# Table of Contents

Abstract

Acknowledgements

List of Figures and Tables

Note

Abbreviations

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1. Research objectives
1.2. Thesis outline and methodology

Chapter 2: The Tax-Trade Interface

2.1. Structural and theoretical differences
2.2. The work of the League of Nations 1920-1946
2.3. The work of the United Nations 1946-1956: The International Trade Organization and the Fiscal Commission
2.3.1. The ITO’s tax provisions
2.3.2. Concluding remarks on the ITO
2.4. The GATT 1947 and the OEEC
2.4.1. Inherent ambiguities
2.4.2. The GATT 1947 and the avoidance of double taxation
2.4.3. Institutional divergence
2.5. Conclusion

Chapter 3: The WTO and Taxation: Preliminary Observations

3.1. The legal ambit of the WTO rules
3.1.1. The absence of direct effect
3.1.1.1. The European Union
3.1.1.2. The United States and the North Atlantic Free Trade Agreement
### Table of Contents

3.1.2. Access to the WTO dispute settlement process 34
3.1.3. Notification and surveillance procedures 35
3.2. A survey of the WTO tax cases 36
3.3. Conclusion 39

**Chapter 4: The WTO Tax Rules: Goods** 41

4.1. The concept of tax in the GATT 42
4.1.1. The GATT 1994: Definitional absence 43
4.1.2. The problematic nature of the direct-indirect tax distinction 46
4.2. Most-favoured nation (article I) 51
4.2.1. The concept of “likeness” 52
4.2.2. Traditional trade taxes 53
4.2.3. Indirect taxation 54
4.2.4. Direct taxation 54
4.3. National treatment (article III) 57
4.3.1. Indirect taxation 60
4.3.2. Direct taxation 62
4.3.2.1. A narrow interpretation 62
4.3.2.2. A broader interpretation 65
4.3.2.3. GATT/WTO case law on direct taxes 69
4.4. Fees and formalities (article VIII) 75
4.5. An exclusionary or inclusionary approach to direct tax measures? 77
4.5.1. An exclusionary approach 78
4.5.2. An inclusionary approach 79
4.6. The GATT and tax treaties 80
4.6.1. The rejection of MFN 81
4.6.2. Competing concepts of neutrality 86
4.6.3. Non-discrimination (article 24) and national treatment 88
4.6.3.1. The OECD and non-discrimination 91
4.6.4. The case for a tax treaty carve-out 94
4.7. Customs valuation rules and transfer pricing 96
4.8. Export taxes 98
4.9. Conclusion 102

**Chapter 5: The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies I** 105

5.1. The SCM Agreement 105
5.1.1. The definition of a subsidy 106
## Table of Contents

5.1.2.1. Article 3.1(a) export contingent subsidies .......................................... 109  
5.1.2.2. Article 3.1(b) import substitution subsidies ........................................ 112  
5.1.3. Actionable subsidies ...................................................................................... 113  
5.1.4. Non-actionable subsidies .............................................................................. 115  
5.1.5. The absence of exceptions ........................................................................... 116  
5.1.6. Notification and transparency .................................................................... 117  
5.2. Overview of the subsidy rules ........................................................................ 118  

**Chapter 6: The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies II** .................................................. 121  
6.1. The *US – DISC* and *US – FSC* litigation ..................................................... 121  
6.2. The 1976 *US – DISC* dispute ........................................................................ 121  
6.2.1. The *US – DISC* background ..................................................................... 122  
6.2.2. The *US – DISC* complaint ....................................................................... 123  
6.2.3. The European complaints .......................................................................... 124  
6.2.4. Failings of the *US – DISC* and European rulings ...................................... 125  
6.2.4.1. Judicial failings ....................................................................................... 125  
6.2.4.2. Procedural failings ................................................................................. 128  
6.2.4.3. Compliance failings and the 1981 Understanding ...................................... 129  
6.2.5. Concluding remarks on the *DISC* dispute ............................................... 132  
6.3. The *US – FSC* dispute: The FSC, the ETI and the AJCA tax breaks .............. 132  
6.3.1. The FSC .................................................................................................. 134  
6.3.1.1. US complaints against European tax practices ....................................... 135  
6.3.2. The ETI .................................................................................................. 135  
6.3.3. Arbitration ruling ....................................................................................... 136  
6.3.4. The AJCA ................................................................................................. 137  
6.3.5. Procedural issues ....................................................................................... 138  
6.3.5.1. Panel expertise ...................................................................................... 138  
6.3.5.2. Footnote 59: Appropriate tax forum ....................................................... 139  
6.3.5.3. Availability of evidence .......................................................................... 141  
6.3.6. Interpretative issues .................................................................................... 143  
6.3.6.1. Defining a subsidy .................................................................................. 143  
6.3.6.2. The legal status of the 1981 Understanding .............................................. 145  
6.3.6.3. Footnote 59 and “foreign-source income” ............................................... 146  
6.3.6.4. Footnote 59, double taxation and tax treaties ........................................ 147  
6.3.6.5. Footnote 59 and transfer pricing ............................................................. 149  
6.3.7. Broader issues ............................................................................................ 150  
6.3.7.1. Territorial versus worldwide tax systems ................................................ 150  
6.3.7.2. BTAs ..................................................................................................... 153  
6.3.8. The IC-DISC: The last US export subsidy? ................................................. 155  
6.4. Conclusion ...................................................................................................... 158
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 7: The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies III

7.1. Case study: The compatibility of FTZs
7.1.1. Features of FTZs
7.1.2. Challenges to FTZs
7.1.3. The OECD response to FTZs
7.2. The compatibility of FTZs with the WTO rules
7.2.1. Special and differential treatment
7.2.2. When is an FTZ safe from WTO action?
7.2.3. A brief note on the GATT and GATS
7.2.4. Recommendations for FTZs
7.3. Conclusion

## Chapter 8: The WTO Tax Rules: Services

8.1. The concept of tax in the GATS
8.2. The definition of services and service providers
8.3. Most-favoured nation
8.3.1. MFN exemptions
8.3.2. Article XIV(e) tax treaty exception
8.4. National treatment
8.4.1. Tax limitations to national treatment
8.4.2. National treatment tax exceptions
8.4.2.1. Article XIV(d) direct taxes exception
8.4.2.2. Article XXII:3 tax treaty exception
8.5. Article XIV *chapeau*
8.6. Tax violations under the GATS
8.6.1. Indirect taxation
8.6.2. Direct taxation
8.7. Services and subsidies
8.8. The OECD’s harmful tax competition project
8.9. Double taxation of indirect taxes and tax treaties
8.10. Conclusion

## Chapter 9: The WTO and International Tax Law: Resolving Conflicts

9.1. Legal clashes
9.1.1. Conflict clauses in the WTO agreements
9.1.2. Conflict clauses in tax treaties
9.1.2.1. OECD Model Tax Convention
9.1.2.2. Individual Member States’ tax treaties
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1.3. The application of public international law</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.3.1. The application of the <em>lex posterior</em> rule</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.3.2. The application of the <em>lex specialis</em> rule</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.3.3. The concept of self-contained regimes</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2. Conclusion</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 10: Recommendations</strong></td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1. Defining the WTO’s role</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2. Key findings: Failings and ambiguities</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1. Textual failings</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2. Adjudicative failings</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.3. Institutional failings</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3. Recommendations for coordination and clarification</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1. Option A: “Do nothing”</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2. Option B: Improve the existing WTO tax provisions</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2.1. Changes to the legal texts</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2.2. Supplementary guidance</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3. Option C: A Committee on Trade and Tax</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.4. Option D: Institutional dialogue</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.5. Option E: A WTO agreement on taxation</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.6. Option F: The creation of a global tax body</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.7. Option G: The WTO as an “international tax organization”</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4. The pragmatic approach</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 11: Recapitulation</strong></td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table of GATT/WTO Cases

Bibliography

Appendix  The Tax Cases of the GATT 1947 and the World Trade Organization