
Table of Contents

Preface	xxi
----------------	-----

Part One
General Issues on Taxation
and Human Rights

Chapter 0: General Report	3
<i>Georg Kofler and Pasquale Pistone</i>	

Introduction	3
0.1. The EU and the European Convention on Human Rights	4
0.2. A European international tax policy for human rights?	8
0.3. Human rights, their enforcement, economic policy and international taxation in the era of global law	11
0.4. The era of global law and the search for constitutional pluralism	14
0.5. The impact of human rights on domestic substantive taxation	17
0.6. The impact of human rights on tax procedures and sanctions	21
0.7. The impact of human rights on tax litigation before the courts	27

Part Two
The EU and the European Convention
on Human Rights

Chapter 1: The Human Rights Competence in the EU	
The State of the Question after Lisbon	37
<i>Samantha Besson</i>	

1.1. Introduction	37
1.2. The EU human rights competence	40
1.2.1. The origins	41
1.2.2. The legal regime	43
1.2.2.2. The internal competence	44
1.2.2.2.1. The scope	44
1.2.2.2.2. The content	45
1.2.2.2.3. The type	46
1.2.2.2.4. The allocation	47
1.2.2.3. The external competence	48

Table of Contents

1.2.3.	The consequences	50
1.3.	A general critique	51
1.3.1.	The theoretical critique	51
1.3.2.	The practical critique	53
1.4.	The human rights competence after the EU's accession to the ECHR	55
1.4.1.	The ECHR in the EU legal order	55
1.4.2.	The accession mandate	56
1.4.3.	The competence question	57
1.4.3.1.	The status quo proposal	57
1.4.3.2.	Theoretical plausibility	58
1.4.3.3.	Practical feasibility	60
1.5.	Conclusion	62
Chapter 2: Fundamental Rights and Fundamental Boundaries in EU Law		65
<i>Daniel Sarmiento</i>		
2.1.	Introduction	65
2.2.	In the beginning ...	66
2.3.	Underlying tensions	68
2.4.	Justifying change	71
Chapter 3: EU Human Rights and the Reserved Powers of the Member States		75
<i>Loïc Azoulay</i>		
3.1.	Introduction	75
3.2.	Implementing EU law	76
3.3.	Derogating from EU law	77
3.4.	Exercising a reserved power	79
Chapter 4: The ECHR Principles as Principles of European Law and their Implementation through the National Legal Systems		83
<i>Lorenzo del Federico</i>		
4.1.	Introduction	83
4.2.	The traditional limits and the interpretive methods to overcome the dichotomy between “civil rights” and “criminal charges”	85
4.3.	The force of expansion of the ECtHR in tax matters	87
4.4.	The ECHR principles as general principles of European law	88

4.5.	The European Court of Justice and the ECHR principles relevant in tax matters	89
4.6.	Conclusions	90

Part Three
A European International Tax Policy
for Human Rights?

	Chapter 5: The Role of Individual Rights in the Europeanization of Tax Law	95
	<i>Theodoros P. Fortsakis</i>	

5.1.	Introduction	95
5.2.	What do we mean by “Europeanization” of tax law?	96
5.3.	Is it necessary for tax law to be “Europeanized”?	96
5.4.	What exactly is the European dimension of individual rights in tax law?	97
5.5.	Do individual rights contribute to the “Europeanization” of tax law in a different way from that in which they contribute to other branches of law – administrative law in particular, and public law more generally?	99
5.6.	Are the autonomous status, pragmatism and empiricism of tax law obstacles to the recognition and realization of individual rights in its field?	102
5.7.	Will the “Europeanization” of tax law through individual rights influence the content of the concept of tax? Will it influence our perception of the taxpayer? Will it gradually bring about changes in our current perception of tax law?	102

	Chapter 6: Taking Human Rights Seriously: Some Introductory Words on Human Rights, Taxation and the EU	105
	<i>Daniel Gutmann</i>	

	Chapter 7: The Role of the EU in International Tax Policy and Human Rights Does the EU need a policy on taxation and human rights?	113
	<i>Cécile Brokelind</i>	

7.1.	Introduction	113
7.2.	Which human rights may a taxpayer invoke?	115

Table of Contents

7.3.	The role of the OECD protecting taxpayers' rights	119
7.4.	The role of the EU in protecting taxpayers' rights	122
7.5.	Concluding remarks	126

Part Four
Enforcement, Economic Policy
and International Taxation

Chapter 8: Information Duties, Aggressive Tax Planning and <i>nemo tenetur se ipsum accusare</i> in the light of Art. 6(1) of ECHR	131
<i>Ana Paula Dourado and Augusto Silva Dias</i>	

8.1.	Introduction	131
8.2.	Taxation of real and net income and cooperation duties	132
8.3.	Cooperation and information duties and their boundaries in a rule of law state	133
8.4.	Art. 6 ECHR and the right to a fair trial	135
8.5.	Different legal solutions to comply with <i>nemo tenetur</i> : The case of advance pricing agreements	141
8.6.	The Portuguese tax regime on information, communication and clarification duties	143
8.7.	Object and scope of the duties to communicate, inform and clarify the tax administration in the light of Art. 6(1) ECHR	144
8.7.1.	Scheme or action and tax advantage	144
8.7.2.	Promoters and users of tax schemes or actions	146
8.7.3.	Cooperation duties vs offences and penalties	147
8.8.	The legal guarantees of <i>nemo tenetur se ipsum accusare</i>	149
8.9.	Cooperation duties and the duty of professional secrecy	150
8.10.	Concluding remarks	151

Chapter 9: Is there a Need for International Enforcement of Human Rights in the Tax Area?	153
<i>Servaas van Thiel</i>	

9.1.	Introduction	153
9.2.	Does international law have an impact in the area of taxation?	155
9.2.1.	International law is often ignored by tax lawyers, but...	155

9.2.2.	International law legitimizes the exercise of tax jurisdiction	156
9.2.3.	International law is instrumental in relations between tax jurisdictions	157
9.3.	Does international law have a normative impact in the area of taxation?	159
9.4.	Which substantive norms of international law could have an impact on tax jurisdiction of states?	164
9.4.1.	International customary law	164
9.4.2.	International economic law	166
9.5.	Could international human rights norms have an impact in the area of taxation?	169
9.6.	Is there a need for international enforcement of international human rights norms that could have an impact in the area of taxation?	174
9.7.	Conclusions	181

Part Five

The Era of Global Law and the Search for
Constitutional Pluralism in Taxation

Chapter 10: Global Law and the Search for Constitutional Pluralism	185	
<i>Frans Vanistendael</i>		
10.1.	Introduction	185
10.2.	Worldwide tax trends towards uniformity	186
10.2.1.	The long march of VAT/GST	186
10.2.2.	Dominance of model tax conventions and the arm's length pricing principle	187
10.2.3.	A trend towards transparency through exchange of information	188
10.2.4.	The trend towards general anti-abuse or anti-avoidance provisions (GAAP)	189
10.2.5.	Is there a common language moving towards global law in international taxation?	191
10.3.	Global solutions for global problems	192
10.3.1.	Globalization of problems	192
10.3.2.	The new nature of global tax problems	193
10.3.3.	Structures for global decision-making	194
10.4.	A cluster of regional structures as solution?	195

Table of Contents

10.4.1. The EU as a regional solution	195
10.4.2. Could the EU structure be used as a building brick in the G-20 cluster?	196
10.5. Conclusion	197
Chapter 11: The Fundamental Human Rights as European Law Principles: Their Development through the ECHR Principles and the Constitutional Traditions Common to the Member States	199
<i>Agostino Ennio La Scala</i>	
Chapter 12: The Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act and Notice 2010-60	211
<i>H. David Rosenbloom</i>	
12.1. Introduction	211
12.2. Withholding requirements with respect to certain payments made to foreign financial institutions and other foreign entities	212
12.3. Definition of “financial institution”	212
12.3.1. Certain financial institutions treated as not financial entities	213
12.3.2. Insurance companies	214
12.3.3. US branches of FFIs	215
12.4. Requirements imposed on FFIs to avoid 30% withholding	215
12.4.1. Participating FFIs	215
12.4.2. Deemed-compliant FFIs	216
12.4.3. Entities described in Sec. 1471(f)	217
12.5. Requirements imposed on NFFEs to avoid withholding	218
12.6. Effective date	218
12.7. Conclusion	219
Chapter 13: Global Tax Governance: Work in Progress?	221
<i>Jan Wouters and Katrien Meuwissen</i>	
13.1. Introduction	221
13.2. The contribution of the G-20: A high-level deliberative forum	222
13.2.1. G-20 summits in relation to the financial crisis	222
13.2.2. The G-20 and tax policy	223
13.2.3. Legitimacy of the G-20 as a global actor	226

13.3. The contribution of the OECD: Leading actor on international tax cooperation	227
13.3.1. The OECD and fiscal policy	227
13.3.2. Tax analysis and tax dialogue: International cooperation	229
13.3.3. Standards of transparency and exchange of information	229
13.3.4. OECD/Council of Europe Convention on Administrative Assistance	231
13.3.5. The OECD's legitimacy	232
13.4. The contribution of the UN: Development and good governance in tax	234
13.4.1. UN Model Tax Convention	234
13.4.2. Monterrey and Doha: good governance, tax and development	235
13.5. The IMF: Technical analyser and advisor	238
13.5.1. The IMF and tax policy	238
13.5.2. Technical expertise regarding fiscal policy measures	239
13.5.3. Fiscal transparency	241
13.5.4. The IMF's legitimacy	242
13.6. The WTO: The SCM Agreement	244
13.6.1. The SCM Agreement in general	244
13.6.2. Influence on tax policy: The <i>US-FSC</i> case	245
13.6.3. Interplay between domestic and international level	247
13.7. Concluding remarks	248

Part Six

The Impact of Human Rights on Domestic
Substantive Taxation

Chapter 14: Accounting Disclosure of Tax Liabilities, Fair Trial and Self-incrimination: Should the European Commission endorse IFRS in the light of European Human Rights?	253
<i>Raymond Luja</i>	
14.1. Introduction	253
14.2. The European Commission's role in accountant standard setting	256
14.3. Disclosure of legal and tax positions: IAS 12 and IAS 37	257

Table of Contents

14.4. US developments: International Revenue Announcement 2010-9	261
14.5. Producing physical evidence: The <i>Allen</i> decision and the <i>Saunders</i> judgment	263
14.6. Conflict of interest: Reliable accounting vs effective legal protection	268
14.7. Concluding remarks	269
Chapter 15: Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights on VAT Refund and its Importance for the Russian Judicial System <i>Elena Variychuk</i>	273
15.1. Introduction	273
15.2. VAT refund in ECtHR case law	274
15.2.1. Concept of “possessions” under Art. 1 of the First Protocol	274
15.2.2. Three distinct rules of Art. 1 of the First Protocol	276
15.2.3. Fair balance between the demands of the public interest and the protection of the right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions	277
15.3. Importance of the ECtHR positions on VAT refund for Russian court practice	280
15.3.1. The role of the ECtHR case law in the Russian legal system	280
15.3.2. Implementation of the ECtHR positions on VAT refund in Russia	281
Chapter 16: The Impact of Human Rights on Domestic Substantive Taxation – the German Experience <i>Joachim Englisch</i>	285
16.1. Introduction	285
16.2. Human dignity	287
16.3. Equality in taxation	288
16.3.1. Tax fairness and tax equity	288
16.3.2. Consistency of the system and proportionality of exceptions	290
16.3.3. Non-discrimination	294
16.4. Freedom rights	295
16.4.1. Multifaceted significance in substantive taxation	295

16.4.2. The prohibition of excessive tax burdens in particular	298
16.4.3. Deductions, allowances or exemptions for “indispensable” expenditure, especially related to marriage and family life	300
16.5. Conclusion	302
Chapter 17: Substantive Impact of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms on Income Taxation	303
<i>Martha O’Brien</i>	
17.1. Introduction	303
17.2. The Charter framework	304
17.3. Sec. 15: Equality rights	305
17.4. Equality and taxation	307
17.4.1. Discrimination on the basis of sex	308
17.4.2. Marital or family status	311
17.4.3. Sexual orientation	314
17.4.4. Citizenship	315
17.4.5. Miscellaneous cases	318
17.5. Recognition versus redistribution	321
17.6. The Charter and procedural issues in tax law	322
17.6.1 Double jeopardy	322
17.6.2. The protections from self-incrimination and from unreasonable search and seizure	324
17.7. Conclusions	325
Chapter 18: Black Fella Land: White Fella Tax Changing the CGT Implications of Aboriginal/Native	327
<i>Julie Cassidy</i>	
18.1. Introduction	327
18.2. Part I conclusions as to the CGT nature of aboriginal/Native title	330
18.3. CGT Issues	334
18.4. Recognition of aboriginal/Native title	335
18.5. Conferral of aboriginal/Native title on prescribed body corporate	339
18.6. Succession of aboriginal/Native title	342
18.7. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title (and incidental rights)	343

Table of Contents

18.7.1. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title (and incidental rights) and CGT Event A1	343
18.7.2. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title and CGT Event C1	345
18.7.3. Extinguishment of statutory rights and CGT Event C2	346
18.7.4. ILUAs and similar contractual arrangements and CGT Events D1, C2 and H2	347
18.7.5. Taxation Ruling TR 95/35	350
18.8. Conclusion	351
Chapter 19: Minimum Vitalis and the Fundamental Right to Property as a Limit to Taxation in Colombia	353
<i>Natalia Quiñones Cruz</i>	
19.1. Introduction	353
19.2. From the Spanish crusade for gold to the Constitution of 1991	354
19.3. <i>Minimum vitalis</i> , justice, equality, proportionality and the prohibition of confiscation	356
19.4. The case of communal property and indigenous rights as a limitation to taxation	360
19.5. Conclusions	363
Chapter 20: Confiscatory Effects of Having Two Capital Transfer Taxes in South Africa	365
<i>Jennifer Roeleveld</i>	
Part Seven The Impact of Human Rights on Tax Procedures and Sanctions	
Chapter 21: The Impact of the European Convention on Human Rights on Tax Procedures and Sanctions with Special Reference to Tax Treaties and the EU Arbitration Convention	373
<i>Guglielmo Maisto</i>	
21.1. Introduction	373
21.2. The application of Art. 6 ECHR to pre-judicial and post-judicial tax litigation stages	376
21.2.1. Pre-judicial tax litigation stage	376
21.2.2. Post-judicial tax litigation stage	377

21.2.3. Issues of potential conflict of procedural tax rules with the ECHR	379
21.2.3.1. Presumptions established by law	379
21.2.3.2. Retroactive application of procedural rules	380
21.3. Art. 8 ECHR	381
21.4. Art. 1 of the Protocol to the ECHR	384
21.5. The ECHR and the international tax conventions and EC directives on exchange of information, assistance in collection, mutual agreement procedures and arbitration	386
21.5.1. Exchange of information	386
21.5.2. Mutual agreement procedures	387
21.5.3. Arbitration	390
21.5.4. Assistance in collection	392
21.6. Conclusion	394
Chapter 22: The Classification of Tax Disputes, Human Rights Implications	
<i>Robert Attard</i>	397
22.1. The controversial <i>Ferrazzini</i> judgment	
22.1.2. Perverse conclusion	398
22.1.3. <i>Ferrazzini</i> eroded	400
22.2. The classification of tax disputes; Baker’s “ <i>Engel</i> criteria”	401
22.3. Developments after Baker 2000	402
22.4. An illustration of the application of the <i>Engel</i> criteria: The case of <i>Paykar Yev Haghtanak Ltd v. Armenia</i>	403
22.5. Recent Finnish cases – One step further	405
22.6. Further implications of the classification of tax surcharges as criminal charges	406
22.7. Conclusions, hope for the future	409
Chapter 23: A New Vision on Exercising Taxing Powers and the Right to Fair Trial in Judicial Tax Procedures under Art. 6 ECHR	
<i>Menita Giusy De Flora</i>	411
23.1. Towards a new vision of the relationship between tax authorities and taxpayers in respect of the levying of taxes	
23.2. The impact of the new vision on Art. 6 ECHR	414
23.3. The approach of the European Court of Justice to the protection of taxpayers’ rights	420
23.4. Conclusions	422

Table of Contents

Chapter 24: Taxpayer’s Rights as Human Rights During Tax Procedures	425
<i>Roberto Cordeiro Guerra and Stefano Dorigo</i>	
24.1. Introduction	425
24.2. The taxpayer’s protection during tax procedures according to the European Convention of Human Rights	428
24.3. The practice of the European Court of Human Rights	430
24.4. The protection of individuals in tax matters according to international agreements and within the EU	434
24.5. The relevance of customary international law	438
24.6. Conclusions	443
Chapter 25: Tax and Fundamental Rights in EU Law: Procedural Issues	445
<i>Richard Lyal</i>	
25.1. Introduction	445
25.2. Direct tax	448
25.3. Indirect tax	450
25.4. Procedural rights	453
25.5. Conclusion	457
Chapter 26: The Concept of Criminal Charges in the European Court of Human Rights Case Law	459
<i>Cristina Mauro</i>	
26.1. Introduction	459
26.2. Why should we bother?	460
26.3. What are the implications?	465
26.4. Which criteria?	469
Part Eight	
The Impact of Human Rights on Tax Litigation before Courts	
Chapter 27: Case Law-Based Anti-Avoidance Measures and Principles of Human Rights Protection	477
<i>Adam Zalasiński</i>	
27.1. General remarks	477
27.2. The concept of case law-based anti-avoidance measures	478

27.2.1. The notion of tax avoidance	478
27.2.2. Approaches to prevent tax avoidance	481
27.2.3. Methodology of application of anti-avoidance measures vs determining the tax liability	483
27.3. The principles of human rights protection that may serve as the standard of assessment of case law-based anti-avoidance measures	483
27.4. Conclusion	487
Chapter 28: The Impact of the Right to a Fair Trial on Tax Evidence: An EU Analysis	
<i>Gianluigi Bizioli</i>	489
28.1. Introduction	
28.1. Introduction	489
28.2. The right to a fair trial as international custom	
28.2. The right to a fair trial as international custom	490
28.3. The right to a fair trial and the ECHR	
28.3.1. General remarks	493
28.3.2. Art. 6 of the ECHR and taxation	494
28.3.3. The right to a fair trial and the issue of evidence	497
28.4. The right to a fair trial and EU law	
28.4.1. The situation before the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon	499
28.4.2. The role of the EU Charter on Fundamental Rights in the development of the right for an effective remedy and a fair trial after Lisbon	502
28.5. Conclusion	504
Chapter 29: The Protection of Human Rights and Its Impact on Tax Litigation from a Russian Perspective	
<i>Danil V. Vinnitskiy</i>	505
29.1. Introduction	
29.1. Introduction	505
29.2. Levels of protection of human rights: The approach of the Russian Federation	
29.2.1. National level of the protection of human rights	506
29.2.2. Supranational level of the protection of human rights	507
29.2.3. Correlation of national and supranational levels in protection of human rights	509
29.3. The impact of remedies in human rights protection in tax disputes	
29.3.1. The right of protection as an expression of the right to fair trial (Art. 6 of the ECHR)	513
29.3.1.1. Right to fair trial	513

Table of Contents

29.3.1.2. Burden of proof	514
29.3.1.3. Limitations to the right of property	514
29.3.1.4. Ne bis in idem	515
29.3.1.5. Legal interpretations	515
29.3.2. A per-category overview of the impact of ECtHR judgments on tax litigation in Russia	516
29.3.2.1. Disputes on penalties	516
29.3.2.2. VAT refunds	517
29.3.2.3. Interest on repayments of tax	518
29.3.3. Selected issues in the pending ECtHR <i>Yukos</i> case	518
29.4. Conclusion	519

Chapter 30: Fair Trial Rights on Taxation: The European and Inter-American Experience 521

César Alejandro Ruiz Jiménez

30.1. Introduction	521
30.2. Human rights and tax law	522
30.2.1. Influence of human rights on tax matters	524
30.2.1.1. Right to liberty and security of person	524
30.2.1.2. Right to privacy in life, home and correspondence	525
30.2.1.3. Prohibition of discrimination	526
30.2.2. Influence of taxation on human rights	527
30.2.2.1. Tax equity	527
30.2.2.2. Tax legality	528
30.2.2.3. Ability to pay (tax proportionality)	528
30.2.2.4. Certainty of tax obligations	528
30.3. Right to fair trial	529
30.3.1. European system of human rights	529
30.3.2. Art. 6 of the ECHR	530
30.3.2.1. Civil rights	531
30.3.2.1.1. <i>Tre Traktörer Aktiebolag v. Sweden</i>	531
30.3.2.1.2. <i>Editions Periscope v. France</i>	532
30.3.2.1.3. <i>Schouten and Meldrum v. Netherlands</i>	532
30.3.2.1.4. <i>S. v. Austria</i>	532
30.3.2.1.5. <i>Buildings Societies v. United Kingdom</i>	533
30.3.2.2. Criminal charges	533
30.3.2.2.1. <i>Bendenoun v. France</i>	534
30.3.2.2.2. <i>Paul Smith v. United Kingdom</i>	535

30.3.3. Relevant jurisprudence	535
30.3.3.1. Right to a fair and public hearing	535
30.3.3.1.1. J.J. v. Netherlands	535
30.3.3.1.2. H. B. v. Switzerland	536
30.3.3.2. Right to be sentenced within a reasonable time	536
30.3.3.2.1. H. H. v. Netherlands	537
30.3.3.2.2. Hozee v. Netherlands	537
30.3.3.2.3. Skandinavisk Metallförmedling AB v. Sweden	538
30.3.3.3. Right to an independent and impartial tribunal	538
30.3.3.3.1. S. v. Austria	539
30.3.3.4. Right to presumption of innocence	539
30.3.3.4.1. S. M. v. Austria	539
30.3.3.4.2. A. P., M. P. and T. P. v. Swiss and E. L., R. L., and J. O.- L., v. Swiss	540
30.3.3.5. Right to not incriminate oneself	540
30.3.3.5.1. Funke v. France	540
30.3.3.5.2. Maximilian Abas v. Netherlands	541
30.3.3.5.3. J. B. v. Switzerland	541
30.3.3.6. Right to a defence	542
30.3.4. Inter-American system of human rights	542
30.3.4.1. Art. 8 of the Inter-American Convention	542
30.3.4.2. Current application in the Inter-American system of human rights	544
30.4. Future of the right to a fair trial in tax matters	546
30.4.1. Right of access to justice	548
30.4.2. Right to privacy	548
30.4.3. Right to be silent	548
30.4.4. Right to defence	549
List of Authors and Editors	551