

---

## Table of Contents

<b>Preface</b>	v
<b>Abbreviations</b>	xv
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction</b>	
1.1. Objective	2
1.2. Structure of discussion	2
<b>Chapter 2. Background and Theory</b>	
2.1. Terminology	5
2.2. Transfer pricing	8
2.2.1. Historical development	10
2.2.2. The continuum of direct and indirect approaches to income attribution	12
2.2.3. Theory and practice of transfer pricing	14
2.2.4. Problems of transfer pricing and the separate-entity approach	15
2.3. Formulary apportionment	19
2.3.1. A theoretical framework for formulary apportionment in Europe	19
2.3.1.1. The dispute over formulary apportionment	19
2.3.1.2. Some caveats	21
2.3.1.3. Formulary apportionment and the notion of source	22
2.3.1.4. The “true source” of income	24
2.3.1.5. Assumptions (not) underlying formulary apportionment	26
2.3.1.6. Musgrave’s concept of source	26
2.3.1.7. The benefit principle as a guideline for apportioning corporate income	30
2.3.1.8. Apportionment factors as proxies for benefits received and activities causing costs	37
2.3.1.9. Summary	39
2.3.2. OECD standpoint	39

## Table of Contents

---

2.4.	The Commission's proposals	44
2.4.1.	The analytic part of the company tax study	44
2.4.2.	The four models	46
2.4.2.1.	Home State Taxation	46
2.4.2.2.	Common (Consolidated) Base Taxation	47
2.4.2.3.	Harmonized Tax Base	47
2.4.2.4.	European Union Company Income Tax	48
2.4.3.	Commission activities since 2001	49
2.4.4.	Synthesis: a comprehensive approach to partially harmonizing corporate income taxes	50
2.5.	Alternative solutions	51
2.5.1.	Improvements in transfer pricing	52
2.5.2.	Apportionment based on macro factors	54
2.5.3.	Value-added apportionment	56
2.5.4.	European Tax Allocation System	59

### Chapter 3. Existing Formulary Apportionment Systems

3.1.	Preliminary remarks	63
3.2.	United States	65
3.2.1.	Background	66
3.2.1.1.	General setting	66
3.2.1.2.	Development of apportionment systems	67
3.2.1.3.	Constitutional limitations on state taxation and apportionment	69
3.2.2.	Delineation of taxable entity	75
3.2.2.1.	Overview	75
3.2.2.2.	Consolidation	75
3.2.2.3.	Unitary combination	76
3.2.3.	Nexus requirements	83
3.2.4.	Apportionable tax base	86
3.2.4.1.	Tax base in general	86
3.2.4.2.	Business/non-business income distinction	86
3.2.4.3.	Water's edge limitation	89
3.2.4.4.	Treatment of dividends	91
3.2.4.5.	Addback statutes	94
3.2.5.	Apportionment	94
3.2.5.1.	The standard formula	94
3.2.5.2.	The property factor	96
3.2.5.3.	The payroll factor	96

3.2.5.4.	The sales factor	97
3.2.5.5.	Industry-specific formulae	100
3.2.5.6.	Relief mechanism	102
3.2.6.	State tax incentives	103
3.2.7.	Administration	104
3.2.7.1.	Filing requirements and collection of tax	104
3.2.7.2.	Coordination and harmonization efforts	105
3.2.8.	Evaluation	106
3.3.	Canada	108
3.3.1.	Background	108
3.3.1.1.	General setting	108
3.3.1.2.	Historical development	111
3.3.1.3.	Equalization	113
3.3.2.	Delineation of taxable entity	114
3.3.3.	Apportionable tax base	115
3.3.4.	Nexus requirement	116
3.3.5.	Apportionment	117
3.3.5.1.	The standard formula	117
3.3.5.2.	Industry-specific formulae	118
3.3.6.	Provincial tax credits	120
3.3.7.	Administration	122
3.3.8.	Evaluation	123
3.4.	Switzerland	124
3.4.1.	Background	124
3.4.1.1.	General background and tax system	124
3.4.1.2.	Federal-cantonal transfer payments	127
3.4.1.3.	Constitutional background of tax base allocation	128
3.4.2.	Delineation of taxable entity	129
3.4.3.	Nexus requirements: <i>Steuerdomizile</i>	130
3.4.4.	Apportionable tax base	132
3.4.4.1.	Tax base in general	132
3.4.4.2.	Direct and indirect methods of allocation	132
3.4.4.3.	International application of methods	135
3.4.5.	Apportionment	135
3.4.5.1.	“Direct” and “indirect” method of apportionment	136
3.4.5.2.	Formulae for the “indirect” method	138
3.4.5.3.	<i>Präzipuum</i>	140
3.4.5.4.	Treatment of losses	141
3.4.6.	Administration	145
3.4.6.1.	Administrative procedures	145

## Table of Contents

---

3.4.6.2.	Coordination	145
3.4.6.3.	Appeals	146
3.4.7.	Evaluation	146
3.5.	Germany: trade tax apportionment	147
3.5.1.	Background	148
3.5.1.1.	The German tax system and the role of the trade tax	148
3.5.1.2.	Theory and historical development of the trade tax	150
3.5.2.	Apportionable tax base	152
3.5.3.	Nexus requirement	154
3.5.4.	Delineation of taxable entity	155
3.5.5.	Apportionment	157
3.5.5.1.	Standard formula	157
3.5.5.2.	Apportionment for multi-municipal permanent establishments	159
3.5.5.3.	Allocation in case of extraordinary circumstances	160
3.5.6.	Administration	161
3.5.6.1.	Administration and adjustment of decisions	161
3.5.6.2.	Appeals	163
3.5.7.	Evaluation	164
3.6.	Comparison of the four systems	165
 <b>Chapter 4. Formulary Apportionment: Proposals for the European Community</b>		
4.1.	Preliminary considerations	171
4.1.1.	Basic criteria to be satisfied by the proposed EC system	171
4.1.2.	Theoretical options	172
4.1.3.	Procedural considerations on the design of apportionment rules	173
4.2.	Delineation of taxable entity	176
4.2.1.	Group taxation as a central element of the Commission's proposals	176
4.2.2.	Group definition	176
4.2.2.1.	Combination of legal and economic criteria	176
4.2.2.2.	The standard holding threshold	179
4.2.2.3.	Deviations on the basis of economic criteria	180
4.2.3.	Water's edge apportionment	183
4.2.3.1.	The case for a water's edge limitation	183

4.2.3.2.	Implications for the concept of EC formulary apportionment	185
4.2.3.3.	Complexities	186
4.2.4.	The choice between optional and mandatory group taxation	187
4.2.5.	Coexistence of formulary apportionment and transfer pricing	189
4.3.	Apportionable tax base	189
4.3.1.	The function of the common tax base	189
4.3.2.	Consolidation	194
4.3.3.	The general relationship between apportionment and specific allocation	197
4.3.4.	Treatment of dividends, interest and royalties	198
4.3.5.	Fields in which specific allocation probably will apply for political reasons	200
4.4.	Nexus requirement	202
4.5.	Apportionment	205
4.5.1.	The need for EC-wide uniformity of formulae	205
4.5.2.	The standard formula	206
4.5.2.1.	Composition of the formula	206
4.5.2.2.	The property factor	210
4.5.2.3.	The payroll factor	213
4.5.2.4.	The gross receipts factor	215
4.5.3.	Industry-specific formulae	221
4.5.4.	Präzipuum	224
4.5.5.	The treatment of intangibles	224
4.5.6.	Overall losses	228
4.6.	Framework considerations	229
4.6.1.	Administration	229
4.6.2.	Dispute resolution, appeals and relief mechanism	232
4.6.3.	Subsequent assessment in the Member States	238
4.6.4.	Member State tax incentives	239
4.6.5.	Legal basis of implementation	240
4.6.6.	Enhanced cooperation	244
4.6.7.	Development of implementing provisions and interpretative guidelines	246

## Table of Contents

---

### Chapter 5. Evaluation of the Proposals

5.1.	Goal attainment	247
5.2.	EC law	248
5.2.1.	Territorial taxation of corporate profits and the fundamental freedoms	248
5.2.2.	A solution to current problems which is consistent with the fundamental freedoms	250
5.2.3.	Member State incentives and the fundamental freedoms	251
5.2.4.	State aid rules	255
5.3.	International tax law	256
5.3.1.	General effect on treaty relations with third countries	256
5.3.2.	Non-discrimination provisions	259
5.3.3.	Long-term perspective	260
5.4.	Economic efficiency: neutrality and tax competition	260
5.4.1.	Neutrality	260
5.4.2.	Tax competition	264
5.5.	Taxpayer equity	267
5.6.	Interjurisdictional equity	269
5.7.	Member State sovereignty	270
5.8.	Lack of opportunities for tax avoidance	272
5.9.	Revenue effects	275
5.10.	Administrative feasibility/simplicity	277
<b>Chapter 6. Conclusion</b>		279
<b>Bibliography</b>		281
<b>Official Publications</b>		317
<b>Court Decisions</b>		323

Translation of Area-Specific Terminology	335
--	-----