Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

Foreword

Part One: Relationships between tax treaties and domestic law

Chapter 1: The domestic law perspective
Klaus Vogel

1.1. Tax treaties being leges speciales
1.2. Three ways of implementing international treaties
1.3. Constitutions binding the legislator to previous consent
1.4. Unwritten constitutional law binding the legislator
1.5. Extension to other States?

Chapter 2: The international law perspective
Jan Wouters and Maarten Vidal

2.1. Introduction
2.2. Relevance of Arts. 26 and 27 VCLT in the case of domestic law violation of treaty provisions
2.2.1. Irrelevance of municipal law
2.2.2. Legitimation of treaty overrides
2.3. International law remedies in the case of a domestic law violation
2.3.1. The position of the injured State
2.3.2. Redress through dispute settlement mechanisms
2.3.3. Redress through unilateral (re)action
2.4. Conclusion

Chapter 3: A tax treaty perspective: special issues
Jacques Sasseville

3.1. Introduction
3.2. Extending the international law obligations arising from tax treaties to the domestic law treatment of taxpayers
3.3. Can one tax treaty affect the application of other tax treaties?
3.4. Residence for purposes of a tax treaty and residence for purposes of domestic tax law
3.5. The saving clause
3.6. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse rules and treaties

Part Two: Real and apparent unresolved conflicts between treaties and domestic law
Chapter 4: Tax treaty overrides: a qualified defence of U.S. practice
*Reuven S. Avi-Yonah*

4.1. Introduction: The problem of treaty overrides
4.2. The VCLT and the OECD positions
4.3. The US position: Theory
4.4. The US position: Practice
4.5. Conclusion: A middle way

Chapter 5: The relationship between tax treaties and domestic anti-abuse measures
*Brian J. Arnold and Stef van Weeghel*

5.1. Introduction
5.2. Background
5.3. Overview of the 2003 revisions to the Commentary on Art. 1 regarding the relationship between tax treaties and tax avoidance
5.4. Comments on the 2003 changes to the Commentary on Article 1
5.4.1. Prevention of tax avoidance as a purpose
5.4.2. Factual approach versus denial of abusive effect
5.4.3. A guiding principle
5.4.4. Abuse of the convention versus abuse of domestic law
5.4.5. What if the treaty is silent about the relationship between tax treaties and domestic anti-avoidance rules?
5.4.6. Estoppel if no specific anti-abuse provision is included in the treaty?
5.4.7. Relevance of 2003 revisions for pre-2003 tax treaties
5.5. Relationship between tax treaties and domestic anti-abuse rules in selected countries
5.5.1. Introduction
5.5.2. Generic types of countries with respect to the relationship between tax treaties and domestic anti-abuse rules
5.5.2.1. Countries that have overridden their tax treaties
5.5.2.2. Countries in which later-in-time domestic laws prevail over prior tax treaties
5.5.2.3. Countries in which treaties prevail over inconsistent domestic tax laws
5.5.2.4. Countries that have entered observations on the Commentary on Art. 1
5.5.3. Netherlands
5.5.4. Canada

**Part Three: Specific issues**

Chapter 6: The interaction between tax treaty provisions and domestic law
*John F. Avery Jones*
6.1. Introduction
6.2. Article 3(2) of the OECD Model Convention
   6.2.1. Conflicts of qualification
   6.2.2. Cases not dealt with by the OECDs new approach
   6.2.2.1. Analysis
   6.2.2.2. Possible solution
   6.2.2.3. Further problem caused by Art. 8
   6.2.3. Other problems with Art. 3(2)
   6.3. Incomplete incorporation of the treaty into internal law
   6.4. Cases where the treaty treats non-residents better than residents
      6.4.1. Internal law residents who are non-resident for treaty purposes
      6.4.2. Cherry-picking
         6.4.2.1. Credit
         6.4.2.2. Source
         6.4.2.3. Inconsistent treatment of the same type of income
         6.4.2.4. Inconsistent treatment of different types of income
         6.4.2.5. Temporal inconsistency
         6.4.2.6. Inconsistent treatment of tax base and tax rate
         6.4.2.7. Status issues
         6.4.2.8. Conclusions on cherry-picking
      6.4.3. Non-discrimination
      6.4.4. Deductions in computing the profits of a permanent establishment
      6.4.5. Double non-taxation
   6.5. Conclusion

Part Four: Country surveys

Chapter 7: Austria
Daniela Hohenwarter

7.1. Introduction
7.2. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of Austrian law
   7.2.1. Incorporation of tax treaties into domestic law
   7.2.2. Direct applicability of tax treaties
   7.2.3. Status of tax treaties vis--vis domestic provisions
7.3. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaties
   7.3.1. References made by tax treaties to domestic law
      7.3.1.1. Autonomous treaty interpretation
      7.3.1.2. Dynamic references to domestic law
      7.3.1.3. Static references to domestic law
   7.3.2. References made by domestic law to tax treaties
7.4. Treaty override
   7.4.1. Legislative treaty override
   7.4.2. Judicial treaty override?
   7.4.3. Remedies for the non-breaching party
7.5. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties
7.5.1. General anti-abuse measures
7.5.1.1. Substance over form principle  Sec. 21 BAO
7.5.1.2. Abuse of law  Sec. 22 BAO
7.5.1.3. Sham transactions  Sec. 23 BAO
7.5.1.4. Attribution of assets  Sec. 24 BAO
7.5.2. Special anti-abuse measures
7.5.2.1. Switchover from exemption method to credit method Sec. 10 Para. 4 KStG
7.5.2.2. Refund of withholding tax on dividends Sec. 94 a Para. 2 no. 2 EStG
7.5.3. Application of domestic anti-abuse rules to tax treaties
7.5.3.1. Anti-abuse measures not in conformity with tax treaties
7.5.3.1.1. Sec. 22 BAO
7.5.3.1.2. Sec. 10 Para. 4 KStG
7.5.3.1.3. Sec. 94 a Para. 2 no. 2 EStG
7.5.4. Combating abuse by applying national rules referred to by tax treaties

Chapter 8: France
Nicolas Message

8.1. Introduction
8.2. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of laws
8.2.1. Hierarchy of sources of law
8.2.1.1. Hierarchy of sources of law in general
8.2.1.1.1. The Constitution
8.2.1.1.2. Treaties
8.2.1.1.3. Laws
8.2.1.1.4. Regulations
8.2.1.1.5. Administrative guidelines or circulars
8.2.1.1.6. Rulings
8.2.1.1.7. Jurisprudence
8.2.1.2. Implementation of international treaties into national law
8.2.1.2.1. Process of developing tax treaties
8.2.1.2.2. Process of implementation of tax treaties
8.2.2. Tax treaties versus non-tax treaties
8.3. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaties
8.3.1. References made by tax treaties to domestic law
8.3.1.1. Effect on the references laid down by tax treaties to domestic law
8.3.1.1.1. Determination of the meaning of a term not defined in a tax treaty
8.3.1.1.2. Definition of immovable property
8.3.1.1.3. Definition of dividends
8.3.1.2. Interaction between treaty and domestic law double taxation relief method
8.3.2. Application of general principles regarding the interaction of treaties and domestic law
8.3.2.1. First principle: The priority of domestic law in relation to treaties
8.3.2.2. Second principle: The pre-eminence of treaties over domestic law
8.3.2.3. Third principle: Independence of interpretation from that of foreign States
8.3.2.4. Fourth principle: Literal interpretation of tax treaties
8.3.2.5. Other important principles
8.4. Treaty override
8.5. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties
8.5.1. Anti-abuse provisions applied specifically in an international context
8.5.1.1. Thin capitalization rule: Sec. 212 FGTC
8.5.1.2. CFC legislation: Secs. 209B and 123 bis FGTC
8.5.1.3. Rent-a-star legislation: Sec. 155A FGTC
8.5.1.4. Interest paid to certain foreign persons: Sec. 238A FGTC
8.5.1.5. Transfer pricing provision: Sec. 57 FGTC
8.5.1.6. Transfers of assets to certain foreign persons: Sec. 238 bis O-I FGTC
8.5.1.7. Three per cent tax on real estate: Sec. 990D FGTC
8.5.2. Conflict between domestic anti-abuse rules and tax treaties
8.5.2.1. Identified potential conflict
8.5.2.1.1. Potential conflict with rules allocating the right to tax among contracting States
8.5.2.1.2. Potential conflict with nondiscrimination provisions
8.5.2.2. Resolution of the conflict
8.5.2.2.1. Renegotiation of treaties to include anti-avoidance legislation
8.5.2.2.2. Revamping domestic legislation
8.5.2.2.3. Other alternatives of the French tax authorities

Chapter 9: Germany
Alexander Rust

9.1. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of law 233
9.1.1. Hierarchy of sources of law 233
9.1.1.1. In general 233
9.1.1.2. Implementation of international treaties into domestic law
9.1.1.3. Status of international treaties vis--vis domestic provisions
9.1.2. Tax treaties versus non-tax treaties
9.2. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaty law
9.2.1. Reference made by tax treaties to internal law
9.2.2. Application of general principles regarding interaction of treaty and internal law
9.3. Treaty override
9.3.1. Legislative override
9.3.2. Treaty override and EC law
9.3.3. Judicial override
9.3.4. Remedies for the non-breaching party
9.4. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties

Chapter 10: Italy
Pietro Bracco
10.1. Introduction
10.1.1. Customary law (and general principles of law recognized by civilized nations)
10.1.2. International conventions
10.2. Rank of international conventions and the legislative aspects of treaty override
10.2.1. The past: Absence of constitutional guarantees for international conventions (prior to Constitutional Law No. 3/01)
10.2.1.1. Substantive view in favour of the superiority of treaties over domestic law
10.2.1.2. Formalistic view versus the superiority of treaties over domestic law
10.2.1.3. The view of the Italian Constitutional Court
10.2.2. The present: Observance of the constraints deriving from international obligations (Constitutional Law No. 3/01 in force)
10.2.3. Possible future: Repeal of observance of international obligations and consequent return to absence of constitutional guarantees for treaties (based on the constitutional reform not yet in force)
10.2.3.1. Parliamentary procedure of the constitutional reform
10.2.3.2. Elimination of reference to international obligations
10.3. Conformity process of domestic tax law with tax treaty obligations
10.3.1. General principles
10.3.2. Recent reform of Italian corporate income tax
10.4. Judicial aspects of treaty override
10.5. Reference made by tax treaties to internal law: The case of dividends
10.6. Relationship between Italian anti-abuse measures and tax treaties
10.6.1. Domestic anti-abuse measures
10.6.1.1. Transfer of residence by individuals
10.6.1.2. Transfer pricing regime
10.6.1.3. Thin capitalization rules
10.6.1.4. CFC legislation
10.6.1.5. Anti-tax haven legislation
10.6.2. Compatibility of domestic anti-abuse measures with tax treaties
10.6.2.1. Thin capitalization rules
10.6.2.2. CFC legislation
10.6.2.3. Anti-tax haven legislation

Chapter 11: Netherlands
Hans Pijl

11.1. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of law
11.1.1. In general
11.1.2. Validity
11.1.3. Direct effect
11.1.3.1. The objective aspect
11.1.3.2. The subjective aspect
11.1.4. Supremacy
Chapter 11: Various Subjects

11.1.5. Procedure for treaties
11.1.6. Various subjects
11.1.6.1. Tax treaties and non-tax treaties
11.1.6.2. The relationship between various treaties
11.1.6.3. Domestic law prevails over treaties
11.2. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaties
11.2.1. In general
11.2.2. Specific references in tax treaties
11.2.2.1. Art. 4, Para. 1 OECD MC
11.2.2.2. Art. 6, Para. 2 OECD MC
11.2.2.3. Art. 10, Para. 3 OECD MC
11.2.2.4. Avoidance of double taxation
11.2.2.5. References in the Commentary
11.2.2.6. References to domestic law without special provisions in the treaty
11.2.3. General principles regarding the interaction of treaty and internal law
11.3. Treaty override
11.3.1. Legislative override
11.3.2. Judicial override
11.3.3. Remedies for the non-breaching country
11.3.3.1. Peaceful settlement of disputes
11.3.3.2. Termination and suspension
11.3.3.3. International tribunals
11.3.3.4. State responsibility
11.4. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties

Chapter 12: United Kingdom

Ian Roxan

12.1. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of law
12.1.1. Hierarchy of sources of law
12.1.1.1. In general
12.1.1.2. Implementation of international treaties into domestic law
12.1.1.3. Status of international treaties vis-à-vis domestic provisions
12.1.2. Tax treaties versus non-tax treaties
12.1.2.1. Implementation of tax treaties
12.1.2.2. Treaty underride
12.1.2.3. Implementation of exchange of information articles
12.1.2.4. Implementation of mutual agreement provisions
12.1.2.5. Implementation of transfer pricing provisions
12.2. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaties
12.2.1. Reference made by tax treaties to internal law
12.2.2. Application of general principles regarding the interaction of treaty and internal law
12.3. Treaty override
12.3.1. Legislative override
12.3.2. Judicial override
12.3.3. Remedies for the non-breaching party
12.4. Relationship between domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties
References
Abbreviations  Legislation and treaties

Chapter 13: United States
Anthony C. Infanti

13.1. Tax treaties in the hierarchy of law
13.1.1. Entry into and implementation of treaties
13.1.2. Treaties versus domestic law
13.1.2.1. Treaties versus state law
13.1.2.2. Treaties versus federal statutes
13.2. Interaction between domestic law and tax treaties
13.2.1. References to internal law made by tax treaties
13.2.2. Interaction between treaties and domestic law
13.2.2.1. Reservation of taxpayers right to rely on domestic law
13.2.2.2. Reference made by domestic law to tax treaties
13.3. Treaty override
13.3.1. Statutory provisions codifying the later-in-time rule
13.3.1.1. Rise of treaty overrides
13.3.1.2. Codification of later-in-time rule
13.3.2. Analysing legislative overrides
13.3.2.1. Presumption of harmony
13.3.2.2. Resolving conflicts
13.3.2.3. The expatriation example
13.3.3. Administrative overrides
13.3.4. Remedies for breach
13.4. Domestic anti-abuse measures and tax treaties
13.4.1. Judicial doctrines
13.4.1.1. Aiken Industries
13.4.1.2. Northern Indiana Public Service
13.4.1.3. Del Commercial Properties
13.4.1.4. Summary
13.4.2. Legislative and administrative measures
13.4.2.1. Branch profits tax treaty shopping provisions
13.4.2.2. Conduit financing regulations
13.4.2.3. Hybrid entities
13.4.2.4. Summary

Part Five: Round table: How can the relationships between tax treaties and domestic law be improved?

Chapter 14: Round table: Improving the relationships between tax treaties and domestic law
14.1. Introduction
14.2. Legislative and judicial treaty overrides
14.3. Domestic-law residents who are treaty non-residents
14.4. Application of anti-abuse measures
14.5. Conclusions

Contributors