

Value Added Tax and Direct Taxation - Similarities and Differences

CONTRIBUTORS

Richard Thompson Ainsworth is a NH and MA attorney with over 20 years academic, government, and private sector tax experience. He is currently Director of International Tax (Government Affairs) with ADP and an Adjunct Professor at the Boston University School of Law, where he teaches courses in VAT, Comparative Income Tax, and Comparative International Transfer Pricing. Formerly, Richard was Legal Issues Officer with the NH DOR, a Senior Litigation Attorney with the IRS, Deputy Director of the International Tax Program at Harvard Law School, and an Adjunct Professor of Public Policy (Kennedy School of Government).

Eleonor Alhager is a full-time professor in tax law at Uppsala University. She is specialized in VAT law and tax procedural law and has published several books and articles in these fields. Beside her academic career, she has experience in tax consultancy. She has also been a member of the Swedish Board for Advance Rulings.

Kerstin Alvesson, LL.M. (Uppsala University) has been working for five years as a legal VAT expert at the Swedish Tax Agency, Legal Department.

Tomas Balco, Senior Tax Manager, PricewaterhouseCoopers in Almaty, Kazakhstan.

Tomas is currently based in Almaty, Kazakhstan where he provides international and domestic tax advice related to structuring of inbound and outbound investments to and from Central Asia and Mongolia. He is Associate Professor at KIMEP in Almaty and visiting professor at the University of Economics in Prague. He holds a Magister and Doctor in Law degrees from the Masaryk University Brno, Czech Republic (2001) as well as a Master in Laws degree (LL.M.) in the International Tax Law from WU Wien (2002–03). He is a Chartered Certified Accountant - member of ACCA, London, UK since 2004 (FCCA since 2009).

Gianluigi Bizioli completed his Ph.D. in International and Comparative Tax Law at the University of Genoa in 2004 with a thesis on the influence of Community Law on constitutional tax principles. He is Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law of the University of Bergamo, where he teaches Tax Law and European Tax Law.

Prof. Dr Marc Bourgeois is Professor of Tax Law and Public Finance Law at the University of Liège and at the High Business School of the University of Liège, in Belgium. He also works as a tax consultant at Firket, Brandenburg, Crahay & Pichault in Liège. In 2007 he defended with success a thesis on “The definition of the concept of ‘tax’”. He can be contacted at marc.bourgeois@ulg.ac.be.

Radu Bufan is professor of Tax Law at the University of West, Timisoara, Romania. He is the director of the Romanian Tax Review. Also, he is a lawyer and tax advisor.

Luca Cerioni is tax advisor, member of the CFE (*Confederation Fiscale Europeenne*) and currently Lecturer at Brunel Law School, Brunel University (West London). He graduated in “Economics and Commerce” from the “Universita’ Politecnica delle Marche” (Italy) and subsequently gained an LLM and a Ph.D, specializing in EC and international tax law and in EC company law, from the University of Essex. His previous tax law publications lie in the areas of European and international direct taxation. E-mail contacts: luca.cerioni@brunel.ac.uk and lcerio@yahoo.it (private) (professional).

Alain Charlet is a tax lawyer. He joined Landwell & Associés, the correspondent law firm of PricewaterhouseCoopers, in 2002 and before that worked for Arthur Andersen International. He has studied law in France, Canada (McGill University) and in the United States. He holds two French Post Graduate degrees in taxation and corporate law from Université Jean Moulin Lyon III and an LL.M. in taxation from Georgetown University Law Center. His main area of expertise focuses on VAT and indirect taxes with a particular concern for cross-border supplies, banking and financial issues and tax litigation. Alain is currently working as a Consultant at the OECD in the Tax Administration and Consumption Taxes Division.

Pablo Chico is Full Professor of Tax Law at the Rey Juan Carlos University of Madrid and President of the Local Tax Court of Mostoles City and a member of the International Tax Law Branch of the Spanish Association of Tax Law Advisors and researcher at the Institute of Fiscal Studies (Spanish Ministry of Finance). He is doctor of laws and Deputy Director of the editorial boards at the Spanish Review of Law & Sport (*Revista Jurídica del Deporte*) and the Spanish Review of Local Tax Law.

Sijbren Cossen is Advisor, CPB Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis; Emeritus Professor of Economics, University of Maastricht; and Emeritus Professor of Tax Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam. He has held appointments at Harvard University, New York University and College of Europe (Bruges). Previously, he was assistant-division chief at the International Monetary Fund and inspector in the Dutch tax service. The author wishes to thank *Tax Notes* for permission to republish this paper.

Wei Cui is an associate professor at the China University of Political Science and Law in Beijing and has held visiting professorships at Fordham Law School and the National Taiwan University Law School. He received his BA from Harvard, MA (philosophy) from Tufts, JD from Yale, and LLM (tax) from New York

University. His research encompasses tax policy and other areas of public finance.

Jeanine Daou-Azzi, Director, Indirect Taxes, PricewaterhouseCoopers, Dubai, United Arab Emirates. Jeanine is a tax lawyer. She has played a major role in the team responsible for drafting VAT laws, regulations, rulings and related policy papers in a number of countries in the Middle East. She has also has been a tax consultant on the IMF Middle East Technical Assistance Commission panel, providing regional technical assistance on tax law reform, and previously was the head of the legal unit at the UNDP tax reform project at the Ministry of Finance, Lebanon. Email: Jeanine.Daou@ae.pwc.com.

Avv. Paolo de' Captani di Vimercate (PHD) is a Junior Partner at Studio Uckmar-Italy. He participated in the Harvard Law School International Tax Program 2003–04 and is admitted to practice as an attorney in New York.

Thomas Ecker is a research and teaching assistant at the Institute for Austrian and International Tax Law of the WU (Vienna University of Economics and Business).

Dr Joachim Englisch is full Professor for Tax Law and Public Law at the Faculty of Law, Augsburg University, Germany. He also lectures at the European Tax College of Tilburg University, Netherlands, on a regular basis. His two main fields of research are the implications of EC law for the direct tax systems of the Member States, and European VAT. He has published extensively on both issues in national and international journals, and he is also the author of several books on tax topics. Dr Englisch is a Member of EATLP, IFA, and the German VAT Forum. The author can be contacted at joachim.englisch@jura.uni-augsburg.de

Nils Eriksen has a law degree and has worked with international VAT issues both in the private and public sector for more than 15 years. He has worked in many different countries and his experience includes, inter alia, work at the Ministry of Finance, IBFD, as Senior Advisor OECD, and as partner in various law and big four accounting firms.

Rita de la Feria is a Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Business Taxation, University of Oxford. She received her law degree from the University of Lisbon, having specialized in Economic Law, and completed her PhD on EU VAT harmonization at the Law School of the University of Dublin, Trinity College. Prior to joining Oxford University, Rita de la Feria worked as a tax consultant with Arthur Andersen in both their Lisbon and Dublin offices, and held lecturing positions on Tax Law and EU Law at both the University of Dublin, Trinity College and Queen's University Belfast. In 2008 she was a visiting scholar at New York University, Law School, and in 2009 she will be a visiting fellow at ATAX, University of New South Wales, Sydney. She has published widely on tax issues,

particularly on EU VAT, and presented to academic, practitioner and tax administration audiences. She is a member of the editorial board of the *British Tax Review*, and correspondent for *Highlights & Insights on European Taxation*.

Carlo Garbarino is Professor of Taxation, Bocconi University and Professor SDA Bocconi School of Management, Milan, member of Dipartimento di Studi Giuridici and of Steering Committee of the Ph.D. in International Economic Law of the same University, affiliated member of the Department of Accounting, Bocconi. Visiting Professor Université Sorbonne-Paris and University of Michigan Law School, member of the faculty of the tax programs at the WU Vienna University of Economics and Business. Ph.D. in Comparative and International Taxation, Master of Laws at the University of Michigan and Visiting Scholar at Yale University Law School.

Ole Gjems-Onstad is professor of tax law Norwegian School of Management, University of Oslo and University of Stavanger. He is the head of the Master program in tax law at the Norwegian School of Management and president Acem Norway as well as Deputy Head Acem International.

Rodney Govender is a graduate of the Chartered Institute of Secretaries. He is currently a Senior Indirect Tax Specialist in Interpretive Policy at the South African Revenue Service. Rodney is the South African representative at the Southern African Development Community's Tax Sub-Committee.

Karl-Heinz Haydl is a VAT practitioner at a multinational company. Having worked in VAT at the tax authorities, at a big four firm and now in industry, he has experienced VAT from various perspectives over the last 15 years.

Charles-Albert Helleputte is a lawyer at Mayer Brown International LLP and a tax law assistant at the University of Louvain-la-Neuve (Belgium). He practices tax law in a national and international, including European, context. He is active in the fields of corporate income tax (i.e. international tax planning and transfer pricing), indirect taxes and tax policy, and has experience in litigation and negotiation of rulings with the tax authorities. Charles-Albert is admitted to the Brussels bar and is a member of the International Fiscal Association.

Walter Hellerstein is the Francis Shackelford Professor of Taxation at the University of Georgia Law School, Athens, Georgia, USA. He is co-author of *State Taxation*, vols. I & II (3rd ed. (updated tri-annually)); *State and Local Taxation* (9th ed. 2009); *Streamlined Sales and Use Tax* (2008/2009); *Electronic Commerce and Multijurisdictional Taxation* (2001) and more than 100 journal articles. He serves as an academic advisor to the OECD's Working Party No. 9 on Consumption Taxes.

Dr Sigrid Hemels (1973) is associate professor of tax law at Leiden University, the Netherlands and senior professional support lawyer at Allen & Overy LLP, Amsterdam. She has focused part of her research on tax incentives for the arts.

Oskar Henkow L.L.D. is a teacher and researcher at the Department of Business Law, Lund University School of Economics and Management. He deals with indirect tax law and European Law and has over ten years of experience working as a tax consultant. His primary focus is European VAT law, which also was the topic of his thesis, "Financial Activities in European VAT", published in 2008.

Pedro M. Herrera is Associate Professor of Tax Law at the Complutense University of Madrid, Chairman of the International Tax Law Branch of the Spanish Association of Tax Law Advisors and former Research Advisor to the Institute of Fiscal Studies (Spanish Ministry of Finance). He is Doctor of Laws and a member of the Editorial Board of the Italian Rivista di Diritto Tributario Internazionale, the Italian review Diritto e Pratica Tributaria Internazionale, and the Russian Yearbook of International Tax Law.

Mark Keating is a Senior Lecturer in tax at the University of Auckland Business School. He has worked as a legal editor for CCH NZ Ltd and authored many journal articles and book chapters, principally on the tax disputes procedure, tax administration and GST/VAT. Mark has consulted to New Zealand's Inland Revenue's and to Government Crown Law.

Mark Killer is Director Indirect Taxes, PricewaterhouseCoopers. Mark has an extensive background in the application of VAT in the financial services industry, having been a dedicated technical resource for a major financial institution in Australia. More recently, Mark has been involved in a number of VAT implementation projects in the Middle East region. Email: Mark.Killer@ae.pwc.com.

Dr Caroline Kindl is specialized in VAT Law and currently employed by a tax consultancy in Vienna. She is author of many papers and is (co)editor of a commentary of the EC VAT Directive. She formerly worked at the University of Vienna.

Prof. Dr Georg Kofler, LL.M., is a Professor of Tax Law at the Johannes Kepler University in Linz, Austria and a member of the International Tax Department of Austria's Federal Ministry of Finance.

Dr Borbála Kolozs is a researcher in tax law. She is a visiting fellow at the Australian School of Taxation, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia, and a visiting fellow at the Taxation Law and Policy Research Institute, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia. The email address of the author is: borbalakolozs@gmail.com

Ralph Korf, barrister (Rechtsanwalt) and certified tax advisor (Steuerberater), is tax partner with PricewaterhouseCoopers in Munich. He is specialized in indirect taxation.

Dimitra Koulouri studied law at the University of Athens, Faculty of Law (LL.B., 1997; LL.M, Public Law, 1999). She was admitted to the Athens Bar Association in 1999. From 1997 to 2004 she served as a tax consultant with law firm C. Yannopoulos & Associates, one of the leading and largest Greek independent tax law firms. In 2004 she joined the Greek Ministry of Economy and Finance as an expert on tax legislation and worked for the VAT Directorate. In January 2008 she joined the Greek Permanent Delegation to the OECD. She is a vice-chair of the Working Party 9 on consumption taxes of the OECD and she co-chairs the Technical Advisory Group of WP9.

Ine Lejeune is Partner, Indirect Taxes, PricewaterhouseCoopers, Belgium. Ine is the Global Indirect Taxes Network Leader at PricewaterhouseCoopers, responsible for leading a network consisting of 2000 experts based in 130 countries. She is the partner responsible for PwC's tax and legal services to the European Commission (Directorate General for Taxation) and has led indirect tax implementation and reform projects for government and business around the world. Email: Ine.Lejeune@be.pwc.com.

Rebecca Millar is an Associate Professor at the Sydney Law School, University of Sydney, where her research and teaching are focussed primarily on VAT/GST. Professor Millar also works with the IMF and the World Bank, drafting VAT and excise tax laws and providing other technical assistance to developing countries. From 2002 to 2007 she was a member of the Australian Taxation Office Indirect Tax Rulings Panel and in 2008 she was a member of the expert panel appointed by the Australian Government's Board of Taxation for its *Review of the legal framework for the administration of the GST*. She is also one of two academic members of the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) advising Working Party 9 of the OECD's Committee of Fiscal Affairs (CFA) on the development of international guidelines for GST and VAT cross-border services rules. Before becoming an academic member in 2002, Professor Millar worked in tax practice in Sydney, specializing in income tax incentives for research and development.

Ass. Prof. Ing. Danuše Nerudová, Ph.D., head of the Department of Accounting and Taxes, Faculty of Economics and Business, Mendel University Brno, Czech Republic; researcher, Research Center of the Faculty of Economics and Business, Mendel University Brno, Czech Republic.

Lesley O'Connell Xego is a graduate of the University of Cape Town and holds a BA LLB degree. She has completed other certificate courses in VAT and accounting. She is currently a Senior Manager in Interpretive Policy, responsible for Indirect Taxes at the South African Revenue Service. Lesley is the South African representative at the OECD WP9.

Aurelian Opre graduated from the Faculty of Law, works at present as a senior advisor at Associated Business Advisors, Romania, in the tax department. Also, Aurelian Opre is the director of the International Fiscal (Tax) Monitor, a journal published by Wolters Kluwer Romania.

Andrea Parolini LL.M (taxation), Adjunct Professor (“*Professore a contratto*”) of Tax Law at the Catholic University of Piacenza; Research Fellow, Taxation Law and Policy Research Institute, Monash University; Partner, Maisto e Associati. The author wishes to thank Prof. Rick Krever for his suggestions. All errors and omissions remain the sole responsibility of the author.

Davide M. Parrilli obtained his law degree ('Laurea in Giurisprudenza') at the University of Padova (Italy) with a final thesis on International and Comparative Taxation ('The Regime of Transfer Pricing under Italian and Brazilian Law'). In 2006 he took his LL.M (cum laude) in International and European Business Law at the University of Tilburg (The Netherlands) with a final dissertation in the area of company law ('The Defensive Measures in Case of Takeover Bids: The Italian Perspective'). He is currently working at the Interdisciplinary Centre for Law and ICT (ICRI-IBBT) of the Catholic University of Belgium where he conducts research on legal, business and tax issues linked to the adoption of ICT by businesses.

Mie Pelzer LL.M. is head of section in the legal services of the Danish Central Tax Administration. She makes proposals concerning test cases which are presented to the National Tax Board.

Prof. Dr Pasquale Pistone, EURYI-ESF Professor of European and International Tax Law at the WU Vienna University of Economics and Business (Austria); Visiting Professor of European Taxation at the School of Law of the University of Florida (US); Associate Professor of Tax Law at the University of Salerno (Italy). Member of the Junge Kurie of the Austrian Academy of Sciences; member of the Editorial Board of Intertax and of several other distinguished international tax journals. Author of numerous publications on European and international tax law, published in several languages. The author can be contacted at pasquale.pistone@wu.ac.at.

Dennis Ramsdahl Jensen has a PhD degree in European VAT Law and is Associate Professor at Aarhus School of Business, Aarhus University. His primary area of research is Indirect Tax Law with emphasis on European VAT law. Dennis Ramsdahl Jensen teaches VAT law to students and professionals and is Director of study at the LL.M in VAT and indirect Taxes at Aarhus School of Business, Aarhus University.

Pernilla Rendahl, LL.D. is currently working as an acting assistant professor in law at Jönköping International Business School (JIBS) and is participating in

research projects carried out by the Media Management and Transformation Centre, JIBS.

Jesús Rodríguez is Deputy Director of Tax Research at the Institute of Fiscal Studies (Spanish Ministry of Finance) and Associate Professor of Tax Law at the Complutense University of Madrid and former legal advisor at the Spanish Supreme Court. He is Doctor of Laws and secretary of the Ministerial Commission for European Law and Tax Procedures.

Alan Schenk is Professor of Law at Wayne State University Law School. He taught courses on value added tax in the US, Canada, Taiwan, and Africa. For over a decade, he has been serving as Technical Advisor for the International Monetary Fund legal department, drafting and reviewing legislative proposals for sales and value added tax for countries in Africa, the Caribbean, and emerging economies of Eastern Europe. He has published extensively on value added tax, writing or co-authoring five books, as well as several articles on the taxation of financial services. He was reporter for a model US VAT statute prepared by the American Bar Association Section of Taxation Committee on VAT, which was twice introduced as a legislative proposal by Senator Hollings. He testified before the US Congress on alternative tax systems including the value added tax. He currently serves on the Editorial Board of the International VAT Monitor.

Prof. M. Sentsova (Karasseva) is the head of financial law department of the Faculty of Law of the Voronezh State University. She is author of six books and about 120 articles in tax and financial law area. She has published in Russia, Poland, Ukraine, Belarus, Switzerland, the Netherlands, Lithuania, Slovakia, United States and Kazakhstan.

Prof. Ing. Jan Široký, CSc., Department of Public Economy, Faculty of Economics, technical University Ostrava, Czech Republic; Department of Accounting and Taxes, Faculty of Economics and Business, Mendel University Brno, Czech Republic.

Henrik Stensgaard is Associate Professor at Aarhus School of Business, Aarhus University. His primary area of research is indirect tax law with an emphasis on European VAT law, and he has a PhD in European VAT Law. Henrik Stensgaard teaches VAT law to students and practitioners and is Director of study at the LLM in VAT and Indirect Taxes at Aarhus School of Business, Aarhus University.

David Stevens is Partner, Middle East Indirect Taxes Leader, PricewaterhouseCoopers. David has had 15 years experience in tax and economic reform policy advice. He has been engaged by the Hong Kong, Australian, Singaporean, and other foreign governments, multilateral organizations, business associations and multinational corporations on international tax strategy and policy issues. Email: David.Stevens@ae.pwc.com.

Karolina Tetlak is a PhD candidate in tax law at the University of Warsaw and the winner of the European Academic Tax Thesis Award 2007. She graduated from the LL.M. program in taxation at Harvard Law School.

Edoardo Traversa is Professor of Tax Law at the Law Faculty of the Catholic University of Louvain (Belgium). He holds a joint Ph. D. from the Universities of Louvain (Belgium) and Bologna (Italy). His research areas include European and international tax law, both direct and indirect. He is also member of the Brussels Bar, practising at the Liedekerke law firm.

Prof. Dr Michael Tumpel is a Professor of Tax Management at the Johannes Kepler University in Linz, Austria and Member of the SFB International Tax Coordination.

Ad van Doesum is assistant professor at the Fiscal Institute Tilburg of Tilburg University and Tax Advisor with PricewaterhouseCoopers N.V.

Dr Gert-Jan van Norden is assistant professor at the Fiscal Institute Tilburg of Tilburg University and Tax Advisor with KPMG Meijburg & Co.

Axel A. Verstraeten received a law degree, with a specialization in tax law, from the University of Buenos Aires (2004). He received an LL.M. in International Taxation from University of Florida (2008). Currently, he works as an associate for the Tax Department at Hope, Duggan & Silva (Buenos Aires) and teaches tax law at the University of Buenos Aires.

Carsten Vesterø is head of division in the legal service of the Danish Central Tax Administration. He is responsible for personal income taxation including tax liability, double taxation and taxation of pension schemes. Carsten holds a PhD in Public Administration.

Francesca Vitale earned her Ph.D. in Company Tax Law at the LUISS University of Rome. She currently works as a tax official at the Italian Revenue Agency (Central Directorate for Tax Legislation and Litigation - International Taxation Office), dealing with cross-border aspects of both income taxes and VAT.

Christophe Waerzeggers is a lecturer at Utrecht University in the Netherlands, where he teaches VAT in the Law School's Tax Master Program, and Consumption and Trade Taxes in the Tax Governance Program. Mr Waerzeggers is also a technical expert for the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank and DFID on tax law drafting in the areas of VAT, excise taxes and customs law.

Dr Michael Walpole is an Associate Professor in the Australian School of Taxation (ATAX) and the Associate Dean (Education) in the Faculty of Law at the University of New South Wales. Originally a Zimbabwean, Dr Walpole saw the introduction of the South African Value Added Tax as a practitioner (Ernst & Young) in South Africa and, having emigrated, he was involved in Senate hearings in Australia on aspects of the introduction of the Australian version of VAT (called GST) in 1999. Dr Walpole has been a tax academic since 1991 and has written widely on a number of tax research matters including Value Added Tax, taxation compliance costs, and taxation of intangibles. In 2008 he was an Academic Visitor, Faculty of Law, Oxford, and a Visitor at the Oxford Centre for Business Tax and the Vienna University of Economics and Business Institute of International Law and Taxation.

Felipe Yañez, born in 1972, in Santiago de Chile. Graduated from the Universidad de Chile and Master in Tax Law from the Universität zu Köln in Germany. Lecturer of Tax Law and in the Master in Enterprise Law Program at Universidad de los Andes, in Santiago, Chile. Lecturer in the Master and Management Program at the Universidad Católica de Valparaíso. Member of the Chilean Institute of Tax Law and of the IFA – Chilean Section. Attorney at Allende, Bascuñán y Cía. Attorneys-at-Law.