# Table of Contents

**Foreword** vii

**Introduction** ix

**Section I**

**Chapter 1: Early Tax Treaty Developments and Interpretation Principles** 3

1.1. Early treaties for the avoidance of double taxation and tax evasion 3

1.2. Early principles of US treaty interpretation and application 6

1.3. The League of Nations
   1.3.1. The 1923 Report 10
   1.3.2. The 1925 Report 12
   1.3.3. The 1927 Report 13
   1.3.4. The 1928 Report 15
   1.3.5. The 1929-1946 Reports
      1.3.5.1. Multilateral conventions 18
      1.3.5.2. Allocation of profits to permanent establishments 20

1.4. Competent authority agreements 25

1.5. The 1943 and 1946 Mexico and London Model Conventions 28

1.6. The Organisation for European Economic Co-operation and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
   1.6.1. Organisation for European Economic Co-operation 33
   1.6.2. Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 34

**Chapter 2: International Double Taxation, Tax Evasion and Aggressive Tax Planning** 39

2.1. International double taxation 39

2.2. Tax evasion and aggressive tax planning 42
   2.2.1. Tax evasion 42
   2.2.2. The war on aggressive tax planning 47
   2.2.3. Tax treaty abuse 54
   2.2.4. Tax treaty override 57

2.3. Court cases on exchange of information 62
Table of Contents

Chapter 3: Public International Law or the Law of Nations 65

3.1. Introduction 65
3.2. Codification of the law of treaties 67
  3.2.1. The Amiable Isabella 71
  3.2.2. Maximov v. United States 72
  3.2.3. Clark v. Allen 73
3.3. Scope of the Vienna Convention 74
3.4. Principles of public international law 76
  3.4.1. Free consent 76
  3.4.2. Good faith 77
  3.4.3. The *pacta sunt servanda* rule 83
3.5. The principle of logic and good sense 86

Chapter 4: Treaty Interpretation 91

4.1. Introduction 91
4.2. Article 31 of the Vienna Convention 93
  4.2.1. Treaty interpretation practice in the United States 96
  4.2.2. Treaty interpretation practice in Canada 98
  4.2.3. Treaty interpretation practice in Mexico 99
4.3. Article 32 of the Vienna Convention 100
4.4. Article 33 of the Vienna Convention 103
4.5. Case law from the International Court of Justice 105

Section II

Chapter 5: Tax Treaty Interpretation 111

5.1. Interpretation of tax treaties in accordance with the Vienna Convention 111
5.2. Object and purpose of tax treaties 113
5.3. Good faith in tax treaty interpretation 117
5.4. Tax treaty context 119
5.5. Interpretation of tax treaties pursuant to the OECD Model 122
5.6. Article 3(2) of the OECD Model 127
  5.6.1. Origins 127
  5.6.2. US subsequent practice 130
  5.6.3. OECD 132
  5.6.4. United Nations 136
  5.6.5. Interpretation and application of article 3(2) 136
# Table of Contents

5.6.6. Conclusions on article 3(2) 138  
5.6.7. Examples of the correct use of article 3(2) 138  
5.7. Ambulatory approach to treaty interpretation 140  
5.8. Mutual agreement procedure 143  
5.8.1. Origins 143  
5.8.2. Mutual agreement procedure on general treaty interpretation and application situations today 144  
5.8.3. Court cases 147  
5.8.3.1. The *Xerox* case 147  
5.8.3.2. The *Snap-on Tools* case 149  
5.8.4. Specific case mutual agreements 150  
5.9. Treaty override 155  
5.10. Principle of substance-over-form 158  

**Chapter 6: Interpretation and Application of Tax Treaties in the United States**  

6.1. Background 165  
6.2. Tax treaty negotiation process 166  
6.3. Object and purpose of US tax treaties 168  
6.4. US Model Tax Convention 170  
6.5. Tax treaty network 174  
6.6. Treasury Department Technical Explanations 176  
6.7. US case law 178  
6.7.1. Supreme Court 179  
6.7.2. Pro-taxpayer approach 181  
6.7.3. Use of OECD work 182  
6.8. Competent authority agreements in effect 182  
6.9. IRS Revenue Procedure 2006-54 183  

**Chapter 7: Interpretation and Application of Tax Treaties in Canada**  

7.1. Background 185  
7.2. Tax treaty network 186  
7.2.1. Income tax treaties 186  
7.2.2. Information exchange agreements 187  
7.2.3. Tax treaty negotiation 187  
7.3. Case law 189  
7.4. Competent authority agreements and services 193
Table of Contents

Chapter 8: Interpretation and Application of Tax Treaties in Mexico 195

8.1. Constitutional and domestic law 195
8.2. Mexico and the Vienna Convention 198
8.3. Mexico and the OECD 200
8.4. Tax treaty network 205
8.5. Analysis of Mexican tax treaties 207
8.6. Mexican courts 208

Chapter 9: Interpretation and Application of the Tax Treaty between the United States and Mexico 213

9.1. Legislative history 213
9.2. Treasury Department and Joint Committee Technical Explanations 214
9.3. Limitation of benefits 218
9.4. Court cases 219
9.5. Mutual agreement on the application of benefits to fiscally transparent entities 221
9.6. Interest payments 226
9.7. Know-how and technical assistance 227
9.8. Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act (“FATCA”) 229

Chapter 10: Interpretation and Application of the Tax Treaty between the United States and Canada 231

10.1. Legislative history 231
10.2. Case law 231
10.3. Competent authority agreements 232
10.4. Treasury Department Technical Explanations 233
10.5. Information exchange agreement under negotiation 235

Chapter 11: Interpretation and Application of the Tax Treaty between Mexico and Canada 237

Section III

Chapter 12: A Further Step in the Economic Integration of North America 241

12.1. Background 241
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.2. Proposed Protocol embodying the Conventions for the Elimination</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of Double Taxation and the Prevention of Fiscal Evasion on Income and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital among Canada, Mexico and the United States</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 13: Conclusions</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex I: IRS Revenue Procedure 2006-54</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex II: Canada Revenue Agency Information Circular 71-17R5</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex III: Memorandum of Understanding between the Competent Authorities</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of Canada and the United States of America</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>