



Marta Papis-Almansa

ESSAYS
IN HONOUR OF
BEN TERRA

**EU VALUE
ADDED TAX
AND BEYOND**

IBFD

EU Valued Added Tax and Beyond - Essays in Honour of Ben Terra

Why this book?

EU Value Added Tax and Beyond is a book dedicated to Professor Ben Terra, who was a leading expert and one of the most influential authorities on value added tax (VAT). Professor Terra's legacy has had an immense influence on the development of EU tax law.

The book is a collective initiative to address the current issues within the major themes of Professor Terra's work. It aims to answer questions raised by dynamic changes to the legal environment and the social and economic context of VAT and European taxation. The contributions to this book are inspired by Professor Terra's work and the lively discussions that took place during the conference that was held in his memory at Lund University in September 2021.

The book is divided into five parts, addressing in turn the principle of VAT neutrality; the place-of-taxation rules and cross-border issues; tax abuse and avoidance; the Charter of Fundamental Rights and taxation; and the future of EU VAT and indirect taxation. Within these themes, the authors insightfully address the most recent developments within the field, discussing in depth topics such as the right to deduct input VAT, the scope of exemptions, combating VAT fraud, the concept of a fixed establishment and the "use and enjoyment" rule. The wide array of issues regarding abuse and avoidance goes beyond EU VAT, featuring questions on EU law and corporate income tax, as well as a Norwegian law perspective on tax avoidance. International exchange of information in the field of VAT is discussed from the perspective of taxpayers' rights. The book concludes with a historical perspective on the development of EU VAT and an attempt to answer the question of what the future holds for it.

Professor Terra's work and his passion, enthusiasm and generosity in sharing his knowledge with and educating the next generations of tax lawyers have been of enormous importance for academic society, policymakers, tax authorities and businesses alike. This book provides a firm foundation for taking a step forward along Professor Terra's path of continuous self-education, working for the betterment for the EU VAT system and EU tax law, and, as always, helping new entrants navigate their intricacies. Hence, it will be greatly appreciated by the tax community worldwide.

Title:	EU Valued Added Tax and Beyond - Essays in Honour of Ben Terra
Date of publication:	May 2023
ISBN:	978-90-8722-818-7 (print), 978-90-8722-820-0 (PDF), 978-90-8722-819-4 (e-pub)
Type of publication:	Book
Number of pages:	383
Terms:	Shipping fees apply. Shipping information is available on our website
Price (print/online):	EUR 140 USD 168 (VAT excl.)
Price (eBook: e-Pub or PDF):	EUR 112 USD 134 (VAT excl.)

Order information

To order the book, please visit www.ibfd.org/shop/book. You can purchase a copy of the book by means of your credit card, or on the basis of an invoice. Our books encompass a wide variety of topics, and are available in one or more of the following formats:

- IBFD Print books
- IBFD eBooks – downloadable on a variety of electronic devices
- IBFD Online books – accessible online through the IBFD Tax Research Platform

EU Value Added Tax and Beyond

Essays in Honour of Ben Terra

Marta Papis-Almansa



IBFD

Visitors' address:
Rietlandpark 301
1019 DW Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Postal address:
P.O. Box 20237
1000 HE Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Telephone: 31-20-554 0100

Email: info@ibfd.org
www.ibfd.org

© 2023 IBFD

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the written prior permission of the publisher. Applications for permission to reproduce all or part of this publication should be directed to: permissions@ibfd.org.

Disclaimer

This publication has been carefully compiled by IBFD and/or its author, but no representation is made or warranty given (either express or implied) as to the completeness or accuracy of the information it contains. IBFD and/or the author are not liable for the information in this publication or any decision or consequence based on the use of it. IBFD and/or the author will not be liable for any direct or consequential damages arising from the use of the information contained in this publication. However, IBFD will be liable for damages that are the result of an intentional act (*opzet*) or gross negligence (*grove schuld*) on IBFD's part. In no event shall IBFD's total liability exceed the price of the ordered product. The information contained in this publication is not intended to be an advice on any particular matter. No subscriber or other reader should act on the basis of any matter contained in this publication without considering appropriate professional advice.

The IBFD and/or the author cannot be held responsible for external content, broken links or risks within the external websites that are referenced as hyperlinks within this publication.

Where photocopying of parts of this publication is permitted under article 16B of the 1912 Copyright Act jo. the Decree of 20 June 1974, Stb. 351, as amended by the Decree of 23 August 1985, Stb. 471, and article 17 of the 1912 Copyright Act, legally due fees must be paid to Stichting Reprorecht (P.O. Box 882, 1180 AW Amstelveen). Where the use of parts of this publication for the purpose of anthologies, readers and other compilations (article 16 of the 1912 Copyright Act) is concerned, one should address the publisher.

ISBN 978-90-8722-818-7 (print)
ISBN 978-90-8722-819-4 (eBook, ePub); 978-90-8722-820-0 (eBook, PDF)
NUR 826

Table of Contents

Preface	xiii
Acknowledgments	xvii
About Ben	xix

Part I Neutrality of VAT

Chapter 1: Capital Contributions: VAT Neutrality, Economic Reality and Legal Certainty	3
<i>Ad van Doesum</i>	
1.1. Introduction	3
1.2. <i>W-GmbH</i> (C-98/21): A legal or economic approach?	5
1.3. Economic approach and economic reality	6
1.4. Setting the scene: <i>W-GmbH</i>	9
1.5. The recipient of the supply	9
1.6. Intermission	10
1.7. Capital contributions	11
1.7.1. Monetary contributions	12
1.7.2. Contributions in kind	13
1.7.2.1. Contributions in kind as taxable supplies	13
1.7.2.2. Contributions in kind as out-of-scope activities	14
1.7.2.3. Contributions in kind as deemed taxable supplies	16
1.8. Tentative conclusions	21
1.9. The right of deduction and non-taxable contributions in kind	22
1.9.1. General costs	23
1.9.1.1. Cost inclusion test	24
1.9.1.2. Causality test	24
1.9.1.3. Use or intention test	25
1.9.2. Direct and immediate link with the contributor's economic activity	25
1.9.2.1. Strategic contribution	26
1.9.2.2. Accessory contribution	27
1.9.2.3. Controlling contribution	28

1.9.3. Direct and immediate link with the subsidiary's economic activity?	29
1.10. Deduction, neutrality, abuse and internal supplies	29
1.10.1. Abuse of law	30
1.10.2. Internal supplies	32
1.11. Conclusions	33
Chapter 2: Charities and VAT	35
<i>Sigrid Hemels</i>	
2.1. Introduction	35
2.2. Size of the philanthropic sector in the European Union	36
2.3. Charities not always taxable persons for VAT	37
2.4. Exemptions can result in VAT being a cost for charities	39
2.4.1. VAT Exemptions relevant to charities	40
2.4.2. Reason for indeterminate wording of some exemptions	42
2.4.3. Interpretation of the exemptions	43
2.4.4. Non-profit organizations	48
2.5. Solutions for the VAT problems of charities	51
2.5.1. Reduced rate instead of exemption	53
2.5.2. Zero rate or exemptions with deduction of input tax	55
2.5.3. Solution outside of VAT?	56
2.6. Conclusion	60
Chapter 3: Neutrality between Domestic and Foreign Suppliers of Educational Services	61
<i>Marja Hokkanen and Samuli Miettinen</i>	
3.1. Introduction	61
3.2. Exempt educational services under the VAT Directive	62
3.2.1. Educational services under article 132(1)(i) of the VAT Directive (2006/112/EC)	62
3.2.2. Exempt university education	65
3.3. The VAT treatment of educational services in Finland	67
3.3.1. VAT Act of Finland	67
3.3.2. MBA education may be exempt, depending on the domicile of the supplier	68
3.4. The principle of neutrality in VAT	70
3.4.1. What is neutrality?	70
3.4.2. Exemptions and the principle of neutrality	73

3.4.3. Member States must apply exemptions in a non-discriminatory manner	74
3.5. Analysis of the Finnish legal situation	76
3.5.1. Discrimination and fiscal neutrality in case law	76
3.5.2. Implementation of the exempt education services in Finland	77
3.6. Conclusions	79
Part II	
Place of Supply Rules and Cross-Border Issues	
Chapter 4: Balancing between Legal Character and Combating Fraud	85
<i>Mariken van Hilten</i>	
4.1. Very brief sketch of VAT's legal character	85
4.2. External neutrality (in a European Union without frontiers)	86
4.3. Combating fraud	87
4.3.1. Fraudulent schemes and (non-)reliance on EU law	87
4.3.2. Consequences to the detriment of external neutrality	88
4.3.3. Justification?	90
4.4. The fraudsters, the prudent and the in-betweens	90
4.5. Only VAT fraud that (may) result in a loss of EU VAT revenue is affected	92
4.6. Conclusion	93
Chapter 5: Cracking Nuts with a Steamroller: The Place of Use or Enjoyment in VAT	95
<i>Rebecca Millar</i>	
5.1. The problem	96
5.2. Locating consumption in a tax on production	101
5.3. Effective use or enjoyment rules, and alternatives	105
5.3.1. Analysing the EU rules	105
5.3.2. Australia, New Zealand and Singapore	111
5.4. Advertising	115
5.4.1. <i>Athesia Druck</i>	115
5.4.2. Australia, New Zealand and Singapore	121
5.5. Mobile roaming services	124
5.5.1. <i>SK Telecom</i>	124
5.5.2. Australia and New Zealand	129
5.6. Conclusions?	132

Chapter 6: The Phenomenon of “Digitalization” of Services: A Critical Analysis of the Place-of-Supply Provisions Applicable to Certain Categories of Remote Services	133
<i>Mariya Senyk</i>	
6.1. Introduction	134
6.2. Examples of “competitive” place-of-supply provisions	136
6.3. The substantive scope of articles 53 and 54 of the VAT Directive	140
6.3.1. A historical insight	140
6.3.2. Interpretation by the ECJ	143
6.4. The application of articles 53 and 54 of the VAT Directive to remotely delivered services	147
6.4.1. The position of the ECJ	147
6.4.2. Interpretation by the VAT Committee	152
6.4.3. Determining the place where an event/activity “actually takes place”	152
6.5. Electronically supplied services versus services covered by article 54 of the VAT Directive	154
6.5.1. Distinctive features of “electronically supplied services”	154
6.5.2. Services related to educational activities versus electronically supplied services	157
6.5.3. Services related to sporting activities versus electronically supplied services	158
6.6. Possible remedies	160
6.6.1. A “rational result for tax purposes” and other principles of interpretation as a means to ensure legal certainty	160
6.6.2. Redefinition of electronically supplied services?	162
6.6.3. The use of “effective use and enjoyment” to ensure taxation of services consumed in the European Union	163
6.7. Conclusions	164
Chapter 7: Fixed Establishment in the 21st Century	167
<i>Giorgio Beretta</i>	
7.1. Introduction	167
7.2. The concept of core functions	176

7.3.	ECJ case law on core functions	180
7.4.	Core functions and FEs in the 21st century	184
	7.4.1. Permanence	184
	7.4.2. Human resources	186
	7.4.3. Technical resources	190
	7.4.4. Possession	191
7.5.	Outsourcing	193
7.6.	Fragmentation	196
7.7.	Dependence	198
7.8.	Conclusion	201
Chapter 8: Fixed and Permanent Establishments: Dizygotic Twins or Just Acquaintances?		203
<i>Alexis Tsielepis</i>		
8.1.	Introduction: The problem	203
8.2.	The history and importance of the PE	206
8.3.	The history and importance of the FE	208
8.4.	FE versus PE: Dizygotic twins or just acquaintances?	212
	8.4.1. Two different purposes	212
	8.4.2. Language barriers	213
	8.4.3. Scope of a PE broader than that of an FE	214
	8.4.4. The association with the head office	215
	8.4.5. Permanence	216
	8.4.6. Requirement for human intervention/presence of personnel	217
	8.4.7. Agency PE versus agency FE	219
	8.4.8. The starting point	221
8.5.	Conclusion	223
Chapter 9: Fixed Establishment: In Search of New Ideas		225
<i>Tomasz Michalik</i>		
9.1.	A formally autonomous entity as the fixed establishment of another taxable person	226
9.2.	Possible double taxation: A need for a dispute resolution mechanism	234
9.3.	Formally independent entity as an FE of another taxable person: A Gordian Knot	238
9.4.	Conclusions	240

Chapter 10: The Fixed Establishment and the Principle of Legal (Un)certainity	241
<i>Päivi Taipalus</i>	
10.1. Introduction	241
10.2. Legislation in the European Union	242
10.3. Some interpretations of the ECJ on the concept of a fixed establishment	247
10.4. Unanimous views among the Member States	250
10.5. Examples of different interpretations regarding the concept of a fixed establishment in some Member States	252
10.6. Legal certainty	254
10.7. Conclusions	257
Part III	
Tax Abuse and Avoidance	
Chapter 11: Can the Single Tax Principle Justify Anti-Avoidance Rules? The Case of Corporate Income Tax	261
<i>Cécile Brokelind</i>	
11.1. Introduction	262
11.2. Some new elements on the concept of abusive practices	265
11.2.1. Abusive practices as a threshold	265
11.2.2. Codification of the general principle prohibiting abusive practices in the ATAD and its other rules	270
11.3. New questions?	271
11.3.1. The single tax principle as a solution?	271
11.3.2. Tax base erosion and group taxation: A never-ending story	275
11.4. Short conclusion	276
Chapter 12: Tax Avoidance from a Norwegian Perspective: VAT Avoidance vs Income Tax Avoidance – The Norwegian 2020 Approach	277
<i>Ole Gjems-Onstad</i>	
12.1. Free to experiment	277
12.2. Lengthy anti-avoidance provision	278
12.3. Many income tax cases – No VAT case	279
12.4. Enactment of an anti-avoidance provision	281

12.5. Controversial application to VAT	281
12.6. Other “tools” to prevent avoidance of VAT	283
12.7. Loyalty – Not an explicit criterion	283
12.8. The EU law’s general principle of prohibition of abusive practices	285
12.9. “Tax advantage” – In the VAT area	286
12.10. Tax advantages abroad	287
12.11. New criteria: Artificial transactions?	288
12.12. More power to the tax authorities – Less predictability for the taxpayers	289
12.13. Waiting for the EFTA Court...	290
 Part IV The Charter of Fundamental Rights and Taxation 	
Chapter 13: Exchange of Information in VAT and Big Data	293
<i>Eleonor Kristoffersson</i>	
13.1. International exchange of information in the field of VAT	294
13.2. Taxpayers’ rights	297
13.2.1. Taxpayers’ rights and the international exchange of information in the field of VAT	297
13.2.2. Taxpayers’ rights and exchange of VAT information in national law – Example Sweden	300
13.2.3. The DAC and its application in the field of VAT	302
13.3. Final comments	304
 Part V The Future of VAT 	
Chapter 14: What Does the Future Hold for VAT? Some Thoughts on the Development of the European VAT System	309
<i>Donato Raponi</i>	
14.1. Why VAT?	309
14.2. Genesis of European VAT harmonization process	311
14.3. The abolition of fiscal frontiers within the European Union: A dream for half a century	317
14.4. Conclusion	331
List of Contributors	335

Preface

Marta Papis-Almansa and Charlène Herbain

Professor Ben Terra was a leading expert and one of the most influential authorities on value added tax (VAT), and his work has had an immense influence on the development of EU tax law. Sadly, he passed away in June 2019. To cherish his memory and celebrate his legacy, renowned international academics and experts in tax law, his colleagues, friends and family met at a conference held at Lund University, Sweden, on 10 and 11 September 2021. Over 200 participants were physically or digitally present at the conference, including top-ranked academics ranging from the European Union to Australia, as well as professionals from the European institutions and the private sector. The lively conference discussions and in-depth analyses at the highest academic level culminate in this book – a collective initiative to address the current issues within the major themes of Professor Terra’s work, which has been of enormous importance for academic society, policymakers, tax authorities and businesses alike.

The conference and, in its wake, this book aim to address and answer questions raised by dynamic changes to the legal environment and to the social and economic context of VAT and European taxation. The book is divided into five parts, preceded by a tribute, *About Ben*, by Julie Kajus, Professor Terra’s wife and co-author of the famous *A Guide to the European VAT Directives*, and Professor Peter Wattel, a lifelong friend and co-author of *European Tax Law*.

0.1. Neutrality of VAT

The first theme addressed is the principle of VAT neutrality. This principle has featured prominently in the history of VAT, in the work of Professor Terra and now in this book. Fiscal neutrality is one of the fundamental principles in European VAT, closely related to its legal character as a tax on consumption expenditure. The right of deduction, which constitutes an integral part of the VAT mechanism and is intended to relieve traders entirely from the burden of input VAT paid for the goods and services purchased within the framework of their economic activities, is instrumental to neutrality. Professor Terra’s legacy includes important statements *de sententia ferenda* and a critical analysis of the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union (ECJ) on that topic. During the conference, the chair of the first session, Professor Henrik Stensgaard, reminded us of

Professor Terra's capacity to predict the future. In particular, he reminded us that, years before the decision of the ECJ in *Larentia + Minerva* (Case C-108/14), in the context of *Cibo Participations* (Case C-16/00), Professor Terra anticipated the extent to which a holding company could deduct input VAT on costs related to acquiring subsidiaries. Professor Dennis Ramsdahl Jensen discussed fiscal neutrality as a guiding principle for designing, perfecting and interpreting law. The speakers added light to issues at the top of the agenda, such as the concept of economic reality and its impact on the right of deduction (chapter 1 (Ad van Doesum)) and the not-so-neutral effect of VAT on charities (chapter 2 (Sigrid Hemels)). Non-neutral VAT-related compliance was addressed in view of the recent technological enhancements and reforms involving an improved sales tax, called suspended VAT, suggested during the debates. Chapter 3 (Marja Hokkanen and Samuli Miettinen) adds to the discussion on the neutrality of VAT by addressing the treatment of domestic and foreign suppliers of educational services.

0.2. Place-of-supply rules and cross-border issues

The second topic relates to place-of-taxation rules and cross-border issues. This too is a topic at the heart of Professor Terra's work, and one in which he played a pioneering role. As far back as 1989, he highlighted the criticality of the allocation of tax between countries, linking it to the concept of neutrality and to avoidance issues. Not only did Professor Terra author *The Place of Supply in European VAT* – a classic that remains in print even today, 23 years after its first publication – but, as recalled during the conference, he also had first-hand knowledge of this topic, because he ran an import/export business during his studies. In the current environment, in which international trade continues to grow at a remarkable rate, the importance of determining the place of taxation is even more important. The second session provided an in-depth journey through the maze of this topic, tackling in turn questions surrounding external neutrality and the loss of EU revenue (chapter 4 (Mariken van Hilten)), offering a critique of the place of effective use or enjoyment and similar rules in VAT/GST laws (chapter 5 (Rebecca Millar)) and discussing the (un)justified confusion between the concepts of fixed and permanent establishments (chapter 8 (Alexis Tsielepis)). Despite being interpreted in many judgments by the ECJ, the concept of a fixed establishment raises interpretative difficulties resulting in a lack of uniformity amongst the Member States. Its scope, implications and interpretation in the changing economic context are further explored from various perspectives in chapter 7 (Giorgio Beretta), chap-

ter 10 (Päivi Taipalus) and chapter 9 (Tomasz Michalik). The conference also explored the challenges posed by the digitalization and globalization of trade in applying the current categories used for place-of-supply rules under European VAT and questions concerning the European Union's attempts to preserve its taxing rights in disputable situations (chapter 6 (Mariya Senyk)).

0.3. Tax abuse and avoidance

Over the last several years, case law leading to the application of a principle prohibiting abusive practices has developed significantly in the fields of both direct and indirect and harmonized and non-harmonized taxes. Professor Terra was one of the first commentators on and was involved in several international publications regarding this evolution. At the conference, the topic led to discussions spanning a wide array of issues: the difference between evasion, avoidance and abuse; the various positions taken in VAT avoidance cases and the developments that can be expected; the inconsistencies between the abuse standards applied in VAT and those applied in direct taxes; the ways in which national legislation is dealing with avoidance; and the development of the prohibition of abuse of law as a general principle. The attitude of the ECJ towards taxpayers acting in good faith – or a lack thereof – was brought up, and examples of tax evasion schemes were provided. The question of whether the single-tax principle, as a means of solving the problem of tax competition, can justify anti-avoidance rules in the context of corporate income tax was also discussed (chapter 11 (Cécile Brokelind)). The presentation on the Norwegian legislation of 2020 on tax avoidance breaking out of the confines of EU law provided an additional perspective on the topic of tax abuse and avoidance (chapter 12 (Ole Gjems-Onstad)).

0.4. The Charter of Fundamental Rights and taxation

The fourth topic revolves around what Professor Terra called the “rising star” in the effective protection of taxpayers’ rights in VAT matters, namely the Charter of Fundamental Rights. The exchanges during the conference showed that, while the Charter has increasingly influenced procedural and substantive VAT law, all is not sunshine and roses. Points of utmost importance were raised, such as the interplay between the Charter and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights; the uncoded general principle of Union law and national constitutions of the Member

States; the differences between the principle of legal certainty and that of legitimate expectations; and their indispensable reconciliation to ensure the effectiveness of EU law. In addition, the massive increase in exchange of information in the last decade was contrasted with the unmet need of protection of taxpayers' rights and the lack of coordination between Member States (chapter 13 (Eleonor Kristoffersson)).

0.5. The future of EU VAT and indirect taxation

Last – but far from least – is the topic of the future of EU VAT and indirect taxation. A historical perspective on the birth and development of the EU VAT system was presented (chapter 14 (Donato Raponi)). The discussion revealed that the justification for VAT to be shaped as it is is long gone and that, while it has improved over the years, the relevant work remains incomplete and further harmonization and modernization of EU VAT is needed and possible. The main improvement in respect of VAT collection is certainly in the area of administrative cooperation. It has, however, been shown that, up to this day, it has not reached its full potential. Other improvements, such as real time reporting, blockchain use, simplified vendor collection (MOSS, OSS), split payment and digital central bank currency, were discussed. Finally, to remind us all to always stay on our toes, we were taken to uncharted territories with an out-of-the-box proposal for a “green VAT”, based on the life cycle environmental cost of all goods and services, which is poised to revolutionize VAT as we know it.

The conference was and this collection of essays is an attempt to build upon and implement the legacy of Professor Terra, the importance of which goes beyond the development of the EU VAT system and EU tax law in general. Professor Terra's passion, enthusiasm and generosity in sharing his knowledge with and educating the next generation of tax lawyers has been, for many, essential to the realization that VAT, with its “irresistible attraction”, is indeed the Mata Hari of the tax world.¹ With this book, we also want to take one step forward, following Professor Terra's path in continuously educating ourselves, working for the betterment of the EU VAT system and EU tax law, and always helping new entrants to the field navigate its intricacies.

1. B. Terra & J. Kajus, *Introduction to European VAT – Commentaries on European VAT Directives & Other Indirect Tax Acts* preface, Global Topics IBFD (accessed 19 Jan. 2022).

Acknowledgments

First and foremost, I would like to thank Professor Ben Terra, my teacher and friend, to whom this book is dedicated. I met Professor Terra for the first time in 2010, when I was a student in the master's programme in European and international tax law at Lund University. Joining the programme and meeting Professor Terra, along with Professor Cécile Brokelind and Professor Oskar Henkow, had a fundamental impact on my future career. Not only was it the exact moment at which I realized that I wanted to work with VAT but it was also the moment at which it became obvious that I would do my best to develop my academic skills and stay within academia for the long term. My story is not original or unique in that respect. I have heard many testimonies from students of Professor Terra relating how grateful they are to him for changing their lives.

Ben, thank you for showing me how fascinating the world of VAT is; for the generous and continuous sharing of your knowledge; for your time, patience and thoroughness in the supervision of my doctoral thesis; for your encouragement and trust; and for involving me in many of your projects. Thank you for always treating me like an equal partner in any discussion we had and for your subtle way of directing me in my search for answers. I am forever grateful for having had the chance to know you and learn from you. You have been my mentor, and I keep your lessons vividly in mind in my daily endeavours as a researcher, an academic teacher and a scholar who is passionate about VAT.

I would also like to express my gratitude to the many without whom the publication of this compilation would not have been possible. I would like to thank the family of Professor Terra, who, from the very beginning, were involved in and supported the organization of the conference and the publication of this book. I am especially grateful to Julie Kajus and Elze Terra, whose input and loving testimony highlighted Ben's extraordinary passion for tax law and his devotion to teaching and to his students. I would like to wholeheartedly thank all the co-organizers of the conference, held at Lund University in September 2021, which inspired this book: Cécile Brokelind, Karina Kim Egholm Elgaard, Eleonor Kristoffersson, Anders Mikelsen, Dennis Ramsdahl Jensen and Henrik Stensgaard. Their contributions, feedback and involvement in the planning and coordination of the event, as well as their help with the peer review of the essays included in this publication, have been much appreciated.

I would also like to thank to all the speakers, panellists and moderators at the conference and the authors of the essays collected herein for their inspiring contributions to the book, for their presentations and the lively discussions they sparked and for sharing their many personal stories and memories about Ben. In addition to the names already mentioned, these are (in alphabetical order) Susi Baerentzen, Giorgio Beretta, Ad van Doesum, Joachim Englisch, Katarina Fast, Raymond Feen, Rita de la Feria, Mattias Fri, Ole Gjems-Onstad, Karl-Heinz Haydl, Sigrid Hemels, Charlène Herbain, Mariken van Hilten, Marja Hokkanen, David Hummel, Caspar Jensen, Marie Lamensch, Tomasz Michalik, Samuli Miettinen, Rebecca Millar, Donato Raponi, Pernilla Rendahl, Mariya Senyk, Päivi Taipalus, Benoît Timmermans, Edoardo Traversa, Alexis Tsielepis, Peter Wattel and Walter de Wit.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to the sponsors of the event, the Nordic Tax Research Council, EY, Svalner Tax & Transaktion and the VAT Institute (*Momsinstituttet*), as well as this book's publisher, IBFD.

Last, but not least, I would like to thank the assistant students from WEL-MA, Copenhagen University, Monica, Mie and Tobias for their invaluable help in compiling and editing the essays published herein.

Marta Papis-Almansa
Copenhagen, March 2023.

About Ben

Professor Ben J.M. Terra, Dr, Dr H.C.
(2 September 1947-30 June 2019)

Julie Kajus

In 1984, after having graduated in law and been admitted to the bar, I wanted to do a 1-year postgraduate study (LLM) in European business law and applied for admission at three universities: one in Belgium, one in England and one in the Netherlands. I was accepted by all of them. I politely declined the offers from Brussels and Amsterdam and chose the University of Canterbury. A few weeks before the start of the term, I travelled from Denmark, where I lived, to Canterbury to find accommodation and to have a look at the university. It was not at all what I had expected. I immediately fled from Canterbury to the Netherlands and begged the administration at the University of Amsterdam to readmit me, which they did.

One of the subjects in the LLM study was international trade and indirect taxes, taught by a certain Ben Terra. I had never in my life considered studying any indirect taxes whatsoever, including value added tax (VAT), let alone working with VAT. I was a Danish lawyer who had been lucky enough to avoid having to study tax during my law studies but had instead chosen commercial law and competition law. My dream was to get that LLM degree and venture into something exciting, such as working with competition law either at the European Commission or in a big international law firm.

However, the decision to flee England and to go to Amsterdam changed my life forever, because Ben became my teacher. I know of many people whose lives were changed because of having been taught VAT by Ben, but perhaps none as much as mine, because, in addition to being my teacher in international trade and VAT, Ben and I later became colleagues, then best friends, and eventually we married.

I will come back to the reason why peoples' lives might have changed because of having met Ben, but first a few highlights about Ben's working life. I will try to be brief, but it is difficult, considering what a diverse and rich (working) life Ben had.

Ben studied international law at the University of Amsterdam and (indirect) taxation at Leiden University. In order to pay for his studies, Ben

managed a “brown” bar, de Prins, on the Prinsengracht in Amsterdam. Later, he opened a shop close to the Anne Frank house, where he mainly sold Asian antiques.

After having finished his studies, Ben was appointed assistant professor of law at Leiden University and later at the University of Amsterdam. In 1984, he defended his doctoral thesis, *Omzetbelasting bij grensoverschrijdend verkeer* (Turnover Tax in Cross-Border Trade). In 1987, he was granted tenure as professor of law at the University of Amsterdam and, a year later, at Leiden University. In 2006, Ben was appointed honorary doctor in economics at Lund University, where he worked for more than 13 years and where he and Oskar Henkow founded an international postgraduate study programme in VAT, customs and excises. In addition, Ben was visiting professor at a number of universities all over the world.

Ben was not only an academic but also a businessman. In 1987, he became an indirect tax partner in what was then Ernst & Young (now EY), the Netherlands, and, for a number of years, he was head of the global indirect tax practice of Ernst & Young and member of the board of Ernst & Young Tax Advisors, the Netherlands.

In addition, Ben was a consultant with the OECD, the European Commission and the IMF, and he was involved in reorganizing tax departments, drafting law and policy, and training tax officials in various countries. I was sometimes involved in the training of tax officials as well. In 1991, there were several seminars for tax officials in various eastern European countries. In (what was then) Czechoslovakia, for example, in the middle of winter, Ben and I travelled by car from the Netherlands to Prague, where we were greeted by our blind interpreter, Milan, an amazing person, who guided us smoothly to the camp a few hours’ drive away where the 2-week seminars were held and where the rooms reached a maximum of 15 degrees on a lucky day. In Albania, we were witnesses to the inauguration of the first traffic light in Tirana. In Kiev, in December, we stayed in a hotel on the eighth floor. The heating stopped at the seventh floor.

I am tempted to say that, of course, Ben wrote numerous books and articles on customs, excises and VAT throughout his life. Quite a few of these articles would be on art and VAT. All his life, Ben was very interested in art. Wherever in the world his work took him, he would always find time to go for a walk and find small antique and art shops, in principle just to browse, but just as often he would bring home a little piece of art. A keepsake.

I think that one of the reasons that Ben was so good at his work, whether it was teaching or advising, was his diversity, his energy, his enthusiasm and curiosity in so many aspects of life and, not least, his strict work discipline. Ben also worked with scenarios. He would think ahead: what if this happens, what if that happens, what is the solution, what can one do? He often tried out new ideas, new approaches in his work. For example, long before it became the norm, Ben was actively involved in introducing email and the Internet as communication and working tools within Ernst & Young, the Netherlands.

Ben was both an academic and a very good (tax) adviser, but what he loved the most was teaching, especially teaching young people. Ben worked with and taught indirect taxes and customs from 1977 until the beginning of 2019, i.e. for 41 years.

I mentioned earlier that meeting Ben could change one's life, and I know for a fact that happened to quite a few people (including myself). University studies, such as direct taxation and economics, most of the time include(d) a course in indirect taxation, which many students found, if not beneath their dignity, then at least boring, something to get over with. However, some of those students told me, when I later met them, that when Ben did those courses, his enthusiasm for the subject and the way in which he taught made them quit direct taxation/economics and enter the amazing and bewildering world of VAT. When teaching and discussing, especially concerning VAT, Ben would often also deal with other fields of law, such as human rights, State aid and competition law. When Ben lectured or explained the intricacies of VAT, he would put so much energy into trying to make his students, whether at universities, seminars or internal trainings, see the light, try to broaden their minds, to make them understand, to make them think and question authorities, judgements, interpretations of law, even the law itself. In his classes, Ben would often use the Socratic method, which some students found tough or bewildering, especially those who wanted a result book: "What is the right answer?" To which Ben would answer: "There is not necessarily a right answer."

However, most importantly of all, whether Ben was lecturing at a seminar, teaching at universities or advising a client or a policymaker, he always did it with a twinkle in his eye.

Peter J. Wattel

Ben Terra was a professor of tax law at at least three universities: Leiden University and the University of Amsterdam (UvA), the Netherlands, and Lund University, Sweden. It therefore made sense that his inaugural lecture in Amsterdam was on the place of supply in VAT law.

Ben and I were colleagues at the UvA for 30 years. For 26 of these years, we were co-authors of six editions of what is now Terra/Wattel, *European Tax Law*, eighth edition (2022).

Ben also read law at the UvA as a student. This took him 8 years, because, amongst other reasons, he not only studied but also practised international trade throughout. In those 8 years as a student, he also ran three shops: (i) Terra Art Dealers; (ii) Asian Art Amsterdam; and (iii) The Green Elephant, an export firm located in Bangkok. Ben knew what he was talking about when he talked about international trade.

Even after switching from trade and shops to law and academia, Ben remained a creative salesman. He was particularly good at selling the EU VAT system in the rest of the world, especially in China, where he would explain that “Shanghai” means “over the sea” and that *he* was from a small, small country, far, far away, which was *below* sea level. On some of these occasions, he would be on the platform together with his daughter Elze, who was studying Mandarin in China and would translate his English-language spoken presentations into Mandarin. Audiences were thrilled by this family firm and, in the process, were convinced that they should absolutely have a VAT system. Wherever Ben is now, I am sure that those he is with will not only have their hands full with him, but they will also have a VAT system.

I first met Ben when he was head of indirect tax and customs duties at the Netherlands tax administration training institute. Ben was a rather conspicuous and colourful presence in that environment. He was not your average civil servant, neither in language nor in appearance. He enjoyed mildly mocking – or even shocking – people. There was always a certain subversiveness about him. Once, at the tax department of the UvA, when we were discussing the fundamentally thorny issue of whether a university should accept professors’ chairs instituted by commercial sponsors, Ben announced, to the horror of some present, that if such were ever to be instituted, he would simply *adore* occupying, for example, the Heineken Beer Chair in Excise Duties Law.

He remained rather colourfully non-conformist. For instance, after joining Ernst & Young, he kept parking his Deux Chevaux conspicuously next to the expensive Audis, Mercedeses and BMWs of the firm's partners, until the managing partner told him, "OK, OK, you made your point; get over to my office, and we'll get you a baby Benz".

Ben became a professor at the UvA in 1987, and, after some time, he basically told me that I wanted to become a professor too, because there were so many important policy documents and developments within the EU institutions on direct taxes that no one was aware of, and the UvA should be at the forefront and have a professor specializing in that field, which was certain to become big. What foresight he had. Ben had read all of those obscure documents on direct taxes, and, as always, was therefore well ahead of developments that very few other people saw coming. I am not sure whose idea it eventually was to institute that chair in EU tax law, but I am sure that Ben greatly contributed to my first professorship at the UvA, and within a year, in 1993, we published the first edition of our book on the topic.

Ben was a very good teacher. At the UvA, Bart van Zadelhoff (two metres tall) and he (rather shorter) would lecture together in the regular tax law curriculum, as a sort of two-man comedy act (Mini and Maxi in VAT-land, as it were), captivating the attention of students who, until then, had thought that the VAT course was a fatigue duty to be gotten over with. Lecture attendance significantly increased, and I believe the Netherlands tax administration may have Ben to thank for the rising number of applications for the job of indirect taxes inspector.

As an author and as a speaker, Ben was prolific. The law department of the UvA had a rule that any extracurricular remuneration attributable to UvA employment, such as authors' and lecturers' fees from third parties, should be transferred to the department's account, to serve department purposes. Of all yearly contributions to the tax department's account, Ben's were invariably the largest, because, as he put it, if it doesn't go to our department, it goes to the EY partners, who will only do foolish things with it – and will probably consider it peanuts anyway. This was not the only reason Ben was very well liked in our department. It was clear that he put his heart into academia, and into our department, although he would never have said that in those words.

Ben and I worked together on six editions of European Tax Law, I on the general EU law and direct taxation chapters, Ben on indirect taxation and

capital duty. Only the chapters on exchange of information and EU legal forms were joint efforts. We did not interfere with each other's chapters – Ben out of politeness, and I out of a lack of knowledge of his subjects. The seventh edition, in 2018, became too unwieldy and was split into two volumes. In addition, other authors were invited. Ben had designated as his successor Oscar Henkow, of Lund University, Sweden, where Ben was also professor, but tragically, Oscar and his family died, and Ben became ill. Several times he appeared to have overcome his illness, but on Monday, 8 April 2019, Ben sent me the following email, which still horrifies me (my translation):

Dear Peter,

The doctors at [two hospitals] agree that my lungs have been affected by malignant lymphoma cells for which, given the (already diminished) quality of my lungs, no cure seems possible. So: end of story.

I am sorry that I have not been able to give a follow-up to our project “European tax law”. It only remains for me to thank you for our pleasant cooperation.

Ben.

This is very much Ben: (i) very matter-of-fact; (ii) no unnecessary emotions; and (iii) fraternal.

Although Ben could not contribute to the seventh edition, he did check, at my request, our chapter on EU legal forms, and he observed that a particular Commission proposal on some non-tax issue *I* thought was still pending had already been withdrawn by the Commission. This is also very Ben: almost everyone in tax had missed that non-tax development, but not Ben. He read, knew *and* remembered everything.

For the seventh edition, I changed the title of the book to Terra/Wattel and divided it into two volumes. The first volume, on general EU law subjects and direct taxation, was published in 2018 and will see its eighth edition in 2022. The second volume, on indirect taxation, which Ben regrettably could no longer write or edit, will be published this year (2021), revised by four able successors, Marie Lamensch (Université Catholique de Louvain and Vrije Universiteit Brussel, Belgium), Madeleine Merkx (Erasmus University Rotterdam (EUR), the Netherlands), Martijn Schippers (EUR) and Ilona van de Eijnde (EUR). So Ben will live on in the title of his academic baby.

Notes

Ruled lines for taking notes.



The Home of International Taxation

Contact

IBFD Head Office

Tel.: +31-20-554 0100 (GMT+2)

Email: info@ibfd.org

Visitors' Address:

Rietlandpark 301
1019 DW, Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Postal Address:

P.O. Box 20237
1000 HE Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Order online at www.ibfd.org/Shop/Book