

Taxation of Entertainers and Sportspersons Performing Abroad

Tax Law

The main international sources of tax law are bilateral or multilateral treaties and on important source for the interpretation of the jurisdiction of the two countries involved.

Guglielmo Maisto / Series Editor

IBFD

Taxation of Entertainers and Sportspersons Performing Abroad

Why this book?

Taxation of Entertainers and Sportspersons Performing Abroad, comprising the proceedings and working documents of an annual seminar held in Milan in November 2015, is a detailed and comprehensive study on the taxation of highly mobile individuals engaged in the artistic and sports sectors. It begins with a comparative analysis of the domestic tax regime of such individuals and then examines the influence of EU law on national law, with a particular emphasis on the jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union.

The book then moves to selected tax treaty issues. In particular, it analyses: (i) the history of article 17 of the OECD Model Tax Convention; (ii) recent developments concerning that article, particularly the 2014 amendments to the Commentary on Article 17 of the OECD Model Convention; (iii) tax treaty issues related to qualification, allocation and apportionment of income derived by entertainers and sportspersons; and (iv) the taxation of income from image rights, sponsorship and advertising.

Special attention is devoted to the application of article 17(2) of the OECD Model Convention, issues concerning the elimination of international double taxation and the taxation of international sport events and tournaments, such as the Olympic Games and the UEFA and FIFA Championships.

Individual country surveys provide an in-depth analysis of the domestic tax regimes and actual tax treaty application and practices by various states, including Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, France, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands, Poland, Portugal, Spain, Switzerland, the United Kingdom and the United States.

Title:	Taxation of Entertainers and Sportspersons Performing Abroad
Editor(s):	Guglielmo Maisto
Date of publication:	June/July 2016
ISBN:	978-90-8722-361-8(print/online), 978-90-8722-362-5(eBook)
Type of publication:	Print, Online and eBook
Number of pages:	± 600
Terms:	Shipping fees apply. Shipping information is available on our website
Price (print/online):	EUR 115 / USD 135 (VAT excl.)
Price (eBook):	EUR 92 / USD 108 (VAT excl.)

Order information

To order the book, please visit www.ibfd.org/IBFD-Products/shop. You can purchase a copy of the book by means of your credit card, or on the basis of an invoice. Our books encompass a wide variety of topics, and are available in one or more of the following formats:

- IBFD Print books
- IBFD eBooks – downloadable on a variety of electronic devices
- IBFD Online books – accessible online through the IBFD Tax Research Platform



IBFD, Your Portal to Cross-Border Tax Expertise

IBFD Publications BV

Visitors' address:
Rietlandpark 301
1019 DW Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Postal address:
P.O. Box 20237
1000 HE Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Telephone: 31-20-554 0100
Fax: 31-20-622 8658
www.ibfd.org

© 2016 IBFD

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the written prior permission of the publisher. Applications for permission to reproduce all or part of this publication should be directed to: permissions@ibfd.org.

Disclaimer

This publication has been carefully compiled by the IBFD and/or its authors, but no representation is made or warranty given (either express or implied) as to the completeness or accuracy of the information it contains. The IBFD and/or the authors are not liable for the information in this publication or any decision or consequence based on the use of it. The IBFD and/or the authors will not be liable for any direct or consequential damages arising from the use of the information contained in this publication. However, the IBFD will be liable for damages that are the result of an intentional act (*opzet*) or gross negligence (*grove schuld*) on the IBFD's part. In no event shall the IBFD's total liability exceed the price of the ordered product. The information contained in this publication is not intended to be an advice on any particular matter. No subscriber or other reader should act on the basis of any matter contained in this publication without considering appropriate professional advice.

Where photocopying of parts of this publication is permitted under article 16B of the 1912 Copyright Act jo. the Decree of 20 June 1974, Stb. 351, as amended by the Decree of 23 August 1985, Stb. 471, and article 17 of the 1912 Copyright Act, legally due fees must be paid to Stichting Reprorecht (P.O. Box 882, 1180 AW Amstelveen). Where the use of parts of this publication for the purpose of anthologies, readers and other compilations (article 16 of the 1912 Copyright Act) is concerned, one should address the publisher.

ISSN 1574-969X
ISBN 978-90-8722-361-8 (print)
ISBN 978-90-8722-362-5 (eBook)
NUR 826

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	v
-------------------------	---

Foreword	vii
-----------------	-----

Part One Taxation under Domestic Law

Chapter 1:	The Canadian/US Experience	3
	<i>Chris Anderson</i>	

1.1.	Introduction	3
1.2.	Taxation of resident entertainers	3
1.2.1.	Basis of taxation	3
1.2.2.	Employment income or business income	5
1.2.3.	Income deferral plans	7
1.2.4.	Providing services through a corporation	10
1.2.5.	State, provincial and local taxation	12
1.2.6.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	15
1.3.	Taxation of non-residents	16
1.3.1.	Income from personal services	16
1.3.1.1.	General rules	16
1.3.1.2.	Actor tax	19
1.3.2.	Income from the use (and sale) of image rights	22
1.3.3.	Sponsorship, advertising, appearance and endorsement income	23
1.3.4.	Recording income	24
1.3.5.	Merchandising income	24
1.3.6.	Signing bonuses	25
1.4.	Conclusions	25

Chapter 2:	The EU Experience	27
	<i>Daniel Gutmann</i>	

2.1.	Introduction	27
2.2.	Resident sportspersons and entertainers	28
2.2.1.	Existence of income	28
2.2.2.	Characterization of income	28
2.2.2.1.	The content of income classification	28

2.2.2.2.	The tax effect of income classification	29
2.2.3.	Taxation rules	30
2.3.	Non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	33
2.3.1.	Standard approach	33
2.3.2.	Look-through rules	34
Chapter 3:	The Influence of EU Law on the Design of Domestic Tax Law for Entertainers and Sportspersons	37
	<i>Alexander Rust</i>	
3.1.	Introduction	37
3.2.	Different treatment of resident and non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	38
3.2.1.	Deduction of business expenses	38
3.2.2.	Deduction of private expenses	39
3.2.3.	Progressive tax rate	41
3.3.	Withholding taxes for both resident and non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	41
3.4.	Withholding taxes applied exclusively to non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	43
3.4.1.	Liquidity and interest disadvantages	44
3.4.2.	Administrative burdens and liability of the recipient of the services	44
3.4.3.	Cash flow disadvantage as a restriction	45
3.4.4.	Comparability	46
3.4.5.	Justification	47
3.4.6.	Design of a withholding tax mechanism	49
3.5.	Conclusions	51
Part Two		
Taxation under Tax Treaty Law		
Chapter 4:	Historical Development of Article 17 OECD Model: From the League of Nations to the 2010 OECD Model	55
	<i>Andrea Parolini</i>	
4.1.	Taxation of sportspersons and entertainers in the works of the League of Nations	55
4.2.	The approaches of the OEEC and the OECD	60

4.2.1.	The Second Report of the Fiscal Committee of the OEEC (the 1959 report)	60
4.2.2.	The 1963 OECD Draft Double Taxation Convention on Income and Capital	64
4.2.3.	The 1964-1977 period	65
4.2.4.	The 1977 OECD Model Double Taxation Convention on Income and on Capital	68
4.2.5.	The 1987 OECD report The Taxation of Income Derived from Entertainment, Artistic and Sporting Activities	71
4.2.5.1.	Introduction	71
4.2.5.2.	The guidelines provided by the OECD in the interpretation of article 17	73
4.2.6.	The 1992-1997 OECD Model Convention	78
4.2.7.	The 2000 Update to the OECD Model	81
4.2.8.	The 2008 Update to the OECD Model	82
4.2.9.	The 2010 Update to the OECD Model	82
4.3.	Conclusions	83
Chapter 5:	The 2014 Changes to Article 17 of the OECD Model Tax Convention	85
	<i>Jacques Sasseville</i>	
5.1.	Introduction	85
5.2.	Work that led to the 2014 changes	85
5.2.1.	The Tax Court decision in <i>Cheek v. The Queen</i>	85
5.3.	The 2014 Report	90
5.3.1.	Responses to the comments that were not related to the proposals	90
5.3.2.	Changes made to article 17 and its Commentary	94
5.3.2.1.	Changes to the article	95
5.3.2.2.	Changes to the Commentary	96
5.3.2.2.1.	What is an entertainer or sports person and what are personal activities performed as such?	96
5.3.2.2.2.	Clarifications regarding specific payments	98
5.3.2.2.3.	Other changes	99
5.4.	The diverging views	100

Part Three
Selected Issues in Tax Treaty Law

Chapter 6:	Tax Treaty Issues Related to Qualification, Allocation and Apportionment of Income Derived by Entertainers and Sportspersons	105
	<i>Axel Cordewener</i>	
6.1.	Introduction	105
6.2.	Qualification	106
6.2.1.	Entertainers	106
6.2.2.	Sportspersons	109
6.2.3.	Income derived from personal activities (as entertainer or sportsperson)	111
6.3.	Allocation	114
6.3.1.	Place of the “performance”	114
6.3.2.	Connection (“link”) between an item of income and the “performance”	115
6.3.2.1.	New approach under the 2014 OECD Commentary	115
6.3.2.2.	Situations with a clear “close connection”	117
6.3.2.3.	How to determine the relevant “close connection” for casual earnings?	118
6.4.	Apportionment	122
6.4.1.	“Vertical” apportionment between different DTC provisions: Is there a system?	123
6.4.2.	“Horizontal” (cross-border) apportionment between different states under article 17(1) OECD Model	125
6.4.2.1.	The “games played” method	126
6.4.2.2.	The “duty days” method	127
6.4.2.3.	Guidelines under the 2014 OECD Commentary on Article 17	128
6.4.2.4.	Some final remarks on (cross-border) apportionment	131
6.5.	Summary and conclusions	134
Chapter 7:	Image Rights, Sponsoring and Advertising Income	137
	<i>Mario Tenore</i>	
7.1.	Introduction	137
7.2.	The transition to the new Commentary	139

7.3.	Analysis of the OECD Commentary	141
7.3.1.	Changes to paragraph 9 of the 2014 OECD Commentary on Article 17 OECD Model	142
7.3.2.	New paragraph 9.5 on the treaty qualification of income from image rights	149
7.4.	Final remarks	154
Chapter 8:	The Application of Article 17(2) of the OECD Model Convention	157
	<i>Angel Juarez</i>	
8.1.	Introduction	157
8.2.	Article 17(1) vs article 17(2)	157
8.3.	The conflicting examples	159
8.4.	The cross-border situations	161
8.5.	Overtaxation by conflicts of attribution	163
8.6.	The possible solution	163
Chapter 9:	Elimination of Double Taxation Relief: Credit vs Exemption	165
	<i>Dick Molenaar</i>	
9.1.	Performers are taxed in two states	165
9.2.	Recommended relief of double taxation under article 17	166
9.3.	Method of elimination for article 17 prevails over other articles	167
9.4.	Basket/overall method versus per-country method	168
9.5.	Tax exemption method is easier, but can lead to under-taxation	169
9.6.	Tax credit problems and examples	171
9.6.1.	Tax certificate	171
9.6.2.	Qualification of foreign tax	171
9.6.3.	Final and compulsory payments	172
9.6.4.	The person of the artiste	172
9.6.5.	Triangular situations	174
9.6.6.	Net deals: Transfer of the tax burden to the organizer	174
9.6.7.	Differences in taxable base	175
9.6.8.	Year of tax credit (or exemption)	176
9.6.9.	Creditable domestic tax in the residence state	176
9.6.10.	Complexity of the system of foreign tax credits	176

9.7.	Deductions and tax returns in the performance state	177
9.8.	Excess tax credits	178
9.9.	Deduction of foreign tax as an operating expense	178
9.10.	Conclusions	179
9.11.	Partial solutions from the 2014 Update of the OECD Model	180
Chapter 10:	International Sports Events and Tournaments	183
	<i>Karolina Tetlak</i>	
10.1.	Application of article 17 to income from international sports events and tournaments	183
10.2.	Tax treatment of income derived by sportspersons from selected international sports events and tournaments	185
10.2.1.	The pre-1990 approach	185
10.2.2.	FIFA World Cup	185
10.2.3.	Olympic Games	188
10.2.4.	UEFA tournaments	192
10.3.	Similarities and differences in tax treatment of income from sports events and the approach of FIFA, UEFA and IOC	197
10.4.	Selected consequences of the lack of application of article 17 to international sports events and tournaments	206
Chapter 11:	Football Players – Employees rather than Sportspersons: An Exception to Article 17 OECD Model	211
	<i>Stéphane Rychen</i>	
11.1.	Why, how and what?	211
11.2.	Employees vs sportspersons	212
11.3.	Specificities of football (and similar team sports)	213
11.4.	Football players as employees	215
11.5.	A complexity worth nothing	216
11.6.	Article 15 OECD Model: A no-risk solution that makes sense	224
11.7.	Conclusion	225

Part Four
Country Reports

Chapter 12:	Argentina	229
	<i>Alejandro E. Messineo</i>	
12.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	229
12.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	229
12.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	229
12.1.1.1.1.	Income tax	229
12.1.1.1.1.1.	Advance withholdings	232
12.1.1.1.1.2.	Withholdings, information regimes and other tax regulations on football matters	232
12.1.1.1.1.3.	Special rules for entertainers	235
12.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	237
12.1.2.	Application of income tax to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	239
12.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	239
12.1.2.1.1.	Sourcing rules	239
12.1.2.1.2.	Taxing rules for individual sportspersons and entertainers	240
12.1.2.1.3.	Taxing rules for individuals performing for an orchestra or team	243
12.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	244
12.1.2.2.1.	Sourcing rules	244
12.1.2.2.2.	Taxing rules	247
12.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	249
12.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	251
12.2.1.	Treaty policy	251
12.2.2.	Administrative guidelines or case law	252

Chapter 13:	Australia	253
	<i>Michael Dirkis</i>	
13.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	253
13.1.1.	Overview	253
13.1.2.	Taxation of resident sportspersons under domestic law	255
13.1.2.1.	Assessable income	255
13.1.2.2.	Allowable deductions	261
13.1.3.	Taxation of resident entertainers under domestic law	263
13.1.4.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	266
13.1.5.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	266
13.1.5.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	266
13.1.5.1.1.	Overview	266
13.1.5.1.2.	Income from personal service	268
13.1.5.1.3.	Treatment of income deriving from sport or entertaining performances paid to incorporated entities	270
13.1.5.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	270
13.1.5.2.1.	Overview	270
13.1.5.2.2.	Withholding tax in respect of income earned by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	272
13.1.5.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	274
13.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	274
13.2.1.	Treaty policy	274
13.2.1.1.	Similarity to article 17 OECD Model	274
13.2.1.2.	Treaties that contain a <i>de minimis</i> exemption	275
13.2.1.3.	Inclusion of employment remuneration in the scope of article 17 OECD Model	276
13.2.1.4.	Treaties containing special clauses on events supported by public funds, or for cultural exchanges and non-profit organizations	276

13.2.1.5.	Inclusion of article 17(2) and if so whether the application of this provision is subject to special requirements (e.g. if the entertainer or sportsperson has an interest in the entity)	276
13.2.1.6.	A team clause	277
13.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	277
13.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	278
13.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	278
13.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	279
13.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	279
13.2.7.	Income accrued to another person	280
13.3.	Taxation of international sport events	280
Chapter 14:	Austria	283
	<i>Matthias Mayer and Stephanie Zolles</i>	
14.1.	Introduction	283
14.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	284
14.2.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	284
14.2.1.1.	General domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	284
14.2.1.2.	Special domestic rules applicable to sportspersons and entertainers	289
14.2.1.3.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	291
14.2.2.	The application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	292
14.2.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	292
14.2.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	296
14.2.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	298
14.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	302

14.3.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	302
14.3.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	307
14.3.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	309
14.3.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	311
14.3.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	311
14.3.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	313
14.3.7.	Income accrued to another person	315
14.4.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	317
14.5.	Taxation of international sport events	323
14.6.	Summary	325
Chapter 15:	Belgium	327
	<i>Anne Mieke Vandekerkhove and Ellen Vandingenen</i>	
15.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	327
15.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	327
15.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	327
15.1.1.1.1.	Qualification and allocation of the income	327
15.1.1.1.1.1.	Sportspersons and entertainers	327
15.1.1.1.1.2.	Allocation rules	328
15.1.1.1.2.	Taxation of the income	329
15.1.1.1.2.1.	Progressive tax rates	329
15.1.1.1.2.2.	Special tax regime for sportspersons	330
15.1.1.1.2.3.	Special tax regime for artists	331
15.1.1.1.2.4.	Special tax regime for teams and orchestras	333
15.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	334
15.1.2.	The application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	335
15.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	335
15.1.2.1.1.	Qualification and allocation of the income	335
15.1.2.1.1.1.	Sportspersons and entertainers	335

15.1.2.1.1.2.	Allocation rules	335
15.1.2.1.2.	Taxation of the income	336
15.1.2.1.2.1.	Sportspersons and entertainers	336
15.1.2.1.2.2.	Teams and orchestras	338
15.1.2.1.2.3.	Procedures to obtain an exemption	339
15.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with their performance	340
15.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or structures	340
15.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	341
15.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	341
15.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	342
15.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	343
15.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	346
15.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	347
15.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	348
15.2.7.	Income accrued to another person	351
15.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	353
15.3.1.	Professional withholding tax for payments made to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	353
15.3.2.	Exemption of the professional withholding tax	353
15.4.	Special regime for international sport events	354
15.4.1.	European Championship in football UEFA EURO 2000 in Belgium (and the Netherlands)	354
15.4.2.	Antwerp Diamond Games	358
Chapter 16:	Canada	361
	<i>Chris Anderson and Lance Fraser</i>	
16.1.	Introduction	361
16.2.	Taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	361
16.2.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	361

16.2.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	361
16.2.1.1.1.	Employment income vs business income	362
16.2.1.1.2.	Income deferral plans	365
16.2.1.1.3.	Providing services through a corporation	368
16.2.1.1.4.	Provincial taxation	369
16.2.1.1.5.	Teams and orchestras	370
16.2.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	370
16.2.1.2.1.	Business and non-business income tax	371
16.2.1.2.2.	Allocation and territorial source	371
16.2.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance rules	372
16.2.2.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	373
16.2.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	373
16.2.2.1.1.	Canadian-source income	373
16.2.2.1.2.	Taxing rules	375
16.2.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	377
16.2.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	379
16.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	379
16.3.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	379
16.3.1.1.	General treaty policy	379
16.3.1.2.	The Canada-US Treaty	381
16.3.1.3.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	384
16.3.1.4.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	386
16.3.1.5.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	387
16.3.1.6.	Definition of “closely connected” income	389
16.3.1.7.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	389
16.3.1.8.	Income accrued to another person	390
16.4.	Taxation of international sport events	391

Chapter 17:	France	393
	<i>Ivana Zivanovic</i>	
17.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under French domestic law	393
17.1.1.	Overview of the taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	393
17.1.1.1.	Domestic law applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	393
17.1.1.1.1.	General taxation regime under French domestic law	393
17.1.1.1.2.	Special provisions applicable to orchestras and sports teams	396
17.1.1.1.3.	Special regime benefitting entertainers and sportspersons resident in France	399
17.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	401
17.1.2.	Application of income tax to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	402
17.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to the income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	402
17.1.2.1.1.	Determination of the tax base	402
17.1.2.1.2.	Taxation procedures	403
17.1.2.2.	Domestic law applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with performance	406
17.1.2.2.1.	Image rights	407
17.1.2.2.2.	Sponsorship	408
17.1.2.2.3.	Recordings	408
17.1.2.2.4.	Merchandising income	409
17.1.2.2.5.	Income received by intermediaries	409
17.1.2.2.6.	Inducement income and signing bonuses	410
17.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	410
17.1.2.3.1.	Article 155(A) of the FTC: Anti-avoidance for “rent-a-star companies”	410
17.1.2.3.2.	General procedure for preventing abuse of the law (French Tax Procedure Handbook, article L 64)	413
17.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	416
17.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17 and/or options for a more restricted scope	416

17.2.2.	Relationship between the treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	419
17.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	420
17.2.4.	Definition of “closely connected” income	421
17.2.5.	Income accruing to another person	422
17.2.5.1.	Where a legal entity (non-French resident) acts as an intermediary between the organizer of the event and the entertainers or sportspersons	422
17.2.5.2.	Case of entertainers or sportspersons organizing events on their own account	423
17.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	425
17.3.1.	The withholding of tax on French income by non-resident sportspersons (FTC, article 182(B))	425
17.3.2.	Anti-avoidance provisions (FTC, article 155(A))	431
17.4.	Taxation of international sports events	432
17.4.1.	Background	432
17.4.2.	Overview of the favourable regime	433
17.4.3.	Application conditions	434
17.4.4.	First applications of this favourable tax regime	435
Chapter 18:	Germany	437
	<i>Carsten Schlotter</i>	
18.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	437
18.1.1.	Overview of taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	437
18.1.1.1.	Rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	437
18.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	440
18.1.2.	Rules applicable to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	441
18.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	441
18.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	444
18.1.2.3.	Tax collection issues and liability of the remuneration debtor	447

18.1.2.4.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	452
18.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	454
18.2.1.	Treaty policy	454
18.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable to income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	455
18.2.3.	Definitions of sportspersons and entertainers	457
18.2.4.	Definition of closely connected income	459
18.2.5.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	460
18.2.6.	Income accrued to another person	461
18.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	463
18.4.	Taxation of international sporting events	467
Chapter 19:	Italy	469
	<i>Mario Tenore</i>	
19.1.	Summary	469
19.2.	Overview on taxation of entertainers under domestic law	469
19.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident artists and sportspersons	469
19.2.2.	Tax liability for resident individual artists and sportspersons	470
19.2.3.	The requirement of “residence”	470
19.2.4.	Nature of the income received by professional sportspersons	474
19.2.5.	Qualification for domestic tax purposes of income derived by entertainers	475
19.2.6.	Entertainers performing in the framework of an employment relationship	475
19.2.6.1.	Payments made to professional sportspersons’ agents	477
19.2.7.	Entertainers performing as independent professionals	478
19.2.7.1.	Artists	478
19.2.7.2.	Sportspersons	479
19.2.7.3.	Remuneration or prizes paid by the national federation in favour of a professional sportsperson	480

19.2.8.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and artists	480
19.3.	Taxation of non-resident artists and sportspersons performing in Italy	482
19.3.1.	Sourcing rules: Income related to sport or artistic performances carried out in Italy	482
19.3.2.	Deemed sourcing rules: Remuneration paid to a foreign entity related to sport or artistic performances carried out in Italy	482
19.3.3.	Taxing rules: Income from performances carried out in Italy	484
19.3.3.1.	Income derived by individual entertainers	484
19.3.3.1.1.	Employment income	484
19.3.3.1.2.	Income assimilated to employment income	484
19.3.3.1.3.	Self-employment income	485
19.3.3.1.4.	Computation of the income	485
19.3.3.2.	Income derived by teams and orchestras	486
19.3.3.3.	Income derived from touring	486
19.3.3.4.	Special exemption regimes	487
19.3.4.	Domestic rules applicable to income by non-resident artists and sportspersons in connection with the performance	487
19.3.4.1.	Income from the use (and sale) of image rights	487
19.3.4.1.1.	Image rights of individual entertainers	487
19.3.4.1.1.1.	Income from the of exploitation image rights by entertainers under an employment relationship	488
19.3.4.1.1.2.	Income from the of exploitation of image rights by entertainers acting as self-employees	488
19.3.4.1.1.3.	Exploitation of image rights by legal entities	489
19.3.4.2.	Sponsorship, advertising and endorsement income	490
19.3.4.3.	Broadcasting income	490
19.3.5.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	490
19.3.5.1.	Controlled foreign company legislation (article 167 ITC)	491
19.3.5.2.	Rules on fictitious interposition of entities (article 37(3) Decree 600/1973)	492
19.3.5.3.	Anti-tax haven rules	493
19.4.	Tax treaty aspects	493
19.4.1.	Introduction	493
19.4.2.	Summary of Italian tax treaties	494

19.4.3.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident artists and sportspersons	499
19.4.4.	Definition of artists and sportspersons	501
19.4.5.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	502
19.4.6.	Definition of “closely connected” income	503
19.4.7.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	503
19.4.8.	Income accrued to another person	503
19.4.9.	Procedural tax rules	503
19.5.	Taxation of artists and sportspersons under EU law	504
Chapter 20:	Netherlands	507
	<i>Dick Molenaar</i>	
20.1.	Taxation under domestic law	507
20.1.1.	Resident sportspersons and entertainers	507
20.1.1.1.	Domestic rules, employment status	507
20.1.1.2.	Income tax for residents	508
20.1.1.3.	Wage withholding tax for residents	509
20.1.1.4.	Special taxation for resident self-employed artists	510
20.1.1.5.	Use of personal limited company	511
20.1.1.6.	Elimination of double taxation for performances abroad for residents	512
20.1.2.	Non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	514
20.1.2.1.	Domestic rules for performance income of non-residents	514
20.1.2.1.1.	Employees	514
20.1.2.1.2.	Self-employed	515
20.1.2.2.	Domestic rules for other income of non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	518
20.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	521
20.2.	Taxation under tax treaties	522
20.2.1.	Tax treaty policy	522
20.2.2.	Tax treaty policy for article 17 in practice	525
20.2.3.	Article 17 for entertainers and sportspersons in existing tax treaties	526
20.2.4.	Relationship between treaty provisions	532
20.2.5.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	533
20.2.6.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	533

20.2.7.	Definition of “closely connected income”	534
20.2.8.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	534
20.2.9.	Income accrued to another person	535
20.3.	Taxation under EU law	535
20.4.	Taxation of international sports events	537
Chapter 21:	Poland	539
	<i>Karolina Tetlak</i>	
21.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	539
21.1.1.	Application of income taxes to resident sportspersons and entertainers	539
21.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of resident sportspersons and entertainers	539
21.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	548
21.1.2.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	549
21.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	549
21.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with performance	556
21.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	559
21.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	561
21.2.1.	Treaty policy: Inclusion of article 17 and options for more restricted scope	561
21.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable to income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	564
21.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	565
21.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	567
21.2.5.	Income accrued to another person	569
21.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	572
21.4.	Taxation of international sports events	573

Chapter 22:	Portugal	579
	<i>Tiago Marreiros Moreira</i>	
22.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	579
22.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons under domestic law	579
22.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	579
22.1.1.1.1.	Individuals	579
22.1.1.1.1.1.	General rules	579
22.1.1.1.1.2.	Non-habitual tax residence regime	580
22.1.1.1.1.3.	Special regimes	581
22.1.1.1.2.	Ensembles	582
22.1.1.1.3.	Legal persons	582
22.1.1.1.3.1.	Corporate entities	583
22.1.1.1.3.2.	Non-corporate entities	583
22.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	584
22.1.1.2.1.	Individuals	584
22.1.1.2.1.1.	Regular residents	584
22.1.1.2.1.2.	NHTR	585
22.1.1.2.2.	Ensemble members	587
22.1.1.2.3.	Legal persons	587
22.1.2.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	588
22.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	588
22.1.2.1.1.	Individuals	588
22.1.2.1.2.	Ensembles	592
22.1.2.1.3.	Legal persons	592
22.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	594
22.1.2.2.1.	Income from the use of image rights	594
22.1.2.2.2.	Sponsorship, advertising and endorsement income	595
22.1.2.2.3.	Broadcasting income	596
22.1.2.2.4.	Merchandising income	598
22.1.2.2.5.	Deemed income (e.g. payments to agents)	599
22.1.2.2.6.	Inducement income and signing bonuses	601
22.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	602

22.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	603
22.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for a more restricted scope	603
22.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	605
22.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	606
22.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	607
22.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	607
22.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	607
22.2.7.	Income accrued to another person	607
22.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	607
22.4.	Taxation of international sport events	609
Chapter 23:	Spain	611
	<i>Angel Juarez</i>	
23.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	611
23.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	611
23.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	611
23.1.1.1.1.	Residence	611
23.1.1.1.2.	The effect of regional legislation	614
23.1.1.1.3.	Worldwide income taxation; Progressivity	615
23.1.1.1.4.	Employed and self-employed individuals	615
23.1.1.1.4.1.	Overview	615
23.1.1.1.4.2.	Employed individuals	616
23.1.1.1.4.3.	Self-employed individuals	621
23.1.1.2.	Domestic rules applicable to teams and orchestras	621
23.1.1.3.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	622
23.1.2.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	625
23.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	625

23.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	628
23.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	632
23.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	636
23.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	636
23.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	639
23.2.3.	Definitions of sportspersons and entertainers	641
23.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	642
23.2.5.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	642
23.2.6.	Income accrued to another person	643
23.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	646
23.4.	Taxation of international sport events	652
Chapter 24:	Switzerland	653
	<i>Ruth Bloch-Riemer</i>	
24.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	653
24.1.1.	Introduction and summary	653
24.1.2.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	654
24.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	654
24.1.2.1.1.	Swiss tax residency and scope of taxation	654
24.1.2.1.2.	Nature and structure of income	656
24.1.2.1.3.	Taxation of income streams	657
24.1.2.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	658
24.1.2.2.1.	General exemptions under domestic law	658
24.1.2.2.2.	Employment outside of Switzerland	659
24.1.2.2.3.	Self-employment outside of Switzerland	660
24.1.3.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	660

24.1.3.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	660
24.1.3.1.1.	Limited tax liability for non-residents	660
24.1.3.1.2.	Exercise of entertainment and sports activities as professional activity in Switzerland	661
24.1.3.1.3.	Taxation at source of compensation for entertainment/sports activities	662
24.1.3.1.4.	Basis of source taxation	663
24.1.3.1.5.	Organizer's joint liability	664
24.1.3.1.6.	Calculation of tax burden	665
24.1.3.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	665
24.1.3.2.1.	Limited tax liability and source taxation on employment and board membership income	665
24.1.3.2.2.	Royalty income from Swiss sources	667
24.1.3.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes and devices	668
24.1.3.3.1.	Compensation payments to third parties	668
24.1.3.3.1.1.	Outline	668
24.1.3.3.1.2.	Organizing third party	668
24.1.3.3.2.	Anti-abuse doctrine	671
24.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	671
24.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	671
24.2.1.1.	General Swiss treaty policy with regard to article 17 OECD Model	671
24.2.1.2.	Special provisions for events sponsored by public funds	673
24.2.1.3.	Treaty provisions relating to payment of compensation to third party	674
24.2.1.4.	Teams and orchestras	675
24.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable to income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	676
24.2.2.1.	General principle	676
24.2.2.2.	Relationship to article 12 OECD Model (royalty income)	676
24.2.2.3.	Relationship to article 15 OECD Model (employment income)	677

24.2.2.4.	Relationship to treaty clauses on self-employment/ business income (former article 14 OECD Model, article 7 OECD Model)	679
24.2.2.5.	Relationship to article 19 OECD Model (public service)	679
24.2.2.6.	Relationship to article 21 OECD Model (further income)	681
24.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	681
24.2.3.1.	Swiss perspective on definition of “entertainers”	681
24.2.3.1.1.	Scope of application and key elements of the definition	681
24.2.3.1.2.	Affirmative cases	682
24.2.3.1.3.	Negative cases	683
24.2.3.1.4.	Mixed cases	684
24.2.3.2.	Swiss perspective on definition of “sportsperson”	684
24.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	686
24.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	686
24.2.5.1.	Victory prizes, ranking prizes and appearance fees	686
24.2.5.2.	Income from use and sale of image rights (intangible property rights)	687
24.2.5.3.	Sponsorship, advertising and endorsement income	688
24.2.5.3.1.	Framework	688
24.2.5.3.2.	Content of “close connection” criterion	688
24.2.5.3.3.	Mechanism of taxation	690
24.2.5.4.	Broadcasting income	690
24.2.5.5.	Inducement income and signing bonuses	691
24.2.5.6.	Further income streams	692
24.2.5.6.1.	Compensation without performance	692
24.2.5.6.2.	Dividend income	692
24.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	693
24.2.7.	Income accrued to another person	693
24.2.7.1.	“Look-through” approach	693
24.2.7.2.	Triangular cases	694
24.3.	Taxation of international sports events	695

Chapter 25:	United Kingdom	697
	<i>Euan Lawson</i>	
25.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	697
25.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	697
25.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	697
25.1.1.1.1.	Self-employed or employed?	697
25.1.1.1.2.	Self-employed sportspersons and entertainers	698
25.1.1.1.3.	Employed sportspersons and entertainers	701
25.1.1.1.4.	Teams and orchestras	702
25.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers performing abroad	702
25.1.2.	The application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	705
25.1.2.1.	Domestic rules applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	705
25.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	712
25.1.2.2.1.	Income from the use (and sale) of image rights	712
25.1.2.2.2.	Sponsorship, advertising and endorsement income	713
25.1.2.2.3.	Merchandising income	714
25.1.2.2.4.	Broadcasting, film and recording income	714
25.1.2.2.5.	Deemed income (e.g. payments to agents)	715
25.1.2.2.6.	Inducement income and signing bonuses	715
25.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	716
25.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	716
25.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	716
25.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	718
25.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	719
25.2.4.	Definition of income “related to the personal activities of the performer”	722
25.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	722
25.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	725

25.2.7.	Income accrued to another person	725
25.3.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under EU law	727
25.4.	Taxation of international sport events	731
Chapter 26:	United States	735
	<i>Monica Oliveira</i>	
26.1.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under domestic law	736
26.1.1.	Overview on taxation of sportspersons and entertainers under domestic law	736
26.1.1.1.	Domestic rules applicable to resident sportspersons and entertainers	736
26.1.1.2.	Elimination of double taxation for resident sportspersons and entertainers	738
26.1.2.	Application of income taxes to non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	739
26.1.2.1.	Domestic rule applicable to income of non-resident sportspersons and entertainers	739
26.1.2.2.	Domestic rules applicable to other income derived by non-resident sportspersons and entertainers in connection with the performance	743
26.1.2.2.1.	Source and taxing rules	743
26.1.2.2.2.	Income from the use (and sale) of image rights	744
26.1.2.2.3.	Sponsorship, advertising and endorsement income	744
26.1.2.2.4.	Broadcasting income	748
26.1.2.2.5.	Merchandise income	748
26.1.2.2.6.	Deemed income (payments made to agents) and beneficial ownership	748
26.1.2.2.7.	Inducement income and signing bonuses	749
26.1.2.2.8.	Income received by a team sportsperson	750
26.1.2.3.	Anti-avoidance and abusive schemes or devices	750
26.2.	Taxation of entertainers and sportspersons under tax treaties	751
26.2.1.	Treaty policy: Deletion of article 17/options for more restricted scope	753
26.2.2.	Relationship between treaty provisions applicable on income earned by non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	754
26.2.3.	Definition of sportspersons and entertainers	755

26.2.4.	Definition of income “derived ... from his personal activities as such”	756
26.2.5.	Definition of “closely connected” income	756
26.2.6.	Allocation of income from performances in different states	757
26.2.7.	Income accrued to another person or the “conduit rule”	758
26.2.8.	Exemption	759
26.3.	Taxation of international sport events	760
Part Five		
The Summing-Up: A Final Remark		
Chapter 27:	Conclusions	765
	<i>Augusto Fantozzi</i>	
27.1.	General introduction	765
27.2.	The first critical aspect: The domestic rules	765
27.3.	The second – and prevailing – critical aspect: The treaty rule of article 17 OECD Model	767
27.3.1.	Problems of applicability due to mismatches in interpretations by the performance state and the residence state of article 17	768
27.3.2.	High administrative expenses	769
27.3.3.	Excessive taxation on non-resident entertainers and sportspersons	770
27.3.4.	Double taxation problems in the case of star companies regulated by article 17(2)	770
27.4.	A final – conclusive – remark	772
Contributors		773

Tax Treaty Issues Related to Qualification, Allocation and Apportionment of Income Derived by Entertainers and Sportspersons

by Axel Cordewener¹

6.1. Introduction

When engaging in cross-border activities, entertainers and sportspersons are generally facing complex legal issues, especially with regard to taxation. In recent years, the international discussion of the relevant tax questions has increased heavily² and, after having published a Discussion Draft in 2010,³ the OECD, within the framework of the 2014 Update,⁴ not only introduced (minor) changes to the text of article 17 of the Model Tax Convention on Income and on Capital (OECD Model) but, in particular, also made (considerable) amendments to the Commentary on the provision.

On the basis of the 2014 version of the OECD Model and the Commentary, the present contribution sketches a number of disputed tax treaty issues in a systematic way, starting with the qualification of income derived by entertainers and sportspersons (section 6.2.) and then looks into issues of allocation (section 6.3.) and apportionment (section 6.4.) of such income. In this respect, the present analysis will concentrate on article 17(1) of the OECD Model.⁵

1. Professor of Tax Law, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven; Of Counsel, Flick Gocke Schaumburg, Bonn.

2. For an overview of the literature on the topic, see A. Cordewener, *Article 17. Entertainers and Sportspersons*, in *Klaus Vogel on Double Taxation Conventions* 4th edn, para. 1, Bibliography, pp. 1298-1305 (E. Reimer & A. Rust eds., Kluwer Law International 2015).

3. OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs, *Discussion Draft on the Application of Article 17 (Artistes and Sportsmen) of the OECD Model Tax Convention* (23 Apr. 2010).

4. OECD Council, *2014 Update to the OECD Model Tax Convention* (15 July 2014). For an in-depth analysis of the amendments to article 17 of the OECD Model and Commentary thereon, see D. Molenaar, *Entertainers and Sportspersons Following the Updated OECD Model (2014)*, 69 Bull. Intl. Taxn. 1, p. 37 et seq. (2015); P. Pistone & E. Schaffer, *Entertainers According to Art 17 OECD Model Convention*, in *The OECD-Model-Convention and its Update 2014* p. 51 et seq. (M. Lang et al. eds., IBFD/Linde 2015).

5. For a discussion of issues specifically related to article 17(2) of the OECD Model, see chapter 8 in this volume.

6.2. Qualification

Pursuant to article 17(1) of the OECD Model (2014), “income derived by a resident of a Contracting State as an entertainer, such as a theatre, motion picture, radio or television artiste, or a musician, or as a sportsperson, from that resident’s personal activities as such exercised in the other Contracting State, may be taxed in that other State.” Hence, under a bi- or multilateral double tax convention (DTC) following this model provision, the latter state (as source country) is entitled to tax a specific type of income only if certain subjective and objective conditions are fulfilled. The term “income” concerns the gross receipts from the activities covered by article 17(1) of the OECD Model, the exact computation of which, just like the deductibility of expenses, is a matter for the domestic law of the contracting states.⁶

Concerning the personal scope of application of article 17(1) of the OECD Model, it follows from the wording of this rule that the relevant taxpayer (in addition to being a resident of a contracting state) must qualify as either an “entertainer” (*see* section 6.2.1.) or a “sportsperson” (*see* section 6.2.2.). Furthermore, the provision contains a double attribution requirement, in the sense that the respective income must be “derived from ... personal activities as such” (subjective element; *see* section 6.2.3.) and from the exercise of these activities “in the other Contracting State” (objective element; *see* section 6.3.).

6.2.1. Entertainers

Although the term “entertainer” must be considered an autonomous tax treaty term independent of national definitions, it nevertheless remains an indefinite legal concept.⁷ Article 17(1) of the OECD Model itself merely contains a number of non-exhaustive examples, namely “a theatre, motion picture, radio or television artiste, or a musician.” However, there was little doubt that the provision puts an emphasis on the entertaining rather than the artistic character of a given activity and this has now also been confirmed by the 2014 Update of the OECD Model, which replaced the previous

6. *See OECD Model Tax Convention on Income and on Capital: Commentary on Article 17* para. 10, 1st and 2nd sentences. Note that all citations to the Commentary on Article 17 are to the current version as it read on 15 July 2014; where the year is not indicated at the end of the citation (as here), this means that the 2014 Update changed neither the contents nor the numbering of the existing text; when the year (2014) is given at the end of the citation, this indicates a change was made by the 2014 Update.

7. For further references, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 31.

reference to “artistes” in the heading of article 17 and likewise throughout the OECD Commentary on Article 17 by the term “entertainer”.⁸ Moreover, as could already be derived from the original 1963 version of article 17 of the OECD Model (public performer) and is still reflected in the equally authentic current French version of article 17(1) OECD Model (*artiste du spectacle*), the rule focuses on performing entertainers, i.e. those addressing an audience either directly or indirectly (through the media).⁹

Against this background, certain activities are excluded from the scope of article 17(1) of the OECD Model. First of all, this concerns persons whose activities are limited to the production of “works” (e.g. painters, sculptors, writers, composers, etc.). In addition, mere administrative or support staff (e.g. producers, film directors, cameramen, choreographers, road crews, sound or light engineers, stylists, etc.) are likewise excluded¹⁰ and the same goes for so-called impresarios responsible for “arranging the appearance.”¹¹ Generally, it can be said that the demarcation line runs between “those in front of a camera or microphone and those behind the scenes.”¹²

In some cases, however, the personal qualification as “entertainer” may cause difficulties.¹³ A first problem in this respect is posed by “speakers” appearing at certain events. While the OECD Commentary on Article 17 generally acknowledges that activities involving “a political, social, religious or charitable nature” are included in the scope of the provision “if

8. It might be useful to also adjust paragraph 18 of the Commentary on Article 12 (see section 6.4.2.) to this new terminology in the near future.

9. It should be noted that the OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs, in its recent report *Issues Related to Article 17 of the Model Tax Convention* (26 June 2014), pointed out that the wording of article 17 does not contain the words “performance” or “public performance” (para. 29) and even hinted at the possibility that a “public performance” may not be necessary for article 17 to apply (para. 31). However, this view is in stark contrast to the strong emphasis the 2014 Update put on the fact that the income covered by article 17 must be “performance-related” (see section 6.3.). Moreover, a “performance” is generally (and has historically been) understood to consist of the presentation of a certain activity to an audience (e.g. see <http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/performance>; last visited 8 Feb. 2016).

10. Para. 3, 6th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*.

11. Para. 7 *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*.

12. In this sense, see D. Sandler, *Artistes and Sportsmen (Article 17 OECD Model Convention)*, in *Source versus Residence – Problems Arising from the Allocation of Taxing Rights in Tax Treaty Law and Possible Alternatives* p. 237 (245) (M. Lang et al. eds., Kluwer Law International 2008).

13. See generally para. 3, 7th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*, referring to a “grey area”. More specifically, on the discussion of the two examples mentioned hereinafter (“public speakers” and “models”), see also OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs, *supra* n. 9, at para. 26 et seq.

an entertainment character is present”,¹⁴ the 2014 Update has added the statement that a “visiting conference speaker (e.g., a former politician who receives a fee for a speaking engagement)” is not covered by article 17(1).¹⁵ The Commentary appears to be contradictory here and certain non-OECD member countries (Brazil, Malaysia and China) have already expressed the view that the latter type of situations should also be covered if there is an entertainment character present in the speeches,¹⁶ although it is not clear yet where exactly the line between activities with an entertaining character and those without should be drawn here.

A quite similar problem concerns the treatment of “models”. In this respect the 2014 Update has introduced the statement into the OECD Commentary that article 17(1) does not extend to “a model performing as such (e.g. a model presenting clothes during a fashion show or photo session).”¹⁷ However, national administrative and court practice of various OECD member countries tends to include at least fashion shows in the scope of article 17(1),¹⁸ and while a number of non-OECD countries (Argentina, Brazil, Malaysia and India) agree,¹⁹ OECD member Turkey even takes the view that photo sessions should also be included.²⁰ And there may even be further events that need to be taken into consideration in this context. For example, in a recent judgment concerning the participation by Paris Hilton in the presentation of a product (drink) on a stage during an open-air party, the Austrian Supreme Administrative Court concluded that Ms Hilton (who had argued that the event had served a commercial rather than an entertaining purpose) had been the main attraction of the event which, as such, altogether had entertaining effects.²¹

14. Para. 3, 5th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*.

15. Id., 6th sentence (2014).

16. See *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), Non-OECD Economies’ Positions on the Commentary, para. 3.

17. Para. 3, 6th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

18. For an overview of the literature on the topic, see Cordewener, *supra* n. 2.

19. *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), Non-OECD Economies’ Positions on the Commentary, paras. 4 and 7.

20. *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), Observations on the Commentary, para. 15.

21. AT: *Verwaltungsgerichtshof*, 30 June 2015, 2013/15/0266, confirming AT: *Verwaltungsgerichtshof*, 24 June 2009, 2009/15/0090 (both accessible via www.ris.bka.gv.at, last visited 8 Feb. 2016). See also B. Renner, *Werbeauftritt als künstlerische Tätigkeit nach dem DBA Österreich-USA*, 25 *Steuer & Wirtschaft International* (SWI), p. 474 et seq. (2015).

6.2.2. Sportspersons

During the 2014 Update the OECD followed the example of the UN Model (2001) and, without changing the personal scope of article 17 of the OECD Model, replaced the term “sportsman” by the gender-neutral expression “sportsperson” in both paragraphs of the provision. Once again we are dealing with an autonomous tax treaty term which nevertheless forms an indefinite legal concept and, just as in the case of entertainers (*see* section 6.2.1.), the focus is on performances before an audience.²² However, article 17(1) of the OECD Model is not limited to “traditional athletic events (e.g. runners, jumpers, swimmers)” but also includes other physical activities such as, for example, those of “golfers, jockeys, footballers, cricketers and tennis players, as well as racing drivers”²³ and many more.²⁴ Moreover, the provision not only covers activities exercised within the framework of competitions, but also mere demonstrations or shows (revues, etc.), and besides the activities of professional sportspersons it also extends to the activities of amateurs.²⁵

Concerning the qualification of certain activities, the OECD Commentary is not entirely clear, as it first deals separately with “entertainers” and “sportspersons” and then goes on to state that article 17(1) also applies to “activities which are usually regarded as of an entertainment character, such as ... billiards and snooker, chess and bridge tournaments.”²⁶ The lack of further specification in this respect is probably due to the fact that it is often debated whether such activities, and in particular board or card games, should be qualified as forms of “sport”. This debate not only concerns the qualification of a given activity for tax purposes,²⁷ but also its qualification in a more general sense.²⁸ From a tax treaty point of view, and in particular from the perspective of the aim of article 17(1) of the OECD Model to

22. For details, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at paras. 45, 47 and 48.

23. Para. 5 *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*.

24. For further examples, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 47.

25. *See* the explicit example of “an amateur who wins a monetary sports prize” now mentioned in para. 9.1, 2nd sentence, 1st indent, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

26. Para. 6 *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17*.

27. Concerning the qualification of chess players for tax purposes, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 48 with further references.

28. E.g. regarding the refusal to accept bridge as a “sport” (due to a lack of physical activity), *see* UK: High Court of Justice (Queen’s Bench Division, Administrative Court), 23 Apr. 2015, CO/524/2015, *English Bridge Union v. Sport England* [2015] EWHC 1347 (Admin) and UK: High Court of Justice (Queen’s Bench Division, Administrative Court), 15 Oct. 2015, CO/524/2015, *English Bridge Union v. The English Sports Council et al.* [2015] EWHC 2875 (Admin).

facilitate the taxation of highly mobile individuals,²⁹ there are no major objections against an inclusion of “mind sports” into the scope of the provision. In any case, the hint in the OECD Commentary that an “entertainment character” is required indicates that there is a large degree of overlap between the activities of “entertainers” and those of “sportspersons”, so that ultimately the latter may even be considered as a special subcategory of a more encompassing concept of entertainment activities.

Nevertheless, certain activities will have to remain outside the scope of article 17(1) of the OECD Model. Once again, administrative and support staff (*see* section 6.2.1.) are therefore excluded from the provision, which in the area of sports, concerns, in particular, referees, golf caddies, race organizers and horse (or car) owners.³⁰ The same applies to trainers/coaches (including national team managers)³¹ and it appears dubious whether they could nevertheless be caught by article 17(1) of the OECD Model as “entertainers” in the above sense (*see* section 6.2.1.).³²

29. Cf. Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 3.

30. For further examples, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 47.

31. E.g. *see* BE: *Hof van Beroep Antwerpen*, 24 Nov. 1992, Fiscale Jurisprudentie/Jurisprudence Fiscale (F.J.F.) 1993/153; Belgian Federal Ministry of Finance, 1 Feb. 2002, Ci.R.9.Div./546/156 (AOIF 3/2002), www.fisconetplus.be (last visited 8 Feb. 2016), para. 4. *See also* (based on the strict view that “sportspersons” are required to participate in competitions) Austrian Federal Ministry of Finance, 19 Feb. 1994, EAS 391; *id.*, 15 Dec. 1997, EAS 1190; *id.*, 4 May 1998, EAS 1262; *id.*, 19 July 2004, EAS 2496; *id.*, 13 Oct. 2015, EAS 3367 (all accessible via <https://findok.bmf.gv.at>, last visited 8 Feb. 2016). For a recent discussion, *see also* M. Mayer & P. Orlet, *SWI-Jahrestagung: Deutsche Fußballtrainer in österreichischer Fußballschule*, 26 SWI, p. 17 et seq. (2016).

32. As reported by J. Roelveland & K. Tetlak, *Article 17: Entertainers and Sportspersons - Global Tax Treaty Commentaries* sec. 5.1.2.2.4., n. 181, in IBFD Global Tax Treaty Commentaries, the Brazilian *Superior Tribunal de Justiça* (27 May 2008, 882.785/RS (2006/0190616-8) concerning the brief engagement of former Brazilian soccer player Paulo Roberto Falcão as coach of the Japanese national team 1994) ruled that a coach was also covered by article 15 of the DTC Brazil-Japan 1967. However, the court did not qualify Mr Falcão as a “sportsperson” (to be more precise, the English version of this rather old DTC still uses the term “athlete” and the Portuguese version refers to “*atletas*”) but, on the basis of the Portuguese version, ranked him among the “*participantes em diversões públicas*” (which could be translated as “participants in public entertainments” and appears to be slightly broader than the term “public entertainer” used in the English version). In this respect, *see also* the distinction under Austrian domestic law between the categories of “*Sportler*” and “*Mitwirkender an einer Unterhaltungsdarbietung*”: Austrian Federal Ministry of Finance, 4 Feb. 1999, EAS 1412; *id.*, 7 Feb. 2000, EAS 1598 (both accessible via <https://findok.bmf.gv.at>, last visited 8 Feb. 2016). However, there is a “grey area” here, as a comparison with the example of the conductor of an orchestra mentioned in the OECD Commentary on Article 12, para. 18, 1st sentence, also shows. As suggested by the OECD Commentary on Article 17, para. 3, 5th sentence, it may therefore be “necessary to review the overall balance of the activities of the person concerned”.

6.2.3. Income derived from personal activities (as entertainer or sportsperson)

The fact alone that a certain person qualifies as either “entertainer” or “sportsperson” in the above sense does not mean that each and every (item of) income earned by that person would automatically be caught by article 17(1) of the OECD Model. The provision is not equipped with a general “force of attraction” merely based on the abstract status of the taxpayer concerned. Rather, the wording of article 17(1) contains a special filter, namely that the relevant income must be “derived” by that taxpayer “from” the exercise of his “personal activities as such”, i.e. as entertainer/sportsperson.

This criterion actually comprises two elements. First of all, it requires that a certain (item of) income must be *subjectively* attributable to the taxpayer concerned, i.e. the “entertainer” or “sportsperson” in the sense of article 17(1). This issue of personal income attribution is a matter for the domestic law of each contracting state and it may be resolved on the basis of general income attribution principles or through the application of “look-through” rules. The exact possibilities existing under domestic law in this respect are particularly relevant in situations of payments made to third parties, where usually the question arises of whether the entertainer/sportsperson himself can be taxed under article 17(1) or whether article 17(2) of the OECD Model will have to be relied on in relation to the third party.³³

In addition, the above criterion requires that the taxpayer concerned must have obtained the relevant (item of) income from the concrete exercise of activities as either “entertainer” or “sportsperson”, i.e. from performances in that capacity. Basically, this requirement leads to the core of article 17(1) of the OECD Model, i.e. the determination of the performance-related income (*see* section 6.3.). However, there are situations where it is already debatable whether an entertainer or sportsperson, when exercising a certain activity, is acting “as such”.

A first example to be mentioned in this respect is remuneration received for participating in a talk or quiz show. While there is general agreement that the host presenting the show is to be considered an “entertainer” (and will be acting “as such”), there is some doubt as to whether his guests (even when they are professional actors or singers, etc. and therefore generally also qualify as “entertainers”) are likewise acting “as such”, particularly if they merely answer questions or contribute to a discussion and there is no link

33. For further details, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 57 et seq.

to any of their usual performances.³⁴ The problem is even more obvious where the guest concerned is a “sportsperson” (e.g. a professional soccer player or skier), as it is clear that he will not be acting “as such” during the show. It is frequently argued that “sportspersons” should be regarded as “entertainers” in such cases,³⁵ but that would lead back to the previous question, namely whether an “entertainer” is acting “as such” in this particular type of situation.

The OECD Commentary does not expressly address the issue and the only statement that seems to contain a little hint (since the 2014 Update) is that “[m]erely reporting or commenting on an entertainment or sports event in which the reporter does not himself participate is not an activity of an entertainer or sportsperson acting as such.”³⁶ Ultimately, it may therefore boil down to a case-by-case analysis of the type of show and the individual contribution of the participant – the closer the activity gets to a mere objective presentation of facts and opinions, the less likely it will be that article 17(1) of the OECD Model can be applied.

Another example that can be added here are preparatory activities, which have now been explicitly addressed in the OECD Commentary during the 2014 Update. In this respect, the Commentary on Article 17 of the OECD Model starts with the general remark that “[p]reparation, such as rehearsal and training, is part of the normal activities of entertainers and sportspersons”, and then states that, “[i]f an entertainer or sportsperson is remunerated for time spent on rehearsal, training or similar preparation in a State ..., the relevant remuneration, as well as remuneration for time spent travelling in that State for the purposes of performances, rehearsal and training (or similar preparation), would be covered by the Article.”³⁷ One could basically subscribe to this statement if it could be assumed that the remuneration mentioned (for time spent on preparation and travelling) must ultimately be related to a common goal, namely “*the purposes of performances*”

34. For references, *see id.*, at para. 39.

35. For references, *see id.*, at para. 51.

36. *See* para. 9.1, 2nd sentence, 3rd indent, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), with the example of a fee paid to “a former or injured sportsperson ... for offering comments during the broadcast of a sports event in which that person does not participate.”

37. *See* para. 9.1, 2nd sentence, 3rd indent, 1st and 2nd sentences, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), stating that also remuneration for preparatory activities “would be fairly common for employed entertainers and sportspersons but could also happen for a self-employed individual, such as an opera singer whose contract would require participation in a certain number of rehearsals.”

(emphasis added), and if such performances actually take place in the state where the relevant time (for preparation/travelling) is spent.

However, as the final part of the statement in the Commentary makes clear, the OECD does not base its view on this assumption. On the contrary, it claims that article 17(1) of the OECD Model shall apply in such situations “regardless of whether or not such rehearsal, training or similar preparation is related to specific performances taking place in that State”, so that, for example, “remuneration ... paid with respect to the participation in a pre-season training camp would be covered.”³⁸ Furthermore, the OECD made a deliberate choice in this respect, in the sense that all payments for preparatory activities of entertainers and sportspersons shall be covered by article 17(1) and “*not only the part of such remuneration that relates to actual performances*” (emphasis added).³⁹

Nevertheless, the traditional view has always been that both the activities of “entertainers” (*see* section 6.2.1.) and “sportspersons” (*see* section 6.2.2.) require public appearances (directly or at least indirectly) before an audience and this performance-based interpretation also corresponds with the requirement that article 17(1) of the OECD Model only covers “income derived” by the entertainer/sportsperson “from” the exercise of his “personal activities as such.”⁴⁰ Taken seriously, the approach chosen by the OECD Commentary would therefore mean that the state where the training camp takes place would have a taxing right irrespective of any “actual” performance of the sportsperson concerned within the territory of that state – and it could even mean that this state would have a taxing right without any “actual” performance of that sportsperson at all (imagine the promising newcomer who has just signed up to join a soccer or hockey team, participates in the training camp abroad and, due to unfortunate circumstances, gets so badly injured that he will never be able to play again). It must be doubted whether the scope of article 17(1) of the OECD Model can really be stretched to that extent.⁴¹

38. *See* para. 9.1, 2nd sentence, 3rd indent, 3rd sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

39. *See* OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs, *Issues Related to Article 17 of the Model Tax Convention* (26 June 2014), para. 33.

40. Moreover, the expression “public performance(s)” is also explicitly used in para. 9, 10th sentence, and para. 9.2, 2nd sentence, 2nd indent, 2nd sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

41. In the same vein, *see* Pistone & Schaffer, *supra* n. 4, at p. 64 et seq. *See also* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at paras. 50 and 91 et seq. The approach taken by the 2014 Update is fully supported, however, by the Belgian Federal Ministry of Finance, 2 Dec. 2015,

6.3. Allocation

Article 17(1) of the OECD Model 2014 is a rule that aims at preserving the source country entitlement to tax a certain type of income.⁴² With a view to achieving this aim, the rule stipulates that “*income derived* by a resident of a Contracting State as an entertainer,... or as a sportsperson, *from* that resident’s *personal activities as such exercised in the other Contracting State*, may be taxed in that other State” (emphasis added). Therefore, in addition to the subjective requirement that the relevant income must be “derived” by the taxpayer “from” the exercise of his “personal activities” as “entertainer” or “sportsperson” (*see* section 6.2.), there is the objective requirement that the income-generating activity must be “exercised in the other Contracting State”.

The latter requirement, which boils down to a quest for the relevant criteria to determine, for the purposes of source country entitlement, the degree of proximity between a certain (item of) income and the exercise of the personal activity of an entertainer/sportsperson in the source state that suffices to accept that state’s right to tax this particular (item of) income, has become the core issue of article 17(1) of the OECD Model. Given the fact that the underlying idea of the provision is to cover public performances of entertainers/sportspersons (*see* section 6.2.), it is obvious that an exact understanding of the concept of “performance-related” income is crucial for the extent of the source state’s taxing right. In this respect, a two-step analysis is necessary: first, the place of a given performance must be determined, and then the items of income that can be attributed to that performance have to be identified.

6.3.1. Place of the “performance”

As regards the place where a certain performance of an entertainer/sportsperson takes place, article 17(1) of the OECD Model itself does not contain any indication. However, during the 2014 Update a hint has been introduced into the OECD Commentary on the provision,⁴³ and that is a reference to paragraph 1 of the Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model: there, it is stated as a general rule that income from employment is

AAFisc 40/2015 (701.057), accessible via www.fisconetplus.be (last visited 8 Feb. 2016), para. 13.

42. *See* Cordewener, *id.*, at para. 2 et seq.

43. *See* para. 9.2, 2nd sentence, 2nd indent, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

“taxable in the State where the employment is actually exercised” and, more specifically; it is pointed out that “[e]mployment is exercised in the place where the employee is physically present when performing the activities for which the employment remuneration is paid.”⁴⁴ With respect to entertainers/sportspersons, this can indeed be regarded as a useful guideline for the application of article 17(1) of the OECD Model to both employed and self-employed persons.

The question may be raised, though, how article 17(1) should then be applied to situations where entertainers/sportspersons merely indirectly reach their audience (*see* section 6.2.1.). This is particularly the case for entertainers appearing on a “virtual stage” (e.g. TV/movie actors, studio musicians). Although it is not fully clear from the reference in the OECD Commentary on Article 17 to the Commentary on Article 15, as the former only quotes a limited part of the latter, the principles applying to employment income could also provide for a solution in this respect: this is because paragraph 1 of the Commentary on Article 15, in its final sentence, explains that under article 15 of the OECD Model, as a consequence of the aforementioned decisiveness of the taxpayer’s physical presence, “a resident of a Contracting State who derived remuneration, in respect of an employment, from sources in the other State could not be taxed in that other State in respect of that remuneration *merely because the results of this work were exploited in that other State*”⁴⁵ (emphasis added). Some national tax authorities in fact already apply article 17(1) along the lines of this extended analogy to article 15 in practice, focusing on the place of actual production (i.e. where the scenes of a movie were shot or where a song was recorded) and not where the product is made public later through the media.⁴⁶ This makes the subsequent step of linking certain items of income with the specific place of an individual performance much easier and predictable.

6.3.2. Connection (“link”) between an item of income and the “performance”

6.3.2.1. New approach under the 2014 OECD Commentary

The 1992 OECD Commentary on Article 17 had made a first attempt to define the relationship between a performance and an item of income that

44. Para. 1, 1st and 3rd sentences, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 15*.

45. *Id.*, 4th sentence.

46. *See* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 77 et seq.

is necessary to attribute the latter to the former. Unfortunately, however, the explanations given in the old paragraph 9 had been unclear, not to say contradictory: as a general rule, they had been pointed out that “other Articles would apply whenever there was *no direct link* between the income and a public exhibition by the performer in the country concerned”, but then they had added that article 17(1) of the OECD Model would apply to “advertising or sponsorship income, etc. which is related *directly or indirectly* to performances or appearances in a given State”⁴⁷ (emphasis added). The overall picture had been blurred even more by the introductory statement in paragraph 8 of the Commentary that article 17(1) “applies to income derived *directly and indirectly* by an individual artiste or sportsman”⁴⁸ (emphasis added).

The initial sentence of paragraph 8 has only slightly been rephrased during the 2014 Update and now states that article 17(1) “applies to income derived directly or indirectly from a performance by an individual entertainer sportsperson.”⁴⁹ Although the key words “directly or indirectly” have remained unchanged, an analysis of the further explanations provided by paragraph 8⁵⁰ shows that this part of the Commentary does not concern the specific issue of how to *objectively* attribute a certain item of income to a particular performance, but deals with two different questions: first, it addresses payments that are not made directly to the entertainer/sportsperson himself (which leads to the issue of *subjective* income attribution and the application of either article 17(1) or article 17(2) of the OECD Model to a certain item of income;⁵¹ see section 6.3.), and then it turns to the question of whether a certain proportion of an overall remuneration (salary, etc.) paid for several performances can be taxed by the source state regarding those performances that have taken place within its territory (which leads to the issue of cross-border apportionment; see section 6.4.2.). Taking account of this specific systematic context, unnecessary complications can therefore be

47. Para. 9, 2nd and 4th sentences, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (1992).

48. Para. 8, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (1992).

49. See para. 8, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

50. See id., 2nd through 5th sentences.

51. This understanding is also confirmed by paras. 9.4, 1st sentence, and 9.5, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), which refer to “[p]ayments for the simultaneous broadcasting of a performance by an entertainer or sportsperson made directly to the performer *or for his or her benefit (e.g. a payment made to the star-company of the performer)*” and the fact that entertainers/sportspersons frequently “derive, directly or indirectly (e.g. through a payment made to the star-company of the entertainer or sportsperson) a substantial part of their income in the form of payments for the use of, or the right to use, their ‘image rights’” (emphasis added).

avoided if paragraph 8 of the OECD Commentary on Article 17 is simply left aside during the discussion of objective income attribution.

The most confusing part of the 1992 version of the OECD Commentary on Article 17, however, has been paragraph 9⁵² and, in this respect, the new 2014 version has opted for a very pragmatic approach. In a first step it has rephrased the decisive criterion for the objective attribution of (items of) income and in a second step it now provides for quite extensive explanations, combined with individual examples, of how that new criterion is supposed to be applied in practice.

Although still somewhat embedded in considerations addressing royalties and sponsorship or advertising fees, the general rule for the interpretation of article 17(1) of the OECD Model now stipulates that “other Articles would apply whenever there is no *close connection* between the income and the performance of activities in the country concerned”⁵³ (emphasis added). The 2014 OECD Commentary then points out in positive terms that this “close connection”, which is uniformly used throughout the subsequent explanations given by the Commentary, “will generally be found to exist where it cannot be reasonably considered that the income would have been derived in the absence of the performance of these activities.”⁵⁴ There must therefore be a causal relationship between a particular performance and a certain (item of) income and, through a considerable number of positive and negative examples, the Commentary seeks to give a clearer shape to the relevant degree of causality (or causation).

6.3.2.2. Situations with a clear “close connection”

There are a number of situations where the necessary “close connection” is clearly identifiable. The most obvious case is that entertainers/sportspersons receive “fees for their actual performances.”⁵⁵ Other clear-cut cases are “prizes and awards ... in relation to a particular sports event” irrespective of who awards the prize to the sportsperson or bestows the award upon him.⁵⁶ In addition, the Commentary also mentions “a prize paid to the winner of

52. This has also been admitted by the OECD Committee on Fiscal Affairs, *Issues Related to Article 17 of the Model Tax Convention* (26 June 2014), paras. 20 and 51.

53. Para. 9, 2nd sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

54. *Id.*, 3rd sentence (2014).

55. See para. 9, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014), which only slightly adjusted the wording previously used by para. 9, 1st sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (1992) (“fees for their actual appearances”).

56. Para. 8.1 *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

a sports competition taking place in that State; a daily allowance paid with respect to participation in a tournament or training stage taking place in that State; a payment made to a musician for a concert given in a State.”⁵⁷ On the other hand, there are situations where the relevant connection is clearly missing, such as in the case of “[p]ayments received in the event of the cancellation of a performance”,⁵⁸ simply due to the lack of any relevant exercise of a personal activity.

It should be added, however, that some tricky situations have not been addressed by the 2014 version of the OECD Commentary on Article 17. A first issue are inducement payments such as a “signing-on fee” paid to a sportsperson for joining a certain team.⁵⁹ Basically, there should be no doubt that the payment is made for the future exercise of “personal activities” in the sense of article 17(1) of the OECD Model.⁶⁰ Yet, since most contracts run for more than a year (or season), and during every single year (or season) there may be matches in different countries, the exact allocation of the payment to various performances (and the apportionment between them; *see* section 6.4.2.) may be a rather cumbersome exercise.⁶¹ A second and potentially even more complex issue are severance payments (“golden handshakes”): for these, it must first be determined whether and to what extent they are related to the exercise of “personal activities” in the past, before their exact distribution over a certain contractual period and allocation to different performances (possibly again through cross-border apportionment) can be tackled.⁶²

6.3.2.3. How to determine the relevant “close connection” for casual earnings?

Next to payments clearly related to the exercise of their main activity “*as such*” (*see* section 6.2.3.), entertainers/sportspersons often have additional sources of income. Quite frequently, such “casual earnings” find their origin in the fact that the entertainer/sportsperson has achieved a certain degree of

57. Para. 9.2, 2nd sentence, 1st indent, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014).

58. Para. 9, 9th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (2014) (previously para. 9, 6th sentence, *OECD Model: Commentary on Article 17* (1992)).

59. E.g. *see* CA: Tax Court of Canada, 14 Oct. 1999, 96-4680-IT-G, *Nikolai Khabibulin v. Her Majesty the Queen*, Dominion Tax Cases (D.T.C.) 1426 (2000). For further references, *see* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 2 et seq.

60. For details, *see* Cordewener, *id.*, at para. 87 et seq.

61. In this respect, *see* US: United States Tax Court, 26 Mar. 1984, 23315-81, *Ken Linseman v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue*, 82 T.C. 520 (1984).

62. *See* Cordewener, *supra* n. 2, at para. 90.

Contact

IBFD Head Office
Rietlandpark 301
1019 DW Amsterdam
P.O. Box 20237
1000 HE Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Tel.: +31-20-554 0100 (GMT+1)
Email: info@ibfd.org
Web: www.ibfd.org



IBFD, Your Portal to Cross-Border Tax Expertise