Table of Contents

Preface xxi

Part One
General Issues on Taxation and Human Rights

Chapter 0: General Report
Georg Kofler and Pasquale Pistone
Introduction 3
0.1. The EU and the European Convention on Human Rights 4
0.2. A European international tax policy for human rights? 8
0.3. Human rights, their enforcement, economic policy and international taxation in the era of global law 11
0.4. The era of global law and the search for constitutional pluralism 14
0.5. The impact of human rights on domestic substantive taxation 17
0.6. The impact of human rights on tax procedures and sanctions 21
0.7. The impact of human rights on tax litigation before the courts 27

Part Two
The EU and the European Convention on Human Rights

Chapter 1: The Human Rights Competence in the EU
The State of the Question after Lisbon
Samantha Besson
1.1. Introduction 37
1.2. The EU human rights competence 40
1.2.1. The origins 41
1.2.2. The legal regime 43
1.2.2.1. The scope 44
1.2.2.2. The content 45
1.2.2.3. The type 46
1.2.2.4. The allocation 47
1.2.2.3. The external competence 48
Table of Contents

1.2.3. The consequences 50
1.3. A general critique 51
   1.3.1. The theoretical critique 51
   1.3.2. The practical critique 53
1.4. The human rights competence after the EU’s accession to the ECHR 55
   1.4.1. The ECHR in the EU legal order 55
   1.4.2. The accession mandate 56
   1.4.3. The competence question 57
     1.4.3.1. The status quo proposal 57
     1.4.3.2. Theoretical plausibility 58
     1.4.3.3. Practical feasibility 60
1.5. Conclusion 62

Chapter 2: Fundamental Rights and Fundamental Boundaries in EU Law 65
   Daniel Sarmiento

2.1. Introduction 65
2.2. In the beginning … 66
2.3. Underlying tensions 68
2.4. Justifying change 71

Chapter 3: EU Human Rights and the Reserved Powers of the Member States 75
   Loïc Azoulai

3.1. Introduction 75
3.2. Implementing EU law 76
3.3. Derogating from EU law 77
3.4. Exercising a reserved power 79

Chapter 4: The ECHR Principles as Principles of European Law and their Implementation through the National Legal Systems 83
   Lorenzo del Federico

4.1. Introduction 83
4.2. The traditional limits and the interpretive methods to overcome the dichotomy between “civil rights” and “criminal charges” 85
4.3. The force of expansion of the ECtHR in tax matters 87
4.4. The ECHR principles as general principles of European law 88
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.5. The European Court of Justice and the ECHR principles relevant in tax matters</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6. Conclusions</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part Three</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A European International Tax Policy for Human Rights?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5: The Role of Individual Rights in the Europeanization of Tax Law</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Theodoros P. Fortsakis</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Introduction</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. What do we mean by “Europeanization” of tax law?</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Is it necessary for tax law to be “Europeanized”?</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4. What exactly is the European dimension of individual rights in tax law?</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5. Do individual rights contribute to the “Europeanization” of tax law in a different way from that in which they contribute to other branches of law – administrative law in particular, and public law more generally?</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6. Are the autonomous status, pragmatism and empiricism of tax law obstacles to the recognition and realization of individual rights in its field?</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7. Will the “Europeanization” of tax law through individual rights influence the content of the concept of tax? Will it influence our perception of the taxpayer? Will it gradually bring about changes in our current perception of tax law?</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6: Taking Human Rights Seriously: Some Introductory Words on Human Rights, Taxation and the EU</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Daniel Gutmann</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7: The Role of the EU in International Tax Policy and Human Rights Does the EU need a policy on taxation and human rights?</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Cécile Brokelind</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1. Introduction</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2. Which human rights may a taxpayer invoke?</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

7.3. The role of the OECD protecting taxpayers’ rights 119
7.4. The role of the EU in protecting taxpayers’ rights 122
7.5. Concluding remarks 126

Part Four
Enforcement, Economic Policy
and International Taxation

Chapter 8: Information Duties, Aggressive Tax Planning and
nemo tenetur se ipsum accusare in the light of
Art. 6(1) of ECHR 131
Ana Paula Dourado and Augusto Silva Dias

8.1. Introduction 131
8.2. Taxation of real and net income and cooperation duties 132
8.3. Cooperation and information duties and their boundaries in a rule of law state 133
8.4. Art. 6 ECHR and the right to a fair trial 135
8.5. Different legal solutions to comply with nemo tenetur: The case of advance pricing agreements 141
8.6. The Portuguese tax regime on information, communication and clarification duties 143
8.7. Object and scope of the duties to communicate, inform and clarify the tax administration in the light of Art. 6(1) ECHR 144
8.7.1. Scheme or action and tax advantage 144
8.7.2. Promoters and users of tax schemes or actions 146
8.7.3. Cooperation duties vs offences and penalties 147
8.8. The legal guarantees of nemo tenetur se ipsum accusare 149
8.9. Cooperation duties and the duty of professional secrecy 150
8.10. Concluding remarks 151

Chapter 9: Is there a Need for International Enforcement of
Human Rights in the Tax Area? 153
Servaas van Thiel

9.1. Introduction 153
9.2. Does international law have an impact in the area of taxation? 155
9.2.1. International law is often ignored by tax lawyers, but… 155
Table of Contents

9.2.2. International law legitimizes the exercise of tax jurisdiction 156
9.2.3. International law is instrumental in relations between tax jurisdictions 157
9.3. Does international law have a normative impact in the area of taxation? 159
9.4. Which substantive norms of international law could have an impact on tax jurisdiction of states? 164
  9.4.1. International customary law 164
  9.4.2. International economic law 166
9.5. Could international human rights norms have an impact in the area of taxation? 169
9.6. Is there a need for international enforcement of international human rights norms that could have an impact in the area of taxation? 174
9.7. Conclusions 181

Part Five
The Era of Global Law and the Search for Constitutional Pluralism in Taxation

Chapter 10: Global Law and the Search for Constitutional Pluralism

Frans Vanistendael

10.1. Introduction 185
10.2. Worldwide tax trends towards uniformity 186
  10.2.1. The long march of VAT/GST 186
  10.2.2. Dominance of model tax conventions and the arm’s length pricing principle 187
  10.2.3. A trend towards transparency through exchange of information 188
  10.2.4. The trend towards general anti-abuse or anti-avoidance provisions (GAAP) 189
  10.2.5. Is there a common language moving towards global law in international taxation? 191
10.3. Global solutions for global problems 192
  10.3.1. Globalization of problems 192
  10.3.2. The new nature of global tax problems 193
  10.3.3. Structures for global decision-making 194
10.4. A cluster of regional structures as solution? 195
Table of Contents

10.4.1. The EU as a regional solution 195
10.4.2. Could the EU structure be used as a building brick in the G-20 cluster? 196
10.5. Conclusion 197

Chapter 11: The Fundamental Human Rights as European Law Principles: Their Development through the ECHR Principles and the Constitutional Traditions Common to the Member States 199
Agostino Ennio La Scala

Chapter 12: The Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act and Notice 2010-60 211
H. David Rosenbloom

12.1. Introduction 211
12.2. Withholding requirements with respect to certain payments made to foreign financial institutions and other foreign entities 212
12.3. Definition of “financial institution” 212
12.3.1. Certain financial institutions treated as not financial entities 213
12.3.2. Insurance companies 214
12.3.3. US branches of FFIs 215
12.4. Requirements imposed on FFIs to avoid 30% withholding 215
12.4.1. Participating FFIs 215
12.4.2. Deemed-compliant FFIs 216
12.4.3. Entities described in Sec. 1471(f) 217
12.5. Requirements imposed on NFFEs to avoid withholding 218
12.6. Effective date 218
12.7. Conclusion 219

Chapter 13: Global Tax Governance: Work in Progress? 221
Jan Wouters and Katrien Meuwissen

13.1. Introduction 221
13.2. The contribution of the G-20: A high-level deliberative forum 222
13.2.1. G-20 summits in relation to the financial crisis 222
13.2.2. The G-20 and tax policy 223
13.2.3. Legitimacy of the G-20 as a global actor 226
### Table of Contents

13.3. The contribution of the OECD: Leading actor on international tax cooperation  
13.3.1. The OECD and fiscal policy  
13.3.2. Tax analysis and tax dialogue: International cooperation  
13.3.3. Standards of transparency and exchange of information  
13.3.4. OECD/Council of Europe Convention on Administrative Assistance  
13.3.5. The OECD’s legitimacy  
13.4. The contribution of the UN: Development and good governance in tax  
13.4.1. UN Model Tax Convention  
13.4.2. Monterrey and Doha: good governance, tax and development  
13.5. The IMF: Technical analyser and advisor  
13.5.1. The IMF and tax policy  
13.5.2. Technical expertise regarding fiscal policy measures  
13.5.3. Fiscal transparency  
13.5.4. The IMF’s legitimacy  
13.6. The WTO: The SCM Agreement  
13.6.1. The SCM Agreement in general  
13.6.2. Influence on tax policy: The US-FSC case  
13.6.3. Interplay between domestic and international level  
13.7. Concluding remarks  

#### Part Six

The Impact of Human Rights on Domestic Substantive Taxation

**Chapter 14: Accounting Disclosure of Tax Liabilities, Fair Trial and Self-incrimination: Should the European Commission endorse IFRS in the light of European Human Rights?**  
*Raymond Luja*

14.1. Introduction  
14.2. The European Commission’s role in accountant standard setting  
14.3. Disclosure of legal and tax positions: IAS 12 and IAS 37
Table of Contents

14.4. US developments: International Revenue Announcement 2010-9 261
14.5. Producing physical evidence: The Allen decision and the Saunders judgment 263
14.6. Conflict of interest: Reliable accounting vs effective legal protection 268
14.7. Concluding remarks 269

Chapter 15: Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights on VAT Refund and its Importance for the Russian Judicial System 273
Elena Variyuch

15.1. Introduction 273
15.2. VAT refund in ECtHR case law 274
   15.2.1. Concept of “possessions” under Art. 1 of the First Protocol 274
   15.2.2. Three distinct rules of Art. 1 of the First Protocol 276
   15.2.3. Fair balance between the demands of the public interest and the protection of the right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions 277
15.3. Importance of the ECtHR positions on VAT refund for Russian court practice 280
   15.3.1. The role of the ECtHR case law in the Russian legal system 280
   15.3.2. Implementation of the ECtHR positions on VAT refund in Russia 281

Chapter 16: The Impact of Human Rights on Domestic Substantive Taxation – the German Experience 285
Joachim Englisch

16.1. Introduction 285
16.2. Human dignity 287
16.3. Equality in taxation 288
   16.3.1. Tax fairness and tax equity 288
   16.3.2. Consistency of the system and proportionality of exceptions 290
   16.3.3. Non-discrimination 294
16.4. Freedom rights 295
   16.4.1. Multifaceted significance in substantive taxation 295
| Chapter 16: | The prohibition of excessive tax burdens in particular | 298 |
| 16.4.2. | Deductions, allowances or exemptions for “indispensable” expenditure, especially related to marriage and family life | 300 |
| 16.5. | Conclusion | 302 |

**Chapter 17: Substantive Impact of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms on Income Taxation**

*Martha O’Brien*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17.1. Introduction</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2. The Charter framework</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3. Sec. 15: Equality rights</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4. Equality and taxation</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.1. Discrimination on the basis of sex</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2. Marital or family status</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3. Sexual orientation</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.4. Citizenship</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.5. Miscellaneous cases</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.5. Recognition versus redistribution</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.6. The Charter and procedural issues in tax law</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.6.1 Double jeopardy</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.6.2. The protections from self-incrimination and from unreasonable search and seizure</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.7. Conclusions</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 18: Black Fella Land: White Fella Tax Changing the CGT Implications of Aboriginal/Native**

*Julie Cassidy*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18.1. Introduction</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.2. Part I conclusions as to the CGT nature of aboriginal/Native title</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3. CGT Issues</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.4. Recognition of aboriginal/Native title</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.5. Conferral of aboriginal/Native title on prescribed body corporate</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.6. Succession of aboriginal/Native title</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.7. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title (and incidental rights)</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

18.7.1. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title (and incidental rights) and CGT Event A1 343
18.7.2. Extinguishment of aboriginal/Native title and CGT Event C1 345
18.7.3. Extinguishment of statutory rights and CGT Event C2 346
18.7.4. ILUAs and similar contractual arrangements and CGT Events D1, C2 and H2 347
18.7.5. Taxation Ruling TR 95/35 350
18.8. Conclusion 351

Chapter 19: Minimum Vitalis and the Fundamental Right to Property as a Limit to Taxation in Colombia
Natalia Quiñones Cruz 353

19.1. Introduction 353
19.2. From the Spanish crusade for gold to the Constitution of 1991 354
19.3. Minimum vitalis, justice, equality, proportionality and the prohibition of confiscation 356
19.4. The case of communal property and indigenous rights as a limitation to taxation 360
19.5. Conclusions 363

Chapter 20: Confiscatory Effects of Having Two Capital Transfer Taxes in South Africa
Jennifer Roeleveld 365

Part Seven
The Impact of Human Rights on Tax Procedures and Sanctions

Chapter 21: The Impact of the European Convention on Human Rights on Tax Procedures and Sanctions with Special Reference to Tax Treaties and the EU Arbitration Convention
Guglielmo Maisto 373

21.1. Introduction 373
21.2. The application of Art. 6 ECHR to pre-judicial and post-judicial tax litigation stages 376
21.2.1. Pre-judicial tax litigation stage 376
21.2.2. Post-judicial tax litigation stage 377
Table of Contents

21.2.3. Issues of potential conflict of procedural tax rules with the ECHR 379
   21.2.3.1. Presumptions established by law 379
   21.2.3.2. Retroactive application of procedural rules 380
21.3. Art. 8 ECHR 381
21.4. Art. 1 of the Protocol to the ECHR 384
21.5. The ECHR and the international tax conventions and EC directives on exchange of information, assistance in collection, mutual agreement procedures and arbitration 386
   21.5.1. Exchange of information 386
   21.5.2. Mutual agreement procedures 387
   21.5.3. Arbitration 390
   21.5.4. Assistance in collection 392
21.6. Conclusion 394

Chapter 22: The Classification of Tax Disputes, Human Rights Implications 397
Robert Attard

22.1. The controversial Ferrazzini judgment 397
   22.1.2. Perverse conclusion 398
   22.1.3. Ferrazzini eroded 400
22.2. The classification of tax disputes; Baker’s “Engel criteria” 401
22.3. Developments after Baker 2000 402
22.4. An illustration of the application of the Engel criteria: The case of Paykar Yev Haghtanak Ltd v. Armenia 403
22.5. Recent Finnish cases – One step further 405
22.6. Further implications of the classification of tax surcharges as criminal charges 406
22.7. Conclusions, hope for the future 409

Chapter 23: A New Vision on Exercising Taxing Powers and the Right to Fair Trial in Judicial Tax Procedures under Art. 6 ECHR 411
Menita Giusy De Flora

23.1. Towards a new vision of the relationship between tax authorities and taxpayers in respect of the levying of taxes 411
23.2. The impact of the new vision on Art. 6 ECHR 414
23.3. The approach of the European Court of Justice to the protection of taxpayers’ rights 420
23.4. Conclusions 422
Table of Contents

Chapter 24: Taxpayer’s Rights as Human Rights During Tax Procedures 425
   Roberto Cordeiro Guerra and Stefano Dorigo

   24.1. Introduction 425
   24.2. The taxpayer’s protection during tax procedures according to the European Convention of Human Rights 428
   24.3. The practice of the European Court of Human Rights 430
   24.4. The protection of individuals in tax matters according to international agreements and within the EU 434
   24.5. The relevance of customary international law 438
   24.6. Conclusions 443

   Richard Lyal

   25.1. Introduction 445
   25.2. Direct tax 448
   25.3. Indirect tax 450
   25.4. Procedural rights 453
   25.5. Conclusion 457

Chapter 26: The Concept of Criminal Charges in the European Court of Human Rights Case Law 459
   Cristina Mauro

   26.1. Introduction 459
   26.2. Why should we bother? 460
   26.3. What are the implications? 465
   26.4. Which criteria? 469

Part Eight
   The Impact of Human Rights on Tax Litigation before Courts

Chapter 27: Case Law-Based Anti-Avoidance Measures and Principles of Human Rights Protection 477
   Adam Zalasiński

   27.1. General remarks 477
   27.2. The concept of case law-based anti-avoidance measures 478
## Table of Contents

27.2.1. The notion of tax avoidance 478  
27.2.2. Approaches to prevent tax avoidance 481  
27.2.3. Methodology of application of anti-avoidance measures vs determining the tax liability 483  

27.3. The principles of human rights protection that may serve as the standard of assessment of case law-based anti-avoidance measures 483  
27.4. Conclusion 487  

**Chapter 28: The Impact of the Right to a Fair Trial on Tax Evidence: An EU Analysis**  
*Gianluigi Bizioli*  

28.1. Introduction 489  
28.2. The right to a fair trial as international custom 490  
28.3. The right to a fair trial and the ECHR 493  
28.3.1. General remarks 493  
28.3.2. Art. 6 of the ECHR and taxation 494  
28.3.3. The right to a fair trial and the issue of evidence 497  
28.4. The right to a fair trial and EU law 499  
28.4.1. The situation before the entry into force of the Treaty of Lisbon 499  
28.4.2. The role of the EU Charter on Fundamental Rights in the development of the right for an effective remedy and a fair trial after Lisbon 502  
28.5. Conclusion 504  

**Chapter 29: The Protection of Human Rights and Its Impact on Tax Litigation from a Russian Perspective**  
*Danil V. Vinnitskiy*  

29.1. Introduction 505  
29.2. Levels of protection of human rights: The approach of the Russian Federation 506  
29.2.1. National level of the protection of human rights 507  
29.2.2. Supranational level of the protection of human rights 507  
29.2.3. Correlation of national and supranational levels in protection of human rights 509  
29.3. The impact of remedies in human rights protection in tax disputes 513  
29.3.1. The right of protection as an expression of the right to fair trial (Art. 6 of the ECHR) 513  
29.3.1.1. Right to fair trial 513
Table of Contents

29.3.1.2. Burden of proof 514
29.3.1.3. Limitations to the right of property 514
29.3.1.4. *Ne bis in idem* 515
29.3.1.5. Legal interpretations 515
29.3.2. A per-category overview of the impact of ECtHR judgments on tax litigation in Russia 516
29.3.2.1. Disputes on penalties 516
29.3.2.2. VAT refunds 517
29.3.2.3. Interest on repayments of tax 518
29.3.3. Selected issues in the pending ECtHR *Yukos* case 518
29.4. Conclusion 519

Chapter 30: Fair Trial Rights on Taxation: The European and Inter-American Experience 521

*César Alejandro Ruiz Jiménez*

30.1. Introduction 521
30.2. Human rights and tax law 522
30.2.1. Influence of human rights on tax matters 524
30.2.1.1. Right to liberty and security of person 524
30.2.1.2. Right to privacy in life, home and correspondence 525
30.2.1.3. Prohibition of discrimination 526
30.2.2. Influence of taxation on human rights 527
30.2.2.1. Tax equity 527
30.2.2.2. Tax legality 528
30.2.2.3. Ability to pay (tax proportionality) 528
30.2.2.4. Certainty of tax obligations 528
30.3. Right to fair trial 529
30.3.1. European system of human rights 529
30.3.2. Art. 6 of the ECHR 530
30.3.2.1. Civil rights 531
30.3.2.1.1. Tre Traktörer Aktiebolag v. Sweden 531
30.3.2.1.2. Editions Periscope v. France 532
30.3.2.1.3. Schouten and Meldrum v. Netherlands 532
30.3.2.1.4. S. v. Austria 532
30.3.2.1.5. Buildings Societies v. United Kingdom 533
30.3.2.2. Criminal charges 533
30.3.2.2.1. Bendenoun v. France 534
30.3.2.2.2. Paul Smith v. United Kingdom 535

xviii
## Table of Contents

30.3.3. Relevant jurisprudence 535

30.3.3.1. Right to a fair and public hearing 535
   30.3.3.1.1. J.J. v. Netherlands 535
   30.3.3.1.2. H. B. v. Switzerland 536

30.3.3.2. Right to be sentenced within a reasonable time 536
   30.3.3.2.1. H. H. v. Netherlands 537
   30.3.3.2.2. Hozee v. Netherlands 537
   30.3.3.2.3. Skandinavisk Metallförmedling AB v. Sweden 538

30.3.3.3 Right to an independent and impartial tribunal 538
   30.3.3.3.1. S. v. Austria 539

30.3.3.4 Right to presumption of innocence 539
   30.3.3.4.1. S. M. v. Austria 539

30.3.3.5. Right to not incriminate oneself 540
   30.3.3.5.1. Funke v. France 540
   30.3.3.5.2. Maximiliam Abas v. Netherlands 541
   30.3.3.5.3. J. B. v. Switzerland 541

30.3.3.6. Right to a defence 542

30.3.4. Inter-American system of human rights 542
   30.3.4.1. Art. 8 of the Inter-American Convention 542
   30.3.4.2. Current application in the Inter-American system of human rights 544

30.4. Future of the right to a fair trial in tax matters 546
   30.4.1. Right of access to justice 548
   30.4.2. Right to privacy 548
   30.4.3. Right to be silent 548
   30.4.4. Right to defence 549

**List of Authors and Editors** 551