

Doctoral Series: Vol. 3
Free Movement of Persons and Income Tax Law
The European Court in Search of Principles

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword

Chapter 1. Introduction

1.1. Objectives and outline of the research

1.2. Main findings and conclusions

A. European law and income tax law and treaties of the Member States: the constitutional context (chapter 2)

i. The division of competencies between the Union and its Member States

ii. Constitutional limits on the exercise of legislative and treaty-making powers

iii. The implementation and enforcement of Community law

B. The scope of application of directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons and income taxation (chapter 3)

i. A sovereignty exception for income taxation?

ii. The substantive scope of Community law

iii. The personal scope of Community law

C. The constitutional principle of free movement and income taxation (chapter 4)

i. Mobility rights and the prohibition of exit and access restrictions

ii. The right of exit and home state income tax restrictions

iii. The right of access and host state income tax restrictions

D. The constitutional principle of equal treatment and income taxation (chapter 5)

i. The meaning of non-discrimination in a multilateral Community

ii. The broad coverage of the prohibition of discrimination

iii. The broad coverage of the prohibition of income tax discrimination

iv. Most favoured nation treatment and income taxation

E. Possible justifications for income tax measures that are, in principle, EC-incompatible (chapter 6)

F. Possible future case law trends

1.3. Options for future action

A. Introductory remarks

B. The option of restraining the judiciary in the area of income taxation

C. The obligation on Member States to take regulatory action and the option of a co-ordinated approach

Chapter 2. General constitutional principles of Community law and income taxation (division of competencies, Community solidarity, enforced rule of law)

2.1. The vertical division of competencies in the Community and the exercise of regulatory (legislative and treaty-making) powers in the area of taxation

2.2. The principle of Community solidarity and the exercise of regulatory powers in the area of income taxation

2.3. The enforced rule of law and income taxation

Chapter 3. The scope of application of directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons and income taxation

3.1. Applicability of the Treaty Articles on free movement of persons to income tax cases

3.2. Is income taxation a reserved area to which Community law does not apply at all or only after harmonisation?

A. A critical analysis of the sovereignty exception

B. The income tax case law of the Court

C. Conclusions

3.3. Do the activities subject to income tax have a genuine economic character?

A. The economic substance test and the free movement of persons

B. The income tax case law of the Court

C. Conclusions

3.4. Do the activities subject to income tax have an intra-Community cross-border character?

A. Intra-Community cross-border movement of persons

B. The income tax case law of the Court

C. Conclusions

3.5. Do the persons subject to income tax fall within the scope of Community law?

A. Community citizens and companies: the preliminary nationality requirement

B. The income tax case law of the Court

C. Conclusions

3.6. Should the Court restrain itself when applying directly applicable Community law in sensitive areas of shared competence because of the principle of subsidiarity?

Chapter 4. The constitutional principle of free movement and income taxation

4.1. Free movement and the prohibition of exit and access restrictions

4.2. The prohibition of exit restrictions imposed by the home state and income taxation

- A. The prohibition of exit restrictions by directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons
- B. To what extent are exit taxes incompatible with Community law?
- C. Conclusions and recommendations

4.3. The prohibition of access restrictions imposed by the host state and income taxation

- A. The prohibition of direct, indirect and nondiscriminatory access restrictions by directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons
- B. To what extent are access taxes incompatible with Community law?
- C. Conclusions and recommendations

Chapter 5. The constitutional principle of equal treatment and income taxation

5.1. Equal treatment and non-discrimination in a multilateral Community

- A. Introductory remarks
- B. Intra-Community national treatment
- C. Intra Community and Member State/third country most favoured nation treatment

5.2. The prohibition of (overt and covert) discrimination by directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons

- A. Different treatment: the wide impact of the prohibition of discrimination
- B. By a single Member State: the distinction between discriminatory and non-discriminatory restrictions to free movement
- C. Of similar situations: relevant comparisons and similarity indicators in Community law on the free movement of persons
- D. On arbitrary grounds: differentiation criteria that are prohibited under Community law
- E. Disadvantage for the cross-border situation or reverse discrimination

5.3. The prohibition of (overt and covert) income tax discrimination by directly applicable Community law on the free movement of persons

- A. Different income tax treatment: substantive and procedural tax rules
- B. Single jurisdiction differentiation or nondiscriminatory restrictions resulting from disparities between national income tax laws or tax treaties
- C. The similarity test in Income tax cases
 - i. Relevant comparisons in Community law
 - ii. Indications on how to make a relevant comparison
 - iii. Relevant factors to determine similarity
 - iv. Conclusions
- D. Prohibited differentiation criteria in income tax situations

E. Disadvantage for the cross-border situation in income tax cases

5.4. Conclusions on the prohibition of (overt and covert) income tax discrimination and recommendations for action by Member States

A. The prohibition of (overt and covert) income tax discrimination

B. Recommendations for action by Member States

5.5. The prohibition of discrimination (most favoured nation treatment) and income taxation

A. Why Community Law on the free movement of persons prescribes (intra- and extra-Community) most favoured nation treatment

i. Intra-Community most favoured nation treatment

ii. Extra-Community most favoured nation treatment

B. Why Community law prescribes (intra- and extra-Community) most favoured nation treatment in the income tax area

i. Intra-Community most favoured nation treatment

ii. Extra-Community most Favoured nation treatment

C. Conclusions and recommendations for action by Member States

i. Conclusions

ii. Recommendations

Chapter 6. Justifications for discriminatory and nondiscriminatory income tax restrictions on the free movement of persons

6.1. Justifications for restrictions on the free movement of persons

A. Introductory remarks

B. Traditional exceptions for public sector activities and in the interest of public policy, security and health

C. Overriding public interest

6.2. Justifications for income tax restrictions on the free movement of persons

A. Introductory remarks

B. Disadvantages are *de minimis*

C. Disadvantages are compensated by advantages

D. Disadvantages can be easily avoided

E. Disadvantages are reversed by a procedural remedy

F. The budgetary implications of the application of Community law and the need to preserve the coherence of the tax system

G. Inter-jurisdictional equity as reflected by tax treaties

H. Residence-based income tax differentiation needed to avoid excessive or insufficient taxation (ability to pay)

I. The need to prevent tax avoidance and tax evasion

J. Administrative constraints and the need to maintain the effectiveness of fiscal controls at a reasonable administrative burden

K. Abuse of Community law

L. The need to prevent migrant persons from enjoying an unjust advantage

6.3. Conclusions

Register of selected references to major income tax decisions in the text of chapters 2 to 6

Equivalences of EC Treaty articles

References

Curriculum vitae