Table of Contents

Acknowledgements xiii

Abbreviations xv

Introduction xvii

Chapter 1: The Internal Market Concept 1

1. Origins of the internal market policy 1
   1.1. European common market 1
   1.2. White Paper programme 3
   1.3. Single European Act 5

2. Articles 14 and 95 of the EC Treaty 6
   2.1. Legal definition 7
      2.1.1. An area without internal frontiers 8
      2.1.2. Free movement of goods, persons, services, and capital 10
   2.2. Community internal market competence 11
      2.2.1. Substantive scope of internal market competence 12
      2.2.1.1. Limits to internal market competence: Conferral of powers 14
      2.2.1.2. Limits to internal market competence: Subsidiarity 19
      2.2.2. Temporal scope 22
      2.3. Legal effect 24
         2.3.1. Legal effect: Community 25
         2.3.2. Legal effects: Member States 27
   2.4. Internal market, common market, and single market 28
      2.4.1. Internal market vs. common market 29
      2.4.2. Internal market vs. single market 32

3. Exercise of Community internal market competence 35
   3.1. European economic constitution models 35
   3.2. Flexibility and differentiation: Different levels of harmonisation 37

4. VAT policy as part of the internal market policy 38
   4.1. Scope of Community VAT competence 39
# Table of Contents

## 4.2. Decision-making procedure for VAT legislation

## 4.3. Exercise of Community VAT competence: Mitigated centralised model

### Chapter 2: The Role of VAT in the Internal Market Policy: Historical Overview

1. Turnover tax systems in the beginning of the European integration process
   - 1.1. Turnover taxes and the European Coal and Steel Community – The Tinbergen Report
   - 1.2. Turnover taxes in the European Economic Community

2. Introduction of a value added tax system
   - 2.2. First and Second Directives: The birth of the EU VAT system
     - 2.2.1. First Directive
     - 2.2.2. Second Directive
   - 2.3. Sixth Directive: Common basis of assessment

3. The new internal market policy and the role of VAT
   - 3.1. The White Paper and the removal of fiscal barriers
   - 3.2. Commission’s VAT programme for the internal market
     - 3.2.1. Abolition of fiscal frontiers and principle of origin
     - 3.2.2. VAT clearing house system
     - 3.2.3. Approximation of VAT rates

4. Approval of the “transitional VAT system”
   - 4.1. Abolition of fiscal frontiers
   - 4.2. Approximation of VAT rates
     - 4.2.1. General rules
     - 4.2.2. Temporary measures
   - 4.3. Ancillary systems and simplification measures
     - 4.3.1. Ancillary systems: Intrastat and VIES
     - 4.3.2. Simplification measures: First Nettoyage Directive
Table of Contents

5. Towards a definitive VAT system: Developments post-1993 79
   5.1. Commission’s 1996 programme for a definitive VAT system 80
   5.2. Other proposed options for a definitive VAT system 82
   5.3. Commission’s 2000 VAT strategy 84

Chapter 3: The Current EU VAT System: Practical Problems 89

1. The current EU VAT system: General overview 89
       1.1.1. Amendments 91
       1.1.2. Derogations 91
   1.2. Intra-Community and international VAT refund system 92
   1.3. The statistical system, the administrative cooperation and training measures: Intrastat, VIES, and Fiscalis 94
       1.3.1. Intrastat 94
       1.3.2. Administrative cooperation 96
   1.4. Community’s own resources 98

2. The difficulties caused by the current EU VAT system 100
   2.1. EU VAT system as an obstacle to the establishment of the internal market 103
       2.1.1. Inter-jurisdictional issues 103
       2.1.1.1. Place of supply rules 103
       2.1.1.2. Tax administration arrangements 112
       2.1.2. Convergence of VAT rates 127
       2.1.2.1. Member States’ application of CVSD rules 131
       2.1.2.2. Critical evaluation of lack of rates convergence 135
   2.2. EU VAT system as an obstacle to the functioning of the internal market 142
       2.2.1. EU VAT system as a direct obstacle to the functioning of the internal market: Non-deductible input tax 142
       2.2.1.1. General restrictions to the right to deduct 143
       2.2.1.2. Specific restrictions to the right to deduct 145
       2.2.1.3. Critical evaluation of lack of uniform criteria for non-deductible input tax 153
# Table of Contents

2.2.2. EU VAT system as an indirect obstacle to the functioning of the internal market: VAT treatment of public sector bodies 154  
2.2.2.1. Concept of taxable person 157  
2.2.2.2. Exemptions 159  
2.2.2.3. Critical evaluation of the VAT treatment of public sector bodies 162  

3. New challenges facing the EU VAT system 170  
3.1. Economic and Monetary Union 170  
3.2. The Lisbon strategy 173  
3.3. EU enlargement 175  

## Chapter 4: The Role of the Court of Justice in the Development of the EU VAT System 177  

1. Origins of Court of Justice intervention in VAT cases 177  
2. Court of Justice jurisprudence on VAT 179  
2.1. EU VAT system as an obstacle to the establishment of the internal market 179  
2.1.1. Inter-jurisdictional issues 179  
2.1.1.1. Place of supply 179  
2.1.1.1.1. Chain transactions 180  
2.1.1.1.2. Fixed establishment 182  
2.1.1.1.3. Reverse-charge mechanism 190  
2.1.1.2. Tax administrative arrangements 203  
2.1.1.2.1. Eighth Directive refunds 203  
2.1.1.2.2. Intrastat 212  
2.1.1.2.3. VIES 214  
2.1.2. Convergence of VAT rates 217  
2.1.2.1. Zero VAT rates 218  
2.1.2.2. Reduced VAT rates 222  
2.1.2.3. Assessment of the Court of Justice jurisprudence 228  
2.2. EU VAT system as an obstacle to the functioning of the internal market 230  
2.2.1. EU VAT system as a direct obstacle to the functioning of the internal market: Non-deductible input tax 230  
2.2.1.1. Standstill clause 231  
2.2.1.2. Cyclical economic reasons clause 240
2.2.1.3. Derogations and the principle of proportionality 242
2.2.2. EU VAT system as an indirect obstacle to the functioning of the internal market: VAT treatment of public sector bodies 247
2.2.2.1. Concept of public sector bodies 248
2.2.2.2. Exemptions 256
2.2.2.3. Assessment of the Court of Justice jurisprudence 257

3. The role of the Court of Justice in the context of the EU VAT system 259
3.1. Court of Justice interpretative methods on VAT cases 261
3.1.1. Teleological interpretation and principle-based decisions 262
3.1.1.1. Decisions based on VAT principles 262
3.1.1.2. Decisions based on general principles of Community law 266
3.1.2. Assessment of interpretative methods on VAT cases: Limited by legislation 278
3.2. Jurisprudential developments vs. legislative measures 279
3.3. Is the Court the appropriate forum to resolve the failings of the EU VAT system? Accusations of judicial activism 281

Conclusion 283
Annexes 287
References 331
Bibliography 359