “fixed place of business” and “professional services” in domestic tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC 544
18.2.7. The meaning of “enterprise” 544
18.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law 545
18.3.1. The meaning of “enterprise” 546
18.3.2. Meaning of “business” 546
18.3.2.1. Direct taxes 546
18.3.2.2. Indirect tax 548
18.3.2.3. Holding activities 551
18.3.2.4. Art. 11 VAT Directive 2006/112/EC 552
18.3.2.5. Anti-avoidance 553
18.4. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties 555
18.4.1. State’s tax treaty practice 555
18.4.1.1. Treaty practice in relation to the terms “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” 555
18.4.1.2. Fixed place of business 556
18.4.1.3. Independent personal services 559
18.4.2. The interpretation of tax treaties 560
18.4.2.1. Meaning of “business” 560
18.4.2.2. Meaning of “enterprise” 561
18.4.2.3. Meaning of “business profits” 563
18.4.2.4. Meaning of “fixed place of business” in the PE article 565
18.4.2.5. Mutual agreement procedure (MAP) 567

xxx
18.4.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 567
18.4.3.1. “Enterprise” 567
18.4.3.2. “Business profits” 568

18.5. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law 569
18.5.1. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties 569
18.5.1.1. Treaty override – Legislative 569
18.5.1.2. Treaty override – Judicial 571
18.5.2. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with EU Law 572
18.5.2.1. Controlled foreign company rules 572
18.5.2.2. VAT grouping rules 573

Chapter 19: United States 575
Allison Christians and Yariv Brauner

19.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law 575
19.1.1. Corporate law 575
19.1.2. The Uniform Commercial Code 579
19.1.3. Bankruptcy law 580
19.1.4. Place of business in connection with the examples in Commentary to Art. 5 of the OECD Model 581

19.2. The meaning of “business”, “enterprise” and “business profits” in domestic tax law 584
19.2.1. Business 584
19.2.1.1. Domestic law definition 584
19.2.1.2. Modifications in the case of foreign persons 587
19.2.1.2.1. Presence requirement 587
19.2.1.2.2. Ownership of assets 588
19.2.1.2.3. Treatment of services 589
19.2.1.2.4. Attribution from other taxpayers 589

19.2.2. Business entities 590
19.2.3. Business profits 591

19.3. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purpose of tax treaties 594
Table of Contents

19.3.1.  State’s tax treaty practice 594
   19.3.1.1.  United States Model Tax Convention 594
      19.3.1.1.1.  Definition of “enterprise” 594
      19.3.1.1.2.  Definitions of “business” and “business profits” 595
   19.3.1.2.  Use of terms in treaties in force 595
   19.3.1.3.  Art. 14 – Independent personal services 600
19.3.2.  The interpretation of tax treaties 601
   19.3.2.1.  Definition of “enterprise” 601
      19.3.2.1.1.  Definition of “business” 602
      19.3.2.1.2.  Definition of “business profits” 603
19.3.3.  “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective 604
19.4.  Compatibility of domestic law provisions with tax treaties 606
   19.4.1.  General 606
   19.4.2.  Relevant relationship between treaties and the Code 607

Part Five
Round-Table Discussion

Chapter 20:  Round Table: On the Desirability to Change the OECD Model Convention and its Commentaries 611
20.1.  The practical issues and questions 611
20.2.  Conclusions 635

Contributors 639