# Table of Contents

**Preface**

**Part I**

The Effect of Bilateral Tax Treaties on Economic Growth

**The Relationship between Double Taxation Treaties and Foreign Direct Investment**

*Fabian Barthel, Matthias Busse, Richard Krever and Eric Neumayer*

1. Introduction 3
2. Treaties as motivation for FDI 4
   2.1. The attraction of treaties for host countries 4
   2.2. The attraction of treaties for investors 6
3. Previous studies 7
4. The methodology 10
5. The findings 13
6. The provisos 14
7. What explains the findings? 15
8. Conclusion 17
Appendix 18

**Part II**

Treaty Shopping and Avoidance of Abuse

**Rethinking Treaty Shopping: Lessons for the European Union**

*Reuven S. Avi-Yonah and Christiana HJI Panayi*

1. Introduction 21
2. Treaty shopping and improper use of tax treaties 21
   2.1. Finding the contours of treaty shopping 21
   2.2. Theoretical objections to treaty shopping 25
3. Responses to treaty shopping: The OECD and the United States 30
   3.1. The OECD approach to treaty shopping 30
# Table of Contents

3.2. The US approach to treaty shopping 41  
4. Treaty shopping and EU law 44  
5. Conclusion 49  

**Treaty Shopping and Avoidance of Abuse**  
*Niels Bammens and Luc De Broe*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The relationship between anti-avoidance provisions and foreign direct investment</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Domestic anti-avoidance measures and economic substance</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Limitation-on-benefits clauses in tax treaties</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The beneficial ownership requirement in tax treaties</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Cost-benefit analysis of anti-avoidance measures</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conclusion</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Responses to Treaty Shopping: A Comparative Evaluation**  
*David G. Duff*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Treaty shopping</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Treaty interpretation</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Residence</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Liable to tax by reason of domicile, residence, place of management or any other criterion of a similar nature</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. Place of effective management</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Beneficial ownership</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Inherent anti-abuse principle</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Anti-avoidance rules</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Domestic rules</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Treaty rules</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The Influence of Public Institutions on the Shadow Economy: An Empirical Investigation for OECD Countries**  
*Friedrich Schneider*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Some theoretical considerations on the shadow economy</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.1. Defining the shadow economy 103  
2.2. Measuring the shadow economy 106  
2.3. The main causes of the shadow economy 109  
   2.3.1. Tax and social security contribution burdens 109  
   2.3.2. Intensity of regulations 110  
   2.3.3. Public sector services 111  
   2.3.4. Other public institutions 112  
   2.3.5. Summary of the main causes of the shadow economy 113  
3. Estimation and calculation of the size of the shadow economies in OECD countries 114  
   3.1. Econometric estimation 114  
   3.2. Size and development of the shadow economy in 21 OECD countries 117  
4. Summary and policy conclusion 120  
   4.1. Policy measures 120  
   4.2. Conclusions 121  
5. Appendix: The MIMIC estimation procedure, its advantages and disadvantages 122  
   5.1. MIMIC model 122  
   5.2. Application of the MIMIC procedure 124  
   5.3. Advantages and disadvantages of the MIMIC estimates of the shadow economy 125  
       5.3.1. Advantages 125  
       5.3.2. Disadvantages 126  

The 2003 Revisions to the Commentary to the OECD Model on Tax Treaties and GAARS: A Mistaken Starting Point  
Juan José Zornoza Pérez and Andrés Báez  
1. Introduction: scope and structure of the article 129  
2. The factual approach to GAARS: A technical mistake and a misleading starting point 132  
   2.1. The factual approach is ambiguous 132  
   2.2. The factual approach is a goal-oriented reasoning 133  
   2.3. Factual approach and widening of the concept of sham: A risk in certain jurisdictions 135  
3. Legal approach to GAARS: The need to add nuances 138  
   3.1. Nature and limits of interpretation 139  
   3.2. Combating intended avoidance: The case of attribution 143  
   3.3. Real avoidance cases 150
Table of Contents

4. The guiding principle: A critical analysis of its components according to legal theory and European Community Law 153
   4.1. Main purpose of the transaction 153
   4.2. Tax treatment contrary to the object and purpose of the relevant provisions of the treaty 155

Part III
International Allocation of Cross Border Business Profits: Arm’s Length Principle

Tax Competition and International Tax Agreements:
Lessons from Economic Theory
Wolfgang Eggert, Jun-ichi Itaya and Hannes Winner

1. Introduction 161
2. Corporate tax burden in the European Union 162
3. Mechanisms in tax competition 167
   3.1. A non-cooperative game 167
   3.2. Pareto-efficient taxation and a participation constraint 170
   3.3. Dilemmas 172
4. Corporate tax harmonization in the European Union 173
5. Explaining co-operation in tax policy 176
   5.1. Repeated play 176
   5.2. Renegotiation 178
6. Conclusions 180

Supplementing Consolidation and Apportionment with Anti-Abuse Provisions
Marcel Gérard and Edoardo Traversa

1. Introduction 183
2. The economic argument 184
   2.1. Separate Accounting 185
   2.2. Consolidation and Formulary Apportionment in the three countries 187
   2.3. Consolidation and Formulary Apportionment and the Enhanced Cooperation Agreement 188
   2.4. Consolidation and Formulary Apportionment, Enhanced Cooperation and supplementary measures 189
## Table of Contents

2.5. Tentative conclusion 190  
3. Legal analysis of the proposed reform 190  
3.1. Territoriality 192  
3.2. Anti-abuse measures in the relations between countries with Consolidation and Formulary Apportionment 194  
3.3. The relations between Consolidated and Formulary Apportionment countries and (non-EU) third countries 195  
3.3.1. Denying exemption of foreign income from low-tax jurisdictions/switch from exemption to credit 195  
3.3.2. CFC legislation and anti-abuse measures aimed at disregarding capital outflows to third countries 197  
3.4. The relations between C&FA countries and other EU Member States 202  
4. Conclusion 205  
Appendix 205  

### Part IV  
Source versus Residence  

**The Potential of Multilateral Tax Treaties**  
*Kim Brooks*

1. The rich literature supporting multilateralism 211  
2. Possible approaches to improving tax coordination: The road to multilateralism 213  
3. The advantages of multilateral tax treaties 218  
3.1. Advantages in facilitating trade 220  
3.2. Advantages in preventing or reducing evasion and avoidance 221  
3.3. Administrative advantages 223  
3.4. Potential for preventing tax competition 225  
3.5. Potential disadvantages 226  
4. Potential of the CARICOM multilateral double taxation agreement 227  
4.1. Brief review of the history and design of the CARICOM treaty 229  
4.2. Advantages in facilitating trade 232  
4.3. Advantages in preventing or reducing evasion and avoidance 232
## Table of Contents

4.4. Administrative advantages  
4.5. Potential for preventing tax competition  
5. The importance of some form of multilateralism  

**Legal and Economic Principles Support an Origin and Import Neutrality-Based over a Residence and Export Neutrality-Based Tax Treaty Policy**  
*Eric C.C.M. Kemmeren*

1. Introduction  
2. Rationale tax treaties  
3. Legal principles for allocation of tax jurisdiction in tax treaties  
   3.1. General  
   3.2. Economic relationship with a state  
   3.3. Sufficient economic relationship  
      3.3.1. Qualitative principles  
         3.3.1.1. Nationality or citizenship  
         3.3.1.2. Incorporation or real seat  
         3.3.1.3. Domicile or residence  
         3.3.1.4. Source  
         3.3.1.5. Origin  
            3.3.1.5.1. Income and capital gains tax  
            3.3.1.5.2. Net wealth tax: Economic location  
         3.3.1.6. Functionality  
      3.3.2. Quantitative principles  
         3.3.2.1. Universality principle  
         3.3.2.2. Territoriality principle  
   3.4. Interim conclusions  
4. Economic principles for allocation of tax jurisdiction in tax treaties  
   4.1. General  
   4.2. Capital and labour export neutrality versus capital and labour import neutrality  
   4.3. Neutrality and direct investments  
   4.4. Neutrality and portfolio investments  
   4.5. Neutrality and operational leases  
   4.6. Neutrality and labour  
   4.7. Interim conclusions  
5. Summary and conclusions
## Part V
Credit versus Exemption

### Credit versus Exemption under Domestic Tax Law and Treaties
*Guglielmo Maisto*

1. Defining credit and exemption methods 319
   1.1. Classification of credit systems 320
   1.2. Classification of exemption countries 322
2. International tax policy aspects of credit and exemption 323
   2.1. Credit and exemption in the light of the different approaches to neutrality of tax systems 323
   2.2. Credit and exemption in recent studies and legislative proposals worldwide 326
3. Constitutional aspects of credit and exemption 329
   3.1. Constitutional principles that may be significant with regard to credit and exemption 330
   3.2. Whether constitutional principles require a state to give relief from international double taxation and/or imply a preference for credit or for exemption 331
4. History of tax treaties with regard to credit and exemption 333
5. Further studies carried out at the OECD level with regard to credit and exemption 340
6. The OECD Model Convention and its Commentaries 341
   6.1. The OECD Model Convention 341
   6.2. The OECD Commentaries on the Model Convention: When it is appropriate to limit the scope of the exemption? 343
   6.3. The OECD Commentaries on the Model Convention: When it is appropriate to limit the scope of the credit? 345
   6.4. Conclusion 346
7. Credit and exemption in tax treaty negotiation 348
   7.1. The tax treaty policy of credit or exemption countries in terms of relief method 348
   7.2. Do countries deviate from their tax treaty policy in terms of relief method when negotiating with a country that has an opposite treaty policy? 351
     7.2.1. Countries that have a credit treaty policy: Empirical evidence 352
     7.2.2. Countries that have an exemption treaty policy: Empirical evidence 353
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.3. Recent economic studies with regard to countries’ behaviour in tax treaty negotiation</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Credit and exemption and the principle of <em>non-aggravation</em> by tax treaties</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. WTO aspects of credit and exemption</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Rethinking Foreign Tax Creditability**  
*Daniel Shaviro*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The case against allowing foreign tax credits</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Global welfare, unilateral national welfare, and cooperative national welfare</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Evaluating the foreign tax credit from a unilateral national welfare perspective</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Why is the desirability of offering foreign tax credits so widely accepted?</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Aversion to “Double Taxation”</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Foreign tax credits as a tool for advancing worldwide efficiency</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Elimination of Double Taxation and Tax Deferral:**  
*The Example of the Merger Directive*  
*Domingo J. Jiménez-Valladolid de L’Hotellerie-Fallois*  
and *Félix Alberto Vega Borrego*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Tax consequences of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment under the OECD Model Convention</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tax consequences of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment under the Merger Directive</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Overview of the tax regime envisaged in the Merger Directive in respect of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Application of the exemption method</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Application of the credit method</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1. The scope of the derogation provided by Art. 10(2) of the Merger Directive</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table of Contents

3.3.2. Is the ordinary tax credit permissible under Art. 10(2) of the Merger Directive? 394
3.3.3. The calculation of the notional tax credit 395
4. The taxation of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment under Spanish law 398
4.1. The taxation of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment in Spanish domestic law when the special tax regime implementing the Merger Directive is not applicable 398
4.2. The taxation of the contribution of a foreign permanent establishment in Spanish domestic law when the special tax regime implementing the Merger Directive is applicable 402
5. Concluding remarks 408

#### Part VI
Tax Treaties and Developing Countries

**Tax Treaties with Developing Countries: A Plea for New Allocation Rules and a Combined Legal and Economic Approach**  
*Pasquale Pistone*

1. Starting point and subject 413
2. Economic theories and the legal dimension: the need for a combined approach 416
3. Looking backwards: a few selected remarks on tax jurisdiction from past to present 420
4. Rethinking the allocation of taxing powers in tax treaties with developing countries 424
4.1. Why still conclude a tax treaty? 428
4.2. For a new balance in the allocation of taxing powers 429
4.3. Some ideas for shifting to exclusive allocation of taxing powers in tax treaties according to the category of income 431
5. Conclusions 437
# Table of Contents

## Tax Treaties and Developing Countries

*Victor Thuronyi*

1. Developing a treaty strategy 441  
2. Unilateral measures 445  
3. A “light” treaty 450  
4. Conclusion 455

## Part VII

**Tax Treaty Application: Cross Border Administrative Issues**  
(Including Exchange of Information, Collection of Taxes, Dispute Settlement, Legal Certainty in Tax Treaty Application)

### Arbitration of Unresolved Issues in Mutual Agreement Cases:  
*The New Para. 5, Art. 25 of the OECD Model Convention, a Multi-Tiered Dispute Resolution Clause*

*Carlo Garbarino and Marina Lombardo*

1. Introductory remarks on the arbitration method in international tax matters 459  
2. The evolution of international tax arbitration 462  
3. The procedure of the tax arbitration of Art. 25(5) of the OECD Model Convention 467  
4. The effectiveness of the tax treaty arbitration of Art. 25(5) of the OECD Model Convention 474

### Identifying the New International Standard for Effective Information Exchange

*Michael J. McIntyre*

1. Introduction 481  
2. The emerging standard of *effective* information exchange 484  
3. The OECD and its lapse of leadership on effective information exchange 493  
4. A proposed Model TIEA 500  
5. Concluding comments 504  
Appendix – A Model Effective Tax Information Exchange Agreement 505
## Tax Treaty Application – Cross-Border Administrative Issues

*D.P. Sengupta*

1. Introduction 517  
   1.1. Exchange of information 517  
   1.2. Need for information 517  
   1.3. Difficulty in collecting taxes 518  
   1.4. Mutual agreement procedure 518  
   1.5. Dispute resolution 518  
   1.6. Conclusion 519

2. Exchange of information 519  
   2.1. Need for information 519  
   2.2. Difficulty in obtaining information 521  
   2.3. Inherent weaknesses in Exchange of Information (EOI) article 523  
   2.4. Domestic law of India 524  
   2.5. EOI with Mauritius 526  
   2.6. EOI with Singapore 529  
   2.7. EOI with United Arab Emirates (UAE) 530  
   2.8. EOI with Switzerland 532  
   2.9. EOI with the United Kingdom (UK) 533  
   2.10. EOI with the United States 534  
   2.11. Spontaneous and automatic information 536

3. Assistance in collection 537

4. Mutual agreement procedure (MAP) 539

5. Dispute resolution 541  
   5.1. Authority for Advance Ruling (AAR) 541  
   5.2. Dispute Resolution Panel (DRP) 544

6. Conclusion 546

---

## Tax Treaty Application: Cross-Border Administrative Issues  
(Including Exchange of Information, Collection of Taxes, Dispute Settlement and Legal Certainty in Tax Treaty Application)

*Martin Wenz, Alexander Linn, Bernhard Brielmaier and Matthias Langer*

1. Introduction 547

2. Recent developments in international tax cooperation 551  
   2.1. Unilateral international tax cooperation 551  
   2.2. Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties 551
Table of Contents

2.3. Tax Information Exchange Agreements 552
2.4. Double Taxation Conventions 553
2.5. Multilateral and supranational arrangements 555
2.6. Other methods of international tax cooperation 556
3. Bilateral agreements: Liechtenstein 557
   3.1. Mutual legal assistance treaty 557
   3.2. Tax information exchange agreements 559
   3.3. Double taxation conventions 561
4. Multilateral agreements: Liechtenstein 562
   4.1. Schengen-Dublin Agreement 562
   4.2. EU Anti-Fraud Agreement 563
   4.3. EU Savings Agreement 564
5. Effects of tax cooperation agreements 565
   5.1. Legal certainty 565
   5.2. Source versus residence 566
   5.3. Level playing field of tax competition 568
      5.3.1. Economic models of tax non-compliance 569
      5.3.2. Economic models of tax competition 570
      5.3.3. Economic effects of TIEAs and DTCs 572
6. Discussion and developments 575
7. Conclusion 577

Part VIII
International Tax Neutrality and Non-discrimination

On the Relationship between International Tax Neutrality and Non-Discrimination Clauses under Tax Treaties for Source-Based Taxes
Catherine Brown and Jack Mintz

1. Introduction 581
2. The existing system and neutrality 584
   2.1. Tax neutrality 591
3. Non-discrimination and the OECD Model Treaty 593
   3.1. Non-discrimination and the taxation of resident, national or foreign-owned enterprises (investments) 595
   3.2. Non-discrimination and the taxation of Permanent Establishments (PEs) 596
   3.3. Non-discrimination and the taxation of non-residents (including foreign-owned enterprises) 598
# Table of Contents

4. Is there a relationship between non-discrimination in the OECD treaty and international tax neutrality?  599  
4.1. What should the non-discrimination article include?  600  
5. Conclusions  605

---

**International Tax Neutrality and Non-Discrimination: Plea for a More Explicit Dialogue between the State and the Market**  
*Cees Peters*

1. Introduction  607  
2. The intermediary state  607  
3. Inter-nations equity  609  
3. International tax neutrality  611  
3.1. The rationale for international tax neutrality  611  
3.2. The relationship between (international) tax neutrality, efficiency and equity  614  
3.2.1. Introduction  614  
3.2.2. Metaphorical explanation  614  
3.2.3. Illustration by means of the discussion concerning the concept of inter-nations neutrality  617  
3.2.4. Implicit value judgements about the international political economy and the concept of international tax neutrality  620  
3.2.5. Conclusion about international tax neutrality  622  
4. The link between different concepts of international tax neutrality and inter-nations equity  624  
5. Conclusion  627

---

**International Tax Neutrality and Non-Discrimination – A Legal Perspective**  
*Alexander Rust*

1. Introduction  629  
2. Scope  629  
3. Consequences of a violation of the non-discrimination provisions and mode of operation  630  
4. Relationship between the distributive norms and the non-discrimination provision  632  
5. The non-discrimination provisions in detail  634  
5.1. Art. 24(1): Nationality non-discrimination provision  634

xix
# Table of Contents

5.2. Art. 24(2): Stateless persons 637  
5.3. Art. 24(3): Permanent establishment 638  
5.4. Art. 24(4): Deductibility 640  
5.5. Art. 24(5): Ownership 641  
6. Permissible distinctions 644  
7. Purpose of the non-discrimination article 646  
8. Necessary changes 647  

## Contributors

Contributors 651