

---

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract</b>		v
<b>Acknowledgements</b>		vii
<b>List of Figures and Tables</b>		ix
<b>Note</b>		xi
<b>Abbreviations</b>		xiii
<b>Chapter 1:</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
1.1.	Research objectives	4
1.2.	Thesis outline and methodology	5
<b>Chapter 2:</b>	<b>The Tax-Trade Interface</b>	7
2.1.	Structural and theoretical differences	7
2.2.	The work of the League of Nations 1920-1946	11
2.3.	The work of the United Nations 1946-1956: The International Trade Organization and the Fiscal Commission	15
2.3.1.	The ITO's tax provisions	16
2.3.2.	Concluding remarks on the ITO	22
2.4.	The GATT 1947 and the OEEC	23
2.4.1.	Inherent ambiguities	23
2.4.2.	The GATT 1947 and the avoidance of double taxation	24
2.4.3.	Institutional divergence	25
2.5.	Conclusion	27
<b>Chapter 3:</b>	<b>The WTO and Taxation: Preliminary Observations</b>	29
3.1.	The legal ambit of the WTO rules	29
3.1.1.	The absence of direct effect	30
3.1.1.1.	The European Union	30
3.1.1.2.	The United States and the North Atlantic Free Trade Agreement	32

## Table of Contents

---

3.1.2.	Access to the WTO dispute settlement process	34
3.1.3.	Notification and surveillance procedures	35
3.2.	A survey of the WTO tax cases	36
3.3.	Conclusion	39
<b>Chapter 4:</b>	<b>The WTO Tax Rules: Goods</b>	<b>41</b>
4.1.	The concept of tax in the GATT	42
4.1.1.	The GATT 1994: Definitional absence	43
4.1.2.	The problematic nature of the direct-indirect tax distinction	46
4.2.	Most-favoured nation (article I)	51
4.2.1.	The concept of “likeness”	52
4.2.2.	Traditional trade taxes	53
4.2.3.	Indirect taxation	54
4.2.4.	Direct taxation	54
4.3.	National treatment (article III)	57
4.3.1.	Indirect taxation	60
4.3.2.	Direct taxation	62
4.3.2.1.	A narrow interpretation	62
4.3.2.2.	A broader interpretation	65
4.3.2.3.	GATT/WTO case law on direct taxes	69
4.4.	Fees and formalities (article VIII)	75
4.5.	An exclusionary or inclusionary approach to direct tax measures?	77
4.5.1.	An exclusionary approach	78
4.5.2.	An inclusionary approach	79
4.6.	The GATT and tax treaties	80
4.6.1.	The rejection of MFN	81
4.6.2.	Competing concepts of neutrality	86
4.6.3.	Non-discrimination (article 24) and national treatment	88
4.6.3.1.	The OECD and non-discrimination	91
4.6.4.	The case for a tax treaty carve-out	94
4.7.	Customs valuation rules and transfer pricing	96
4.8.	Export taxes	98
4.9.	Conclusion	102
<b>Chapter 5:</b>	<b>The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies I</b>	<b>105</b>
5.1.	The SCM Agreement	105
5.1.1.	The definition of a subsidy	106

5.1.2.1.	Article 3.1(a) export contingent subsidies	109
5.1.2.2.	Article 3.1(b) import substitution subsidies	112
5.1.3.	Actionable subsidies	113
5.1.4.	Non-actionable subsidies	115
5.1.5.	The absence of exceptions	116
5.1.6.	Notification and transparency	117
5.2.	Overview of the subsidy rules	118
<b>Chapter 6: The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies II</b>		121
6.1.	The <i>US – DISC</i> and <i>US – FSC</i> litigation	121
6.2.	The 1976 <i>US – DISC</i> dispute	121
6.2.1.	The <i>US – DISC</i> background	122
6.2.2.	The <i>US – DISC</i> complaint	123
6.2.3.	The European complaints	124
6.2.4.	Failings of the <i>US – DISC</i> and European rulings	125
6.2.4.1.	Judicial failings	125
6.2.4.2.	Procedural failings	128
6.2.4.3.	Compliance failings and the 1981 Understanding	129
6.2.5.	Concluding remarks on the <i>DISC</i> dispute	132
6.3.	The <i>US – FSC</i> dispute: The FSC, the ETI and the AJCA tax breaks	132
6.3.1.	The FSC	134
6.3.1.1.	US complaints against European tax practices	135
6.3.2.	The ETI	135
6.3.3.	Arbitration ruling	136
6.3.4.	The AJCA	137
6.3.5.	Procedural issues	138
6.3.5.1.	Panel expertise	138
6.3.5.2.	Footnote 59: Appropriate tax forum	139
6.3.5.3.	Availability of evidence	141
6.3.6.	Interpretative issues	143
6.3.6.1.	Defining a subsidy	143
6.3.6.2.	The legal status of the 1981 Understanding	145
6.3.6.3.	Footnote 59 and “foreign-source income”	146
6.3.6.4.	Footnote 59, double taxation and tax treaties	147
6.3.6.5.	Footnote 59 and transfer pricing	149
6.3.7.	Broader issues	150
6.3.7.1.	Territorial versus worldwide tax systems	150
6.3.7.2.	BTAs	153
6.3.8.	The IC-DISC: The last US export subsidy?	155
6.4.	Conclusion	158

## Table of Contents

---

<b>Chapter 7: The WTO Tax Rules: Subsidies III</b>	161
7.1. Case study: The compatibility of FTZs	161
7.1.1. Features of FTZs	161
7.1.2. Challenges to FTZs	163
7.1.3. The OECD response to FTZs	166
7.2. The compatibility of FTZs with the WTO rules	169
7.2.1. Special and differential treatment	172
7.2.2. When is an FTZ safe from WTO action?	173
7.2.3. A brief note on the GATT and GATS	175
7.2.4. Recommendations for FTZs	177
7.3. Conclusion	178
<b>Chapter 8: The WTO Tax Rules: Services</b>	181
8.1. The concept of tax in the GATS	181
8.2. The definition of services and service providers	182
8.3. Most-favoured nation	183
8.3.1. MFN exemptions	184
8.3.2. Article XIV(e) tax treaty exception	186
8.4. National treatment	188
8.4.1. Tax limitations to national treatment	189
8.4.2. National treatment tax exceptions	190
8.4.2.1. Article XIV(d) direct taxes exception	192
8.4.2.2. Article XXII:3 tax treaty exception	194
8.5. Article XIV <i>chapeau</i>	196
8.6. Tax violations under the GATS	197
8.6.1. Indirect taxation	197
8.6.2. Direct taxation	198
8.7. Services and subsidies	200
8.8. The OECD's harmful tax competition project	201
8.9. Double taxation of indirect taxes and tax treaties	203
8.10. Conclusion	205
<b>Chapter 9: The WTO and International Tax Law: Resolving Conflicts</b>	207
9.1. Legal clashes	207
9.1.1. Conflict clauses in the WTO agreements	207
9.1.2. Conflict clauses in tax treaties	209
9.1.2.1. OECD Model Tax Convention	210
9.1.2.2. Individual Member States' tax treaties	211

9.1.3.	The application of public international law	213
9.1.3.1.	The application of the <i>lex posterior</i> rule	215
9.1.3.2.	The application of the <i>lex specialis</i> rule	217
9.1.3.3.	The concept of self-contained regimes	219
9.2.	Conclusion	222
<b>Chapter 10:</b>	<b>Recommendations</b>	<b>223</b>
10.1.	Defining the WTO's role	223
10.2.	Key findings: Failings and ambiguities	225
10.2.1.	Textual failings	226
10.2.2.	Adjudicative failings	227
10.2.3.	Institutional failings	227
10.3.	Recommendations for coordination and clarification	227
10.3.1.	Option A: "Do nothing"	228
10.3.2.	Option B: Improve the existing WTO tax provisions	229
10.3.2.1.	Changes to the legal texts	229
10.3.2.2.	Supplementary guidance	230
10.3.3.	Option C: A Committee on Trade and Tax	231
10.3.4.	Option D: Institutional dialogue	231
10.3.5.	Option E: A WTO agreement on taxation	233
10.3.6.	Option F: The creation of a global tax body	236
10.3.7.	Option G: The WTO as an "international tax organization"	239
10.4.	The pragmatic approach	243
<b>Chapter 11:</b>	<b>Recapitulation</b>	<b>245</b>
<b>Table of GATT/WTO Cases</b>		<b>249</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>		<b>255</b>
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>The Tax Cases of the GATT 1947 and the World Trade Organization</b>	<b>289</b>